

Copyright Undertaking

This thesis is protected by copyright, with all rights reserved.

By reading and using the thesis, the reader understands and agrees to the following terms:

1. The reader will abide by the rules and legal ordinances governing copyright regarding the use of the thesis.
2. The reader will use the thesis for the purpose of research or private study only and not for distribution or further reproduction or any other purpose.
3. The reader agrees to indemnify and hold the University harmless from and against any loss, damage, cost, liability or expenses arising from copyright infringement or unauthorized usage.

If you have reasons to believe that any materials in this thesis are deemed not suitable to be distributed in this form, or a copyright owner having difficulty with the material being included in our database, please contact lbsys@polyu.edu.hk providing details. The Library will look into your claim and consider taking remedial action upon receipt of the written requests.

**Constructing Bilingual Norms for
Bilingual Program Assessment:
A Study of Bilingual Writing Performance of
Cantonese-speaking Students in Hong Kong (China) and
Anglophone Students in Montréal (Canada)**

by

CAROL SUI-YEE KWOK

A thesis submitted in partial fulfillment
of the requirements for the degree of
Master of Philosophy
Department of Chinese and Bilingual Studies
Hong Kong Polytechnic University

December 1999

Chief Supervisor: Dr. Daniel Wing Cheung So
Co-Supervisor: Dr. Kang Kwong Luke



Pao Yue-Kong Library
PolyU • Hong Kong

CONTENTS

CONTENTS.....	i
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS.....	iii
ABSTRACT.....	iv
LIST OF TABLES.....	vi
LIST OF EXHIBITS.....	vii
I. INTRODUCTION.....	1
A. THE RESEARCH PROBLEM.....	1
B. AIMS OF THE STUDY.....	4
C. PURPOSE AND SIGNIFICANCE.....	4
II. BACKGROUND.....	10
A. HONG KONG.....	10
1. <i>Two Languages in Society</i>	10
2. <i>Two Languages in History</i>	11
3. <i>Two Languages in Education</i>	14
B. MONTRÉAL.....	16
1. <i>Two Languages in Society</i>	16
2. <i>Two Languages in History</i>	18
3. <i>Two Languages in Education</i>	22
C. SUMMARY.....	26
III. METHOD.....	28
A. INTRODUCTION.....	28
B. SAMPLED SCHOOLS.....	28
1. <i>School H in Hong Kong</i>	29
2. <i>School M in Montréal</i>	30
C. SAMPLED SUBJECTS.....	31
D. INSTRUMENTATION.....	32
1. <i>Questionnaires</i>	32
a) Pretests.....	32
b) Subject Profiles.....	33
(1) Personal Particulars.....	36
(2) Language Experience at home.....	36
(3) Language Experience in Extra-curricular activities.....	36
2. <i>Schemas</i> 37.....	37
a) Macro Index Scoring Schema (Appendix 2).....	37
b) Micro Index Scoring Schema (Appendix 3).....	38
E. DATA PROFILE.....	43
F. DATA ANALYSIS.....	44
1. <i>Scoring</i> 44.....	44
2. <i>Macro Index Scoring</i>	45
3. <i>Micro Index Scoring</i>	46

IV. RESULTS.....	47
A. MACRO INDEX	47
1. <i>Macro Bilingual Writing Performance of H3 subjects</i>	47
2. <i>Macro Bilingual Writing Performance of M3 subjects</i>	49
3. <i>A Comparison of Macro Bilingual Writing Performance of H3 and M3 subjects</i>	51
B. MICRO INDEX	52
1. <i>Micro Bilingual Writing Performance of H3 subjects</i>	53
a) L1 (Chinese).....	53
(1) Intra-sentential Dimension	55
(2) Inter-sentential Dimension	56
(3) Textual Dimension	58
(4) Presentational Dimension	64
b) L2 (English)	65
(1) Intra-sentential Dimension	67
(2) Inter-sentential Dimension	70
(3) Textual Dimension	71
(4) Presentational Dimension	75
2. <i>Micro Bilingual Writing Performance of M3 subjects</i>	75
a) L1 (English)	75
(1) Intra-sentential Dimension	78
(2) Inter-sentential Dimension	79
(3) Textual Dimension	80
(4) Presentational Dimension	84
b) L2 (French)	86
(1) Intra-sentential Dimension	88
(2) Inter-sentential Dimension	93
(3) Textual Dimension	94
(4) Presentational Dimension	95
3. <i>Statistical Comparison of Micro Writing Performance of H3 and M3 subjects</i>	97
a) L1 (Chinese) of H3 subjects vs L1 (English) of M3 subjects	97
b) L2 (English) of H3 Subjects vs L2 (French) of M3 Subjects.....	98
C. MACRO AND MICRO INDICES	98
V. CONCLUSION.....	99
A. BILINGUAL WRITING PERFORMANCES	99
B. CONSTRUCTION OF BILINGUAL NORMS	104
C. LIMITATIONS OF THE STUDY	105
VI. CITED REFERENCES.....	i
VII. BIBLIOGRAPHY	ix

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

In this journey, I met a lot of angels, to whom I owe many thanks.

I would like to thank the angels in Hong Kong who have been very helpful amidst their hectic schedule. They are Mr. Kam-cheung Fung, Ms. Annie Chan and Mr. Che-fung Tai. Special thanks go to Miss Ann Suk-han Ng and Ms. Wai-tsin Lo for their inputs and challenges.

I would also like to thank the angels in Montréal who are always helpful whenever possible. They are Mrs. Marie Gatineau of the English School Board of Montréal, Mrs. Anne Peacock, Mrs. Helen Leduc, Mrs. Arlene Green and Mrs. Carol Marriott. Special thanks go to Mrs. Colleen Aziz, and Professor Jacques Rebuffot of McGill University. Many thanks go to Mr. Teren Gum for providing residence and travelling assistance in Montréal.

Deepest thanks is given to my parents and my sister Tammy Kwok, the faithful angel, who trust and love me all the while.

Thanks is also given to Dr. K. K. Luke who always offers timely advice and uplifting notes.

Thanks is also given to Dr. Daniel So for his queries and criticisms, trust and encouragement. I learn from him the freedom as well as the limits of doing a research. He has not restricted himself to provide me with the best possible conditions to make this study a possibility of success.

Praise to God by whom all these angels were sent.

**Constructing Bilingual Norms for
Bilingual Program Assessment:
A Study of Bilingual Writing Performance of
Cantonese-speaking Students in Hong Kong (China) and
Anglophone Students in Montréal (Canada)**

by

CAROL SUI-YEE KWOK

ABSTRACT

Of a thesis submitted in partial fulfillment
of the requirements for the degree of
Master of Philosophy
Department of Chinese and Bilingual Studies
Hong Kong Polytechnic University

December 1999

Chief Supervisor: Dr. Daniel Wing Cheung So
Co-Supervisor: Dr. Kang Kwong Luke

This study provides a linguistically-adequate description of the writing performance in L1 and L2 of students in Hong Kong and Montréal. The differences between the writing performance in L1 and L2 of students in Hong Kong and Montréal are also studied using covariance measures. The major statistical method used is UNIANOVA (SPSS). The intention of the study is to help ascertain the standards of L1 and L2 that are normally achieved at Secondary Three in bilingual programmes in these two cities.

35 Cantonese-speaking students of Secondary Three studying in an Anglo-Chinese secondary school in Hong Kong (H3 students), and 20 Anglophone students of Grade 8 studying in a late French immersion programme offered in an English school in an English-speaking area in Montréal (M3 students) are selected for the study. The subjects have three years of school experience learning in L2.

Two instruments are used to facilitate the study of the subjects' writing performance with a cross-lingual perspective. The first is a Macro Index Schema that takes each piece of the sampled writings as a unit and evaluates their quality in a holistic fashion on a six-point scale. The second is a Micro Index Schema which is used to assess the sampled writing along four dimensions: they are intra-sentential accuracy, inter-sentential cohesiveness, textual coherence and presentational skills.

The results of the Macro and Micro scorings have shown that the bilingual writing performances of the subjects of Hong Kong and Montréal are comparable. H3 and M3 subjects are able to perform the assigned formal tasks both in their respective L1 and L2 to clearly communicate the ideas and to present them in appropriate formats.

It also shows that the L2 written skills of the Hong Kong subjects are comparable to their counterparts in Montréal who learn in similar bilingual programmes and also have few opportunities to use L2 outside schools.

This study is one of the earliest attempts to assess the Chinese and English standards of Hong Kong students without using a monolingual frame of reference. The linguistic outcomes of the Hong Kong bilingual subjects are compared to subjects educated in programmes where bilingualism is practised and given top priority. This understanding of the level of L1 and L2 proficiency that students from schools situated in a largely monolingual (L1) environment and employ L2 as a medium of instruction would normally achieve helps us to formulate practical pedagogy and realistic expectations for language teaching and learning.

LIST OF TABLES

TABLE 3.1.	BASIC CHARACTERISTICS OF SCHOOL H AND SCHOOL M	29
TABLE 3.2.	A SUMMARY OF THE SUBJECT PROFILES OF H3 AND M3 SUBJECTS	35
TABLE 3.3.	MICRO INDEX SCORING SCHEMA AND DEFINITIONS.....	42
TABLE 3.4.	SAMPLED WRITINGS.....	43
TABLE 3.5.	L1 AND L2 SAMPLED WRITINGS OF H3 AND M3 SUBJECTS	44
TABLE 4.1.	MACRO SCORING OF L1 AND L2 WRITINGS OF H3 SUBJECTS (N=35).....	47
TABLE 4.2.	MACRO SCORING OF L1 AND L2 WRITINGS OF M3 SUBJECTS (N=20).....	49
TABLE 4.3.	MACRO SCORING OF L1 WRITINGS OF H3 AND M3 SUBJECTS	51
TABLE 4.4.	MACRO RESULTS OF THE L2 WRITINGS OF H3 AND M3 SUBJECTS	52
TABLE 4.5.	CLASSIFICATION OF INACCURACIES IN THE L1 (CHINESE) WRITINGS OF H3 SUBJECTS	54
TABLE 4.6.	CLASSIFICATION OF INACCURACIES IN THE L2 (ENGLISH) WRITINGS OF H3 SUBJECTS.....	66
TABLE 4.7.	CLASSIFICATION OF INACCURACIES IN THE L1 (ENGLISH) WRITINGS OF M3 SUBJECTS.....	77
TABLE 4.8.	CLASSIFICATION OF INACCURACIES IN THE L2 (FRENCH) WRITINGS OF M3 SUBJECTS.....	87

LIST OF EXHIBITS

EXHIBIT 4.1.	PARAGRAPHS OF L1 ESSAY BY SUBJECT A3	60
EXHIBIT 4.2.	PARAGRAPHS OF L1 ESSAY BY SUBJECT A22	61
EXHIBIT 4.3	PARAGRAPHS OF L1 ESSAY BY SUBJECT A25	62
EXHIBIT 4.4.	PARAGRAPHS OF L1 ESSAY BY SUBJECT A9	63
EXHIBIT 4.5.	PARAGRAPHS OF L1 ESSAY BY SUBJECT A10	63
EXHIBIT 4.6.	PARAGRAPHS OF L2 ESSAY BY SUBJECT B17.....	74
EXHIBIT 4.7.	PARAGRAPHS OF L2 ESSAY BY SUBJECT B20.....	74
EXHIBIT 4.8.	PARAGRAPHS OF L1 ESSAY BY SUBJECT C18.....	80
EXHIBIT 4.9.	PARAGRAPHS OF L1 ESSAY BY SUBJECT C19.....	80
EXHIBIT 4.10.	PARAGRAPHS OF L1 ESSAY BY SUBJECT C4.....	82
EXHIBIT 4.11.	PARAGRAPHS OF L1 ESSAY BY SUBJECT C17.....	82
EXHIBIT 4.12.	PARAGRAPHS OF L1 ESSAY BY SUBJECT C8.....	84

I. INTRODUCTION

A. The Research Problem

In recent years, it has often been said that Hong Kong students' proficiency standards in both Chinese and English are declining and that secondary schools using English as medium of instruction (hereafter referred as EMI schools)--which comprise close to 90 per cent of the secondary sector before the change of sovereignty in 1997--have failed to produce graduates with a firm grasp of both their L1 (Chinese) and their L2 (English).

However there is also a body of opinion which holds that the apparent decline in standards is only a result of the expansion of compulsory education in the 1970s which increased the absolute numbers of both strong and weak performers (Lord 1987). The Report of the Working Group on Language Proficiency (Hong Kong Education Commission 1994) also suggested that the apparent decline in standards could be attributed to the "very high" expectations of the community and "the gap between demand and supply (which) has led to a perception that language standards are falling" (p.15). Some researchers even suggested that the language standards in Hong Kong have in fact never been high. As such, there is not point to discuss any decline (Lloyd 1987, Johnson 1991).

Nonetheless, according to public perception that the language standards of Hong Kong students have been declining, and this alleged decline has been given

prominent coverage especially by the print media¹. Unfortunately the discussion on language standards has been confined to a largely subjective and anecdotal mode because informed discussion of this topic has been hampered by two factors.

The first factor is the dearth of linguistically-adequate descriptive information on the language outcomes in L1 and L2 normally achieved by students from these schools. Public examinations of Chinese and English in Hong Kong are norm-referenced and therefore their results provide little information about the linguistic quality of the students' output in Chinese and English.

Lee, Kennedy and Fullilove (1998) attempted to re-rate the archive of English Composition papers of Hong Kong Certificate of Education Examination (HKCEE) in selected years. They found that no concrete evidence could be drawn if there were changes in the language standards, because the marking was norm-referenced, the sampling of the archive material was not random and the size of the archive sample was small. Earlier attempts to make synchronic and diachronic comparisons of examinations results have also been hampered by the change in the profile of candidatures over the years (cf. Lee 1976, 1988). Changes in examination formats and the norm-referenced nature of examinations also make the diachronic comparison not viable (Choi 1998, p.186).

¹ Here are some of the news headlines: 'English language standards dropping in school' (SCMP February 23, 1987), 'Poor skills "threaten" territory's position' (SCMP November 24, 1989), 'Hong Kong's educational system failing to meet demand' (SCMP November 24, 1989), 'Exam results show English skills in decline' (SCMP May 25, 1995), 'Alarm at language failures: growing number of Subjects flunk English and Chinese exams' (SCMP December 19, 1996), 'Bilingualism "hinders children's reading"' (SCMP May 26, 1999)

The second factor is the absence of an understanding of the level of L1 and L2 proficiency that students from schools situated in a largely monolingual (L1) environment and employ L2 as a medium of instruction would *normally* achieve. The monolingual environment experienced by the students in this study is a product of sociolinguistic conditions which do not facilitate the use of L2 outside the classroom and schools. These conditions have much to do with the social distance between the second language-learning group and the target language group.

To deal with the first factor, this study attempts to provide a linguistically-adequate description of the L1 and L2 performance of Hong Kong students at a particular stage of their education through EMI. We would then have a better idea of what could be achieved by and expected of students in Hong Kong in Chinese and English at this stage.

To deal with the second factor, the L1 and L2 performance of Anglophone students in Late (French) Immersion programmes in Montréal are also included in this study because their language-learning experience is similar to that of Hong Kong students. The case studies of Hong Kong and Montréal are attempts to provide detailed information on the language outcomes normally achieved in contexts where proficiencies in more than one language are essential but the preference to use the second language is low. The information on the language outcomes of these two places would be helpful to initiate the development of baseline data for the assessment of bilingual programmes similar to these two cases in future.

As a pilot study and because of time and resource constraints, only the written abilities of the subjects are studied.

B. Aims of the Study

This study attempts to provide a linguistically-adequate description of the writing performance in L1 and L2 of students in Hong Kong and Montréal. The differences between the writing performance in L1 and L2 of students in Hong Kong and Montréal are also studied using covariance measures. The major statistical method used is UNIANOVA (SPSS). The intention of the study is to help ascertain the standards of L1 and L2 that are normally achieved at Secondary Three in bilingual programmes in these two cities. The subjects in this study have three years of L2 (quasi-) immersion experience. It is hoped that the results of this study will show the importance of constructing norms of L1 and L2 development of students with similar education and language experience so as to enable us to better gauge the bilingual achievements of the students of Hong Kong.

C. Purpose and Significance

This study is significant in three aspects. First, it is one of the earliest attempts to assess the Chinese and English standards of Hong Kong students without using a monolingual frame of reference. The linguistic outcomes of the Hong Kong bilingual subjects are not compared to subjects educated in programmes where

bilingualism is neither practised nor given top priority. Second, it is one of the few studies in Hong Kong that consider the outcomes of both the first and second languages in one study. Third, it is one of the few studies in Canada that the writing outcomes of French immersion students are investigated in such linguistic details.

Researchers in sociolinguistics and bilingualism have suggested that bilingual behaviours should be understood beyond monolingual frameworks (Baetens Beardsmore 1986, Baker 1988, 1995). Baker (1988) stated that bilinguals seldom perform the same tasks in all languages and seldom perform different tasks with the same level of control. Harley et al. (1990) further reiterated that different components of language competence of bilinguals are “differentially manifested under different task conditions” (p.11). In addition, the classroom treatments given to language-skill subjects in primarily monolingual and bilingual programmes are different, which means these two types of programmes have different contexts of language acquisition (Lambert 1990, p.204). Furthermore the decision-making processes of monolinguals and bilinguals are dissimilar in conforming to the sets of linguistic and sociolinguistic requirements in different task conditions.

Research on the language outcomes of the first and second languages of students in Hong Kong have been geared towards the direction of comparing monolinguals with bilinguals. However, in fact, one does not find two monolinguals in a bilingual speaker, in terms of both language learning and language use. T'sou (1997) suggested that those who criticized the language standards of Hong Kong people mostly came from monolingual backgrounds and

had scant experiences in living in a non-Chinese dominant society (p.298). It is therefore problematic to judge the bilinguals' performance based on the norms for assessing language outcomes of monolingual speakers of the language.

Some previous studies in Hong Kong have contributed to a deeper understanding of the students' writing outcomes in Chinese and in English. But in most cases the target language of study was either Chinese (e.g., Siu 1980, 1985, Chan 1990, Lee, Chan and Ng 1992) or English (e.g., Yu 1979) only. Few attempted to study both.

As an analogy, the challenges facing bilinguals who acquire bilingualism through schooling were like those facing decathlons while monolinguals, sprinters. It is seldom that in a 100m race, a decathlon would run as fast as a sprinter do, for the race played on the sprinter's strength, and the training time and energy of the decathlon have been allocated not only to sprinting but also other skills such as high jump, long jump and so on. Similarly it may not be reasonable to assess bilinguals' language performance according to monolingual norms. Therefore, in this study, it is attempted to study the writing outcomes of *both* languages learned by the bilingual students, and to gather more detailed information on their performance vis-à-vis a bilingual framework with the hope that eventually appropriate bilingual norms will come into existence to provide us with a proper base to assess language performance of bilingual students, especially those in Hong Kong.

In Canada, the studies of the writing outcomes of French immersion students were relatively few amongst the large body of literature in this area. It is

partly due to the fact that the emphasis of French immersion has been on the receptive skills (listening and reading) which could be measured efficiently by test items. Also, studies of the writing in French (Swain 1975, Harley and King 1989, Harley 1989) and the writing in English (Genesee and Stanley 1976, Lapkin 1982) of French immersion students were, without exception, comparative studies between immersion students and English students in regular non-immersion programmes and/or francophone students. Vignola and Wesche's (1991)² study is the one of the few that took into account of the two languages of French and English of French immersion students using the same scoring schema, while the francophone students were also used as frame of reference.

Therefore, this study has two main purposes. First, it attempts to show how a linguistically-adequate description, which are not readily available at present, of the output of students could inform the current debate on declining linguistic standards in Hong Kong, the perception of which is based largely on monolingual norms.

Second, it attempts to study the writing outcomes of two groups of bilingual students in Hong Kong and in Montréal who receive their education from similar programmes situated in similar sociolinguistic environments, which may help us to formulate proper expectations (i.e. bilingual norms) of Hong Kong students.

In spite of the tremendous concerns shown by students of bilingualism concerning the significance of bilingual norms, few attempts have been made to

² Vignola and Wesche's (1991) coding scheme of students' writing is not adapted for use in this study because it is not applied to the Chinese language.

facilitate their development. However, there is a prototypical study by Kvan (1969) which sheds some light on this endeavor and shows the value of such studies.

In the study of the bilingual milieu in Hong Kong, Kvan reported on the reading speed in English of Hong Kong university students. He found that their English reading speed were only comparable to the high school students in the United States. But their English reading speed was on the other hand comparable to the French reading speed of the university students in the United Kingdom. Although the second language performance of Hong Kong students had only reached a junior level in the monolingual framework (U.S.), it was comparable to the second language performance of UK students of similar age and academic level. The comparisons of the two second language performances seemed to be more relevant and practical than comparing the second language performance with the first language performance.

The present study takes into consideration the relevant information of the subjects and their language learning experience inside and outside schools. The data may help us to formulate bilingual norms of linguistic L1 and L2 outcomes of Hong Kong students and to avoid the pitfalls of pitching our expectations on the basis of monolingual norms which may not be appropriate to students of Hong Kong's EMI schools.

This information would help our educators and policy-makers to have a clearer picture of how our education system has achieved and how realistic objectives and policies can be formulated to improve the present situations.

II. BACKGROUND

A. *Hong Kong*

1. Two Languages in Society

Hong Kong has about six million people. Over ninety percent of the population is Chinese; Cantonese is the lingua franca between ethnic Chinese groups of different dialect background. English is spoken by a small expatriate minority in Hong Kong.

Hong Kong is a Special Administrative Region (SAR) of the People's Republic of China after the turnover in 1997. It is stipulated in the Basic Law of Hong Kong SAR that "in addition to the Chinese language, the English language is also considered to be the official language in Hong Kong (Clause 9)". In 1996, about 7% and 35% of the population claimed that they were able to speak Cantonese and English respectively as another language (Census and Statistic Department, 1996). In brief, Hong Kong is a largely Cantonese-speaking society with a significant population of Chinese-English bilinguals.

The presence of the two official languages is obvious in the Hong Kong society. Both Chinese and English are used as the working languages in the government, courts, public and private organizations and educational institutions. There are separate Chinese and English newspapers, radio stations, TV broadcasting stations, theatres, churches and social clubs. As exhibited in the

employment advertisements, for most non-manual jobs in Hong Kong, Chinese-English proficiency is a basic requirement. Although not all people in Hong Kong are required to be Chinese-English bilinguals, no student will pass the exit examination of secondary education, the Hong Kong Certificate of Education Examinations, if he/she did not get a passing grade in both Chinese and English.

2. Two Languages in History

The existence of two official languages in Hong Kong is a product of history. Hong Kong was a British colony from 1842 to 1997. The British government first occupied the Hong Kong Island in 1842, and then continued to occupy the Kowloon Peninsula in 1860 and the New Territories in 1898. For more than a hundred years under the British governance, the English language was made the only official language used in Hong Kong among the majority of the colonized subjects who did not understand the language and often preferred to use Cantonese or their Chinese dialects in intra-group communication.

During the colonial history of Hong Kong, English had a very important role to play. It was the language of the minority but also the language of power for the ruling class (Cheung 1984). It was also the language of business that linked Hong Kong people to the world of business and academia (Brimer 1985), and still is today. After 1997, Halliday (1998) assumes that English would continue to play a special role in the post-colonial Hong Kong (p.32), which differentiated the homogeneously Cantonese-speaking Hong Kong from the rest of the Mainland. English proficiency will undoubtedly continue to be essential to the well being of

Hong Kong as an international centre of finance and services and as the interchange between China and the world.

In a Chinese society with English as the language of the ruling class, a group of Chinese-English bilinguals were therefore produced during that time to bridge the communications between the government and the public. The English proficiency was also the prerequisite for upward mobility and for pursuits of prestige careers in general. However, the access to obtain English proficiency was restricted to a relatively small population (Johnson 1994, p.186). No evidence shows that there existed a large body of Chinese-English bilinguals among the local population (So 1998, p.154). In addition, the Chinese people immigrated to and resided in Hong Kong during 1949 and 1970s were speaking a variety of Chinese dialects which might be unintelligible to each other. The situation was briefly that the vast majority of the population in Hong Kong were speakers of different dialects of a language and had little knowledge of the foreign language by which they were governed.

It was only until 1974 when the Official Languages Ordinance was enacted to give equal official status to the Chinese and English language in Hong Kong. However, the officialization of the languages was largely an act of formality and legality. Cheung (1984) observed that the enactment did not “have any significant effect on modifying their complementary societal functions: English remains the high form and Cantonese the low form” (p. 274). It is also admitted by the government that the language given primary emphasis had long been the English

3. Two Languages in Education

The education system of Hong Kong is bilingual in which the students are required to learn both Chinese and English. In 1993, the Education Department in Hong Kong published *School Education in Hong Kong: a Statement of Aims*, in which the language objective was stated as follows: “all children should be helped to develop a good level of competence in at least one language (Chinese, for most children) and some competence in at least one language (usually English)... The extent to which a school imparts language skills is an important indicator of its overall success in meeting the educational needs of individuals and the community”. All Hong Kong students have the rights (and responsibility) to learn Chinese and English to an acceptable level. And it is the responsibility of the schools to help students to achieve bilingual proficiency in achieving the aims of education.

Briefly, six years of primary education in Hong Kong is provided for children from 6 to 11 years old, which is conducted in Cantonese with English learnt as a subject. Five years of secondary education is provided for students from 11 to 16 or 17 years old. Since 1978, all Hong Kong children are entitled to receive a minimum of nine-year compulsory education from Primary one to Secondary three.

By the medium of instruction, secondary schools in Hong Kong are divided in two types, using Chinese as medium of instruction (CMI) and EMI or using English as medium of instruction (EMI). In CMI secondary schools, classes are conducted mainly in Cantonese while in EMI secondary schools, classes are

language while “it is only in recent years that Chinese Language has been accorded the attention it has long deserved” (Choi 1998, p.190).

The increased emphasis on the Chinese language in recent decades can be attributed to the approaching of Hong Kong’s turnover in 1997 starting in the 1980s, the increasing use of Chinese in the business between Hong Kong and the Mainland and the escalating significance of China in the world of international commerce. Very recently, Halliday (1998) remarked that the two languages in Hong Kong, Chinese and English, both “have strong currency and high status” (p.29). It was a phenomenon uncommonly found in the world. Although in a multilingual setting, “languages are not functionally equal or identical” (Fishman 1989, p.426), the societal relationship between the functions of Chinese and English in Hong Kong may have changed from a high-low dichotomy to a more balanced one.

The catching-up importance of the Chinese language has made the language challenge for the Cantonese-speaking students in Hong Kong more acute. The needs for Chinese-English bilingual proficiency are increasingly pressing. On one hand, the aspirations from the society, the government and the stakeholders of education for bilingual proficiency continue to soar. It is stated precisely that it was highly desirable that Hong Kong students become “biliterate in Chinese and English and trilingual in Cantonese, English and Mandarin” through formal schooling (Wong 1999). On the other hand, the education system by which these goals are expected to reach has not functioned as desired.

conducted mainly in English. Chinese and English languages are learnt as subjects in both types of schools.

Social requirements for English proficiency, political changes and parents' choice had forced the EMI secondary schools to become the majority (So 1992, Lee 1993). From 1980-1997³, over 90% of about 400 secondary schools were EMI. Johnson (1994) described it as "a system ... in which almost 90 percent of students changed medium of instruction from first to second language as they moved from primary to secondary level" (p.187).

Numerous reports were published to argue against this change of medium of instruction when primary graduates entered secondary schools, especially. The change is particularly detrimental for the students of low ability groups (Cheng et al. 1973, Poon 1979, Yu and Atkinson 1988a, 1988b). The mixed code teaching in some schools were observed and criticized to be not educationally desirable (Johnson 1983, Shek, Johnson and Law 1991, Tam 1980). But these reports have little effects on the parents' and students' preference for EMI secondary schools for the apparent advantages of relatively more exposure to the second language and the elitist traditions of English-medium education. As a result, 90% of the secondary graduates in Hong Kong in the past two decades were products of CMI primary education and EMI secondary education.

³ Starting from the school year of 1998-99, according to the *Guidance on Medium of Instruction* enacted in 1997, only 30% of Hong Kong secondary schools were allowed to use English as the medium of instruction. This policy effectively restricted the English-medium education to a relatively small population.

As stated earlier, few people were satisfied with the language standards and the academic outcomes attained by Hong Kong students under a system in which the second language is used as the medium of instruction for the purpose to achieve bilingual proficiency. The major problems lie in the fact that Hong Kong does not provide a facilitating environment for the development of the second language proficiency (Yu and Atkinson 1988b). There is not a sizeable population of English-speakers in Hong Kong. No concerted efforts are observed to promote an extensive (or near-to-compulsory) use of English within the society unless the individuals have the opportunities and motivations to use the language in real-life situations. Needless to say, the education system has been the major, if not the only, vehicle to provide Hong Kong students with the environment to achieve bilingual proficiency.

B. Montréal

1. Two Languages in Society

Montréal is the third largest metropolis in Canada, an officially bilingual country since the Official Languages Act of 1969 (revised and updated in 1988). Montréal is also one of the seventeen administrative regions in Québec, the largest and the only French-speaking province in Canada.

According to the census data in 1996, Montréal has about 3.3 million people⁴. About 60% and 20% of people living in Montréal are francophones and anglophones respectively. The influx of immigrants in recent years⁵ has made Montréal the most multilingual city in Québec and in Canada, with about 20% allophones speaking different native languages.

The importance of English in Montréal cannot be underestimated. Because of its geographical and historical advantages, Montréal has been the meeting point between Europe and North America, closely integrated in North American economy where English is the major functional language. Also, as Darbelnet (1976) suggested, Montréal, whose population was one-third English in the 1970s, had a unique role in Québec to link this monolingual territory to the bilingual country. This proposition was confirmed by Carey's (1997) observation that "English is so prevalent that one can go anywhere in Montréal and communicate in English" (p.210). Although the majority of population in Montréal are francophones, the multitudes of immigrants from different linguistic backgrounds and the unique role of Montréal as a metropolis mean that the use of English is more prevalent than one may expect.

But it should be pointed out that as the Québec government has been determined to uphold the French language and has made various promotion efforts

⁴ The population in Montréal is about half of the total population in Québec (about 7 million people), and about 12% of the total population in Canada (about 27 million people).

⁵ About 70% of the immigrant population to Québec stayed in Montréal. (<http://www.gouv.qc.ca>)

in areas of education, business and government, the use of French is undebatably a definite asset in Montréal. Intertwined with the need to maintain French language as a provincial initiative and the need to reach to the English world, Montréal maintains unique features of bilingualism or multilingualism where the use of the two languages are essential and the learning of them beneficial.

As a result, the language challenge of English-French bilingual proficiency is obvious for the people in Montréal, especially for the Anglo-Canadians, that “competence in both English and French is an important means of communication in Canadian political, cultural, and economic affairs, and bilingual competence is often associated with tangible and intangible rewards” (Genesee 1987, p.6).

In 1996, about 48% of the population in Montréal (about 1.6 million people) claim that they have the knowledge of both official languages. It is a significant achievement for the society when compared to the total percentage of English-French bilingual population in Canada, which is only 17% (about 4.8 million people). In brief, Montréal has a multilingual demographic structure and a high aspiration for bilingualism among its residents to meet social and economic needs, situated in a French province of Québec and in a larger context of a English-French bilingual country of Canada.

2. Two Languages in History

Historically, both official languages in Canada were imported by the speakers of the language. In 1534, the landing of Jacques Cartier along the Saint Lawrence River, the area of the Québec province today, marked the beginning of the colonial history of Canada. In the following two centuries, the regions from Québec to Manitoba of the present day were French colonies. In 1763, the Treaty of Paris was signed and the English took over most of North America. The coexistence of English and French began. However, the distribution of these two linguistic and cultural groups was uneven. The Pacific coast had the highest proportion of British-only origins and the east coast had the highest proportion of French-only ancestry, which is still the case today (see Canada Year Book 1997, p.68).

The contacts between the two linguistic and cultural groups increased in the 18th century, during which social events like the America Revolution had led to a substantial rise of English-speaking community in the predominantly French-speaking Québec, who mainly stayed in places like Montréal, Gaspé and Ottawa Valley.

In 1867, under the British North America Act, Canada was created comprising Ontario, Québec, Nova Scotia and New Brunswick. Under the same Act, English and French were recognized as official languages in Parliament and federal courts (Article 133). In other words, institutional English-French bilingualism was restricted to an upper level while there were no designated places for the two languages in the larger society. Also, as the majority of the ruling people were

Anglo-Canadians, French virtually became a minority language restricted to their own communities.

Since the post-war period (circa 1867), English emerged as an international and business language and the Anglo-Canadians dominated the economic and political affairs in Canada and North America. The majority of French Canadians resided in the east coast of Canada mainly in Québec and New Brunswick; traditionally most of them were farmers or worked in agriculture-related businesses and were French monolinguals. Although the French Canadians “were able to resist the efforts of the British to assimilate them” (Genesee 1987, p.5), they had not enjoyed an equal status with the Anglo-Canadians. The social and economic imbalance also endangered the French language and culture “even in Québec, with its large francophone majority, the French language and its speakers played only a subordinate role in the private sector... French speakers had to be bilingual to find jobs and they rarely made their way to positions of power” (d’Anglejan 1985, p.114). On the other hand, speakers of the English language had not shared the same difficulty. The English monolinguals found no obstacles to a successful career in Québec.

It was little wonder that for long the immigrants in the francophone areas and the young generations of the French Canadians preferred to learn English, the prestigious and practical language. Therefore, in the 1960s, nationalistic struggles for the preservation of French culture and language surfaced; it fought against the dominance of English and for a greater appreciation of French uniqueness.

The period of nationalistic, linguistic and cultural struggles against English dominance was concluded in the Official Languages Act in 1969, the main thrust of which was institutional English-French bilingualism, the provision of official services in both English and French and the free decisions on provincial and territorial official languages. In 1974, the law came out of Bill 22 made French the official language of Québec. Other provinces, except New Brunswick which is officially bilingual, adopted English as the only official language.

On the provincial level, in its effort to promote French language in the province, the Québec government has passed a number of laws, aiming at supporting French in the province through education. In 1970 right after the passage of the Official Languages Act, Bill 63 legislated that all English-speaking children in Québec should have a working knowledge of French that “no secondary school certificate may be issued to a student who does not have the speaking and writing knowledge of French required by the curricula of the Department of Education” (Poyen 1986, p.10). In 1977, Bill 101 made French the language of instruction in kindergarten classes, in elementary and secondary schools run by the school boards and in private educational institutions in Québec. The Charter also limited non-francophone children’s access to English schools. No school or school board was permitted to use English as the language of instruction without the approval of the Ministry of Education.

On the national level, the federal body, the Council of Ministers of Education, Canada (CMEC), was set up to promote discussions and

communications among provinces and territories. It has helped to fund provincial and territorial initiatives for French and English minority communities to receive education in their own language. It also provides support for all Canadians to learn English or French as a second language, like organizing funded summer language immersion programmes across the country.

However, it is often conceived that the enactment of these federal and provincial policies has failed to induce inter-penetration between the Anglo- and French Canadian communities as they first set out to be (Darbelnet 1976, Richler 1983, Picard 1994, Edwards 1995). Language learning in Canada has taken the hat of utilitarianism over others. The learning of French was motivated by the fact that “learning French is politically useful, economically beneficial – and greatly enjoyable too” (Gagnon, 1993). It is the same for the learning of English. French remained the language for the minority with its limited variety of uses in the Canadian society, which has not shared the equal status with English in social, political, economic and cultural dimensions outside Québec.

3. Two Languages in Education

In the metropolis Montréal, both federal and provincial initiatives for English-French bilingual proficiency have exhibited most significant impacts when compared to other Canadian cities. The practical needs for such proficiency are also impending. Accordingly, different forms of language programmes have evolved over the past few decades in the promotion of French learning among the non-francophone children, and very recently, the increased popularity (or tolerance) of

English learning among the francophone children (which will not be mentioned here).

There are two school programmes to help non-francophone students to attain a working level of French, namely the Core French and the French immersion programmes. In Canada, “the majority of French language learners will have to learn French in a non-immersion core programme” (Stern 1982, p.37), in which the French language was taught as a subject for about 20 minutes a day. For the rest of their study time, the Anglo-Canadian students receive education using English as the MoI.

French immersion programmes, in its various forms, have been catered for the minority of the student population. In these programmes, classes are delivered in French, the second language of the students, as the medium of instruction for 70-80% of total instructional time. According to the *Immersion Registry* (1996), among all provinces, Québec had the highest enrollment rate (33%) to the French immersion programmes among the Anglophone students. As the enrollments into either these immersion programmes or the Core French programme is voluntary, it is obvious that the Anglo-Canadians in Québec do so mainly to learn better French.

French Immersion programmes were originated in 1965 by a group of Anglo-Canadians in Saint Lambert, a suburb area of Montréal region, who considered that the Core French programmes were insufficient to prepare “a knowledge of French for their own and their children’s future in Québec” (Stern 1978, p.836). With the assistance of Wallace Lambert, a psycholinguist at McGill

University, a prototype of early immersion programmes in which students were immersed into a “language bath” of French at a young age to increase the contacts with the language as well as the culture was developed.

After the successful attempt in Saint Lambert, various forms of French immersion programmes were implemented in different parts of the province and across the country. A partial immersion from Grade One and a late immersion from Grade Seven were conducted in Elgin County and in Montréal by the former Protestant School Board of Greater Montréal. In terms of the starting time, the programmes can be classified into three types : early (from kindergarten on), delayed (from Grade 4 on) and late immersion (from Grade 7 on). In terms of amount of immersion, the programmes can be classified into full, partial and continued immersion, occupying respectively over 85%, 50% and 60-70% (after early full immersion in the primary level) of the total instructional time. In this regard, as far as the use of a L2 as a MoI is concerned, the design of operation of the late full French immersion programme is comparable to that of Hong Kong’s EMI secondary schools.

All forms of French immersion programmes are optional and are selectively provided. Carey (1991) called the provision of immersion programme “a privilege” (p.209) which depends on the amount of funding and human resources a school has. It is not the same case in Hong Kong that EMI education in the secondary level about 90% of secondary schools were entitled to provide education using L2 as the MoI before the streaming of EMI and CMI schools in 1997.

Research reports on immersion education in Canada have produced largely positive findings. Krashen (1984) even considered French immersion to be “the most successful program ever recorded in the professional language-teaching literature” (p.61). Two pieces of findings were considered notable: first, the learning of French as a second language in French immersion classes was more effective than that could be expected of from other programmes; and second, the first language and the academic achievement of immersion students were not hampered; benefits of cognitive development through increased contacts with an additional language were observed (Lambert and Tucker 1972, Genesee 1976, 1987, Lapkin and Swain 1984, Genesee et al, 1985).

However, the major interests of researches on immersion are comparing the students from French immersion programmes with those from regular English programmes and from French schools (i.e. francophone students). This mode of evaluation and comparisons dominated because “parents, and thus administrators, were preoccupied with the question of whether or not student would lose English skills and/or academic content as a result of gaining French skills” (Carey 1984, p.250). As a result, there has been only a few attempts to study how well the students in French immersion programmes normally performed and how well they did vis-à-vis students from other programmes (e.g. Pawley 1985, Hart, Lapkin and Swain 1991).

It should be pointed out that not a few people were skeptical about the claimed success of French immersion programmes (Lyster 1989). As expected, the

French outcomes of immersion students did not reach native-like proficiency, particularly in oral production. The more unacceptable results of French immersion were the anglicised “faulty interlanguage” with persistent errors in syntax, vocabulary and pronunciation (Bibeau 1984, Hammerly 1989). Edwards (1995) also questioned if, apart from the educational initiative of French immersion programmes, the goal of inducing inter-penetration between Anglo- and French Canadians underlying these programmes had been achieved. The Anglophone students of French immersion simply did not use French outside schools as they did not have the needs and preferences to do so (Carey 1991, Edwards 1995).

C. Summary

The brief sketches of the social, historical and educational roles of the two languages in Hong Kong and in Montréal are provided as a background for this study. The Cantonese-speaking students in Hong Kong and the Anglophone students in Montréal have similar language and education objectives, living in similar socio-linguistic contexts. They are expected to master the second language for tangible or intangible socio-political and material benefits. They are also living in communities that the speakers of the two languages seldom interact that the use of the other language in a real-life situation is limited. Both groups of students are of comparable age and presumably, of comparable cognitive maturity. Moreover, under similar education objectives in language learning, they are helped to achieve proficiency in the two languages mainly through schooling using the target

language as the medium of instruction, however, without obligations and needs to use the language outside schools. Last but not the least, the language outcomes, particularly of the second language, of Hong Kong students from EMI secondary schools and Montréal students from late French immersion programmes are not desirable in light of the aims and aspirations of the society and administrators of education.

III. METHOD

A. Introduction

This section will discuss the procedures of sampling, data collection and instrumentation of this study, briefly describe the sampled schools and the student subjects who provided the data for this study and also describe the data-analysis schema and the method used to score the writings.

B. Sampled Schools

Two schools, School H in Hong Kong and School M in Montréal, were selected for the study and their major characteristics are summarized in Table 3.1. The two schools were comparable in two major aspects, the approaches to target language teaching and the availability to target language use outside schools. As expected, the major differences between the two schools were the class size and student-teacher ratio; School H had both bigger classes and bigger student-teacher ratio.

Table 3.1. Basic Characteristics of School H and School M

Characteristics	School H	School M
City	Hong Kong	Montréal
Location	Shatin ⁶ (New Territories)	Pierrefonds (West Island)
School Type	Public, Band One ⁷ , English Medium School.	Public, English School
School Size	~1100 students (Sec 1-5)	~900 students (Grades 7-11)
Student-Teacher Ratio	20:1	12:1
Class Size	40-45 students	20-25 students

1. School H in Hong Kong

School H was one of the 397 English-medium secondary schools of Hong Kong at the time of data collection (June 1998). It was a Band One school, admitting top 20% of the primary graduates in its school net. The data collection for the present study was completed before the enactment of the *Guidance for Secondary School on the Medium of Instruction*⁸ in September 1997. This *Guidance* restricted EMI

⁶ A residential township where a sizeable English-speaking population is insignificant. There is slight to minimal interaction between Cantonese and English speakers in Hong Kong.

⁷ School H admits top 20% of the primary graduates in the local school net. Under the present Secondary School Places Allocation System (SSPA System) in Hong Kong, the whole territory is divided into various school nets, comprising all participating primary and secondary schools within the area. Under the System revised in 1985, the primary graduates in each school net were divided into 5 equal bands in the order of merit, each consisting of 20% of the total P6 pupils in the net. Since the banding system divides the Subjects by percentage, there was a possibility that the students in each band were not of comparable academic standards in different school nets.

⁸ Under this *Guidance*, only 30% of the total number of schools in Hong Kong are eligible to conduct instruction in classrooms using English only, based on the teaching resources and the English proficiency of incoming students, where it is assumed that the students and teachers can be benefited from this mode of bilingual education. The remaining 70% schools, and therefore the students, are recommended to use Chinese (oral instruction in Cantonese and textbooks in Mandarin Chinese) as the teaching medium to obtain maximum benefits from education.

education under the provision of only 114 schools in Hong Kong; and School H was one of the eligible.

Most students admitted to School H lived in the neighbourhood where most residents were Cantonese-speaking people. There had no significantly large population of second language speakers in the neighbourhood area. Cantonese was the major language used in the nearby restaurants and stores to which the students might go. Although it was not precluded that English could also be used in these businesses, the students had relatively low preference to use it in daily communications.

2. School M in Montréal

According to Canadian Parents for French's *Immersion Registry* (1996), which lists all schools that provide French immersion programmes in Canada, School M is one of the twelve schools in Montréal which provides late French immersion programme. Late French immersion programme is an optional programme, in which students are taught using French as the medium of instruction from Grade 7 (Secondary 1 in Hong Kong) through Grade 11 (Secondary 5 in Hong Kong). The actual duration of these programmes may vary in different schools, ranging from a minimum of two to a maximum of five years.

School M was under the jurisdiction of the Montréal English School Board⁹. Therefore, the majority of students admitted to School M were from English-speaking families and the students had few opportunities to contact francophone peers in playgrounds and in classrooms where the real-life interactions took place. The strong social enclosures of the two linguistic groups prevented them to cross the borders to learn each other's culture and language, except in the classroom contexts.

C. Sampled Subjects

35 students of Secondary 3 (H3 subjects) in School H and 20 students of Secondary 3 (i.e. Grade 7) (M3 subjects) in School M participated in this study. During the last term of the school year 1997-8, all subjects were asked through their teachers to give this investigator two pieces of their written assignment: one in the first language and the other in the second language. The samples were then converted into electronic (Chinese Word) text files without modifications. They were also asked to complete a two-page questionnaire to gather information about their sociolinguistic backgrounds.

⁹ In June 1998, the Québec school boards were restructured along linguistic lines. MESB was formed to take over the education for Anglo-Canadians in Montréal. It mainly took over the schools formerly under the administration of the Protestant School Board of Greater Montréal (PSBGM).

Unexpectedly, the data collected from School M were not suitable for analysis because of the miscommunication between the investigator and the teachers. Therefore, a make-up collection was needed from the M3 subjects.

In the first term of school year 1998-9, a second collection with the same procedures was arranged. The same group of M3¹⁰ subjects submitted two school assignments and completed the two-page questionnaire once again.

D. Instrumentation

In this study, two instruments were used. First, the questionnaires were used to obtain information on the subject profile. Second, the cross-language scoring schema for writing assignments, which was a modified version of a schema developed by So and Wu at Hong Kong Polytechnic University, was used to analyze the bilingual written performance.

1. Questionnaires

a) Pretests

Two questionnaires were designed in the first languages of both groups of subjects (Appendix 1). The purpose is to obtain pertinent information about the sampled

¹⁰ M3 subjects, in the school year of 1998-99, were normally promoted to Secondary 4 (Grade 8). Therefore, the second collection was done shortly after the class began in September 1999. The time lag of three months between the data collections in Hong Kong and in Montréal has been considered. But as there were no classes during the summer, the amount of language learning time, which was largely experienced during schooling, between the two groups of subjects remain comparable.

subjects to ensure comparability between groups. It attempts to gain a sketch of the subjects and their language experience. The subjects are asked about their age, sex, languages spoken, language use at home, at school and during selected extra-curricular activities. It serves no explanatory purpose.

To ensure clarity and intelligibility to the subject groups, the questionnaires were pre-tested. Before the data collection in Hong Kong, ten primary six students, aged about 11, in a Hong Kong primary school, were asked to complete the Chinese-version. The pretest session was administered by the students' class teacher, to whom this investigator explained fully the content of the questionnaire. During the session, the students were asked to voice out if they could not understand any of the questions and were confused. It was reported that they had no difficulty to follow the instructions and understand the questions.

The English-version was pre-tested when this investigator was in Montréal before the first data collection. Five pre-tested students whom this investigator personally knew were recruited to complete the questionnaires. They varied in grades from primary six (Grade 6) to secondary 3 (Grade 9). They also found no great problems in understanding and completing the English version of the questionnaire.

b) *Subject Profiles*

The results of the questionnaires completed by the sampled subjects, H3 and M3, were summarized in Table 3.2.

Table 3.2. A Summary of the Subject Profiles of H3 and M3**subjects**

	H3 Subjects (N=35)	M3 Subjects (N=20)
Personal Particulars		
Average Age (years old)	14.5	15.2
Sex Ratio (M:F)	1:1	1:1
Self-claimed knowledge of language(s)		
L1 only	0%	0%
L1 & L2	100% ¹¹	100% ¹²
Language Experience at Home		
Home Language		
L1 only	82.9%	80%
L1 mixed with some L2	17.1%	20%
Mothers' knowledge of language(s)		
L1 only	51.45%	35%
L1 and L2	48.55%	65%
Fathers' knowledge of language(s)		
L1 only	40%	5%
L1 and L2	60%	95%
Language Experience in selected extra-curricular activities		
Viewing TV programmes in L2	68.6%	40%
Writing in L1 (beside school assignments)	54.3%	75%
Writing in L2 (beside school assignments)	34.3%	30%

¹¹ About 91.4% of H3 subjects claim that they are also able to speak Putonghua or other Chinese dialects, in addition to Cantonese and English.

¹² About 35% of M3 subjects claim that they are also able to speak one of the other languages as follows: Italian, Spanish, Hebrew, in addition to English and French.

(1) Personal Particulars

The average age of H3 subjects was 14.5 years old and that of M3 subjects was 15.2 years old. They were of similar age in consideration of the time lag between two collections in Montréal. All subjects reported that they were able to speak both languages learnt at schools and not few of them reported that they had the knowledge of an additional language.

(2) Language Experience at home

Over 80% of H3 and M3 subjects reportedly used their L1 at home. Slightly more M3 subjects used L2 (French) at home in addition to L1 (English). Also, more M3 subjects' parents were reported to have the knowledge of L2 (French). But if mothers were considered to be the major conversant with their children at home, the proportion of L1-only and L1/L2 mothers among the two groups of subjects were similar. In other words, it was assumed that the language experience at home of H3 and M3 subjects were similar.

(3) Language Experience in Extra-curricular activities

It was discussed in previous sections that H3 and M3 subjects had similar language experience at schools that they were both primary graduates from L1 schools and were receiving the secondary education using L2 as the medium of instruction. In the questionnaire, The language experience outside schools was also considered.

More H3 subjects reportedly viewed TV programmes in L2 (English) and wrote in L2 (English) in leisure time. More M3 subjects, on the other hand,

reportedly wrote in L1 (English) in leisure time. These figures were only the general pictures of the input and output of the subjects in L1 and L2.

2. Schemas

As aforementioned, the cross language schema used was a modified version of a schema developed by So and Wu. The purpose of the schema was to assess the writing performance in different languages, in particular to include the Chinese language whose idiosyncratic surface structure renders it incompatible with popular assessment tools such as T-unit analysis (Wolfe-Quintero, Kim and Inagaki 1998).

There are two parts in the schema, the Macro Index and the Micro Index. The rationale, the design and the scoring procedures and considerations will be detailed in discussion as follows.

a) *Macro Index Scoring Schema (Appendix 2)*

The Macro Index Scoring Schema comprises a 6-point scale¹³ for the evaluation of general writing performance. Specifically a holistic scoring schema¹⁴ was used to assess different aspects of the subjects' writing proficiency such as communication of ideas, clarity, topic relevance, text organization and grammatical accuracy. The

¹³ The descriptors of the Macro Index scheme are adapted from the Test of Written English (TWE) Scoring Guide and the clarity scheme devised by Kaczmarek (1980). The modifications include retaining the features related to communication and clarity; omitting the features related to (the amount of) variation and complexity of sentences; and lessening the topic-dependent features like creativity and intricacy.

¹⁴ Holistic scoring, as broadly defined by Cooper (1976), is any procedure "which stops short of enumerating linguistic, rhetorical, or informational features of a piece of writing" (p.4). It is a guided procedure in reaching a judgement on a piece of writing based on a scoring scale of

overall objective was to assess whether or not clear communication has been achieved. If the writing is below par it will be given a point smaller than 4; if it is at par it will be given a point of 4 and if above par a point greater than 4.

In sum, the higher the Macro Index value, the more communicative; relevant to the topic; well-structured with introduction, body and conclusion; and well-written without distracting and misleading grammatical and syntactic inaccuracies the piece of writing is.

The Macro Index scoring schema is not language-specific. The descriptions of the impressions on good writing performance are not language-specific. Writing investigators (Carson, Carrell, Silberstein, Kroll, and Kuehn 1990, Carson and Kuehn 1992) have found that the descriptors in the three holistic schemas (TWE for English and two schemas individually designed for the Chinese and Japanese languages) are very similar, "particularly those focusing on coherence, topic development and language usage" (Carson and Kuehn 1992, p.169). The design of these descriptions has taken into account the experience of the raters and their individual understanding of the descriptors concerned.

b) Micro Index Scoring Schema (Appendix 3)

In their study of the bilingual performance (written and oral) of the tertiary students in Hong Kong, So and Wu designed a cross language Micro Index Scoring Schema

model pieces or a scoring scheme for the prominence of certain features; and awarding a letter grade.

to assess the students' proficiency in different languages, including the Chinese language.

As the Micro Index Scoring Schema is still in its trial phase, it is expected that there is room for modifications and improvements. But given the general framework of the schema which is directed towards cross-language comparisons and built for future bilingual and multilingual studies, it is deemed appropriate for this study and is therefore used to analyze the Chinese, English and French data.

The aim of the Schema is not to classify items, as the specificity of classification largely depends on individual researchers' preferences and interests¹⁵ (Gaies 1980, Rifkin and Roberts 1995, Wolfe-Quintero, Inagaki and Kim 1998). It aims to offer a cross-language descriptive framework for providing linguistically-adequate information on writing performance along indices applicable, albeit in varying degrees, to more than one languages.

The Micro Index Scoring Schema is used to assess the sampled writing along four dimensions: intra-sentential accuracy, inter-sentential cohesiveness, textual coherence and presentational skills.

The Schema provides a precise summation in the language of descriptive linguistics of the degree to which the student subjects mastered the sets of rules that respectively determine whether words and phrases communicate an intended

¹⁵ For instance, Vann, Meyer, and Lorenz (1984) ask ten ESL writing instructors to list the commonest errors in ESL writings. Then they chose twelve major types from the long list for the study. In Santo's (1988) study, he groups the errors into 23 types, with the general category of 'verbs' being further divided into six subtypes.

meaning, and whether words and phrases are chosen and spelled out according to standard usage. In addition to the dimensions of discourse coherence and discourse structure and presentation, the Schema also covers “mechanical” matters of writing such as standard spelling, punctuation and capitalization.

Along the intra-sentential dimension, the quality of control is assessed vis-à-vis five indicators: degree of completeness or omission (Type 1A), degree of redundancy (1B), vertical accuracy (1C), linear accuracy (1D) and lexical accuracy (1E).

The quality of control along the inter-sentential dimension is coded as Type 2. This dimension deals with the extent to which discourse cohesiveness is achieved by the appropriate use of sentence-linking strategies and devices.

The third dimension of textual coherence is sub-divided into coherence and reference (Type 3A) and tense and aspect (3B). This dimension cuts across other dimensions and manifests itself in the ability to link paragraphs using appropriate devices and the ability to use appropriate tense and aspect markers to indicate the temporal frame(s) of reference for the discourse.

The quality of control over presentation matters is coded as Type 4. It manifests itself in the ability to follow the general rules in writing, including spelling (stroke configuration), punctuation, indentation and other matters of format.

Based on this schema, each and every inaccuracy will be counted and will have a value of one. The enumeration of inaccuracies provides a general indication of the students' degree of control over their L1 and L2 writings. The Micro Index schema is shown in Table 3.3.

The quality of accuracy is also defined into Yellow Card and Red Card¹⁶ inaccuracies. Yellow Cards are given to inaccuracies that have minimal effects on communication (i.e. weak negative communicative effect) while Red Cards are given to those which obscure and prevent successful communication (i.e. strong negative communicative effect).

¹⁶ Homburg (1984) endorses similar idea in his classification of errors that he divides errors into first, second and third-degree errors, with respect to their effect on the meaning of the message.

Table 3.3. Micro Index Scoring Schema and Definitions

Inaccuracy Dimension/Type	Type	Definitions
Dimension 1 – Intra-sentence		
Omission	1A	Omission of single items or chunks.
Redundancy	1B	Redundancy of single items or chunks.
Vertical Accuracy	1C	Inaccuracies in the use of parts of speech and homonymns that require substitution in the same positions.
Linear Accuracy	1D	Inaccuracies in word order and word-level agreements that require rearrangement and replacement.
Lexical Accuracy	1E	Inaccuracies in lexical choice and collocation.
Dimension 2 - Inter-sentence		
Structural Accuracy	2	Inaccuracies in the use of sentence patterns and sentence-construction strategies.
Dimension 3 - Textual		
Cohesion and Reference	3A	Inaccuracies in the use of cohesive and referent markers that lead to confusion and incongruity.
Tense/Aspect/Mood	3B	Inaccuracies in tense/aspect/mood indications that lead to time confusion and inconsistency.
Dimension 4 – Presentation		
	4	Inaccuracies in outlook of the writing piece, including misspelling (wrong strokes in Chinese), capitalization and punctuation, especially comma splice.

E. Data Profile

A total of 110 pieces of writings were collected from School H and School M. There were four sets of data according to the languages of writing and the groups of sampled subjects (Table 3.4).

Table 3.4. Sampled writings

Class	Language in Writing	Set Code	Samples
H3	Chinese (L1)	A	35
	English (L2)	B	35
M3	English (L1)	C	20
	French (L2)	D	20
Total number of sampled pieces:			110

The writing samples collected were free writings. They were varied in topics and styles of writing, time limits for completion and also word limits¹⁷ (See Table 3.5). All samples were written on a topic relevant to the subjects' life, which draws upon their past experience and opinions.

It was intended that both the topics and time limits were free of the investigator's control (Hunt 1970) because the present study was neither a test nor

¹⁷ These variables are considered but not controlled. It is because the free writings are believed to represent the normal writing performance of students in their own particular school (class) conditions, not under those of an experimental study.

an experiment for proof or disproof. Its purpose was to provide detailed information on the writing outcomes of subjects under normal conditions. Therefore, might there be other drawbacks stemming from this arrangement, it was decided not to exert additional influence on the subjects' writings to avoid positive or negative Hawthorne effect (i.e. the students might write exceptionally well or otherwise because of their knowledge of the experiments).

Table 3.5. L1 and L2 Sampled Writings of H3 and M3 subjects

Set	Topic	Style	Time Limit	Word Limit
A	沙田的早晨 (The Morning in Shatin)	Descriptive	70 minutes	600
B	Caught in a Heavy Shower of Rain	Descriptive	70 minutes	250
C	Part-time Jobs and Students ¹⁸	Argumentative	Overnight Take-home	One page
D	Le travail à temps partiel (The Part Time Jobs)	Argumentative	Overnight Take-home	One page

F. Data Analysis

1. Scoring

The Macro Index scoring of each set of the writings was done by one experienced language teacher in each school system. The Chinese (Set A) and English (Set B)

¹⁸ The writing topics set out by the English and French language teachers of M3 subjects are very similar. It would be more desirable if both tasks were direct or spontaneous writing on different topics or were writings completed at different times.

writings of H3 subjects were read and scored by an English Language Teacher and a Chinese Language Teacher in an EMI secondary school (not School H). The English (Set C) and French (Set D) writings were read and scored by a French Language Teacher and an English Language teacher in School M. For the scoring of the samples according to the Micro Index Schema, it was done by this investigator with the assistance of the French language teacher of M3 subjects.

2. Macro Index Scoring

Before reading and scoring, the raters first familiarized with the descriptors in the Macro Index schema. The schema was constantly referred to during the process of scoring. As the scorers continued to calibrate themselves with the scoring schema, the conceptual reliability of scoring would increase.

According to Purves (1984), scorers should approach the pieces of writing as a reader, not as an expert-rater, to minimize effects of biases and preconceptions in scoring (p.427). In the same way, the scorers in this study were told not to impose presumptions on what sort of writing should be emerged from the topic, but trying to understand the message as it was conveyed. An index score was assigned to each piece of writing according to the 6-point scale. The judgement was subjective and impressionistic but consistent.

In this study, the same Macro Index represents the same or comparable level of holistic writing proficiency across the three languages in the data pool. The advantage of this Macro Index is that it is not language specific and that all writings in the pool can be sorted and ranked according to the Macro Index regardless of the

languages. In principle, writings given the same value should mean their writers attain a similar degree of control over the language concerned, be it Chinese, English or French.

3. Micro Index Scoring

The use of the Micro Index Scoring Schema is for the construction of linguistically-adequate information. A code was assigned to each inaccuracy (e.g. 1A or 3B). Repeated inaccuracies in the same piece of writing were counted once. Red Card was given to inaccuracies which had serious negative communicative effect that made readers fail to properly understand the message. Yellow Card was given to inaccuracies that had no significant effect on the meaning that the message was generally understood as intended.

As what is being assessed is the subjects' proficiency in the standard variety of the language, the prescriptive orientation is unavoidable. One way to reduce the prescriptive tone is to avoid the terms of "errors" or "wrong", and to consider using the term "sub-standard" in addition to "inaccurate". The design of the Micro Index schema is pitched at the irreducible-minimum level and the scoring process is not painstakingly severe or restrictive¹⁹. This "loose" approach is deemed suffice for obtaining a basic understanding of the quality and the degree of control of the subjects over the languages concerned.

¹⁹ In general, the investigator takes a stance of allowance instead of stringency, as the Subjects of the current study are non-skilled writers (Gaies 1980, Brown and Bailey 1984).

IV. RESULTS

A. *Macro Index*

1. **Macro Bilingual Writing Performance of H3 subjects**

According to Table 4.1, in general, the Macro writing performances of H3 subjects in L1 (Chinese) and L2 (English) are satisfactory, as shown in Table 4.1. Respectively 94% and 68% of H3 subjects receive an average score of Point 4 or above in their L1 and L2 writings. Only a few H3 subjects receive a below-average score of Point 3 or below in L1 and L2.

Table 4.1. Macro Scoring of L1 and L2 writings of H3 subjects
(N=35)

Macro Scores	L1 (Chinese)		L2 (English)	
	N	N%	N	N%
Point 5 or above	19	54.29	11	31.43
Point 4	14	40	13	37.14
Point 3 or below	2	5.71	11	31.43

When the essays are grouped by indices and reviewed, it is found that the below-average essays are shorter than the average length, their plots are simpler and

the discourse is under-developed. The average lengths²⁰ of the lowest score (Point 3) and the highest score (Point 6) essays of H3 subjects in L1 (Chinese) are respectively 514 and 655.7 characters. The average lengths²¹ of the lowest score (Point 2) and the highest score (Point 6) essays of H3 subjects in L2 (English) are respectively 158.8 and 285.5 words.

Both writing topics are descriptive. For the young writers, the shortness in length is more because of restricted vocabulary or expressions, instead of conciseness and brevity. Subjects awarded a below-average score often repeat the observations and descriptions unnecessary where conciseness is absent. On the other hand, the essays of average score or above are longer in length; the contents are richer and the plot developments are clearer and more sophisticated.

When the L1 and L2 Macro writing performances are compared, H3 subjects perform better in their L1 than L2. 55% of H3 subjects receive a good score of Point 5 in L1, while only 30% of them receive the same score in L2. Also, fewer H3 subjects perform unsatisfactorily in L1. Only 6% (that is, two subjects) of H3 subjects receive a score of Point 3 or below for their L1 (Chinese) writings. About 30% of them (that is, eleven subjects) receive the below-average scores of Point 3 and 2 for their L2 (English) writings.

²⁰ The average lengths of Point 4 and 5 essays in L1 (Chinese) are respectively 625.2 and 629.7 characters.

2. Macro Bilingual Writing Performance of M3 subjects

According to Table 4.2, in general, the Macro writing performances of M3 subjects in L1 (English) and L2 (French) are average. About 55% and 60% of M3 subjects receive an average score of Point 4 or above in L1 and L2 respectively. In other words, about half of the subjects receive below-average scores in the L1 and L2 writings.

Table 4.2. Macro Scoring of L1 and L2 writings of M3 subjects
(N=20)

Macro Scores	L1 (English)		L2 (French)	
	N	N%	N	N%
Point 5 or above	5	25	1	5
Point 4	6	30	11	55
Point 3 or below	9	45	8	40

It should be noted that M3 subjects wrote in L1 and L2 on similar topics, which were argumentative. Both the English and French language teachers asked M3 subjects to write on the topic of students doing part time jobs. The subjects were required to respond to the issue, give opinions and supporting evidence for their standpoints. The French language teacher provided a related article adapted from a local magazine (in French) and a guideline of writing; the English language teacher did not. However, as the subjects did not write the two essays in the same lesson and

²¹ The average lengths of Point 3, 4 and 5 essays in L2 (English) are respectively 200.8,

different teachers scored the two essays separately using the same Scoring Schema, the results of L1 and L2 Macro writing performances remain fit for individual assessment and comparison.

In general, the L1 and L2 Macro writing performances of M3 subjects are average that there are approximately equal numbers of average or above and below-average essays. As shown in the Table 4.2, respectively 55% and 60% of M3 subjects receive an average score or above in L1 and L2. Similar numbers of M3 subjects receive a below average score in both languages. Relatively fewer M3 subjects receive an above average score of Point 5 or above in L2 than in L1. In other words, most M3 subjects have by then optimally achieved only an average standard in their L2 writing.

Similar to H3 subjects, when the essays are grouped by indices and reviewed, the essays of M3 subjects receiving below-average scores are shorter in length, of shorter paragraphs and less elaboration. The average lengths²² of the lowest score (Point 1) and the highest one (Point 6) in L1 (English) writing are respectively 151.5 and 193 words. In L2 (French) writing, the average lengths²³ of the lowest score (Point 1) and the highest one (Point 5) are respectively 90 and 221 words.

217.4 and 253.1 words.

²² The average lengths of Point 2, 3, 4 and 5 essays in L1 (English) are respectively 142.3, 170.25, 198 and 196.5 words.

²³ The average lengths of Point 2, 3 and 4 essays in L2 (French) are respectively 170.8, 171.7 and 243.4 words.

It is typical that the subjects awarded below-average scores often give contradictory arguments; offer opinions in contrary to their conclusion; argue for and against at the same time and make little elaboration in arguments. For the subjects awarded average or above scores, they tend to write longer in each paragraph focusing on one point; elaborate more in details and more coherent in the argument and conclusion.

3. A Comparison of Macro Bilingual Writing Performance of H3 and M3 subjects

According to Table 4.3, regarding the L1 writing performance, more H3 subjects receive higher scores and fewer lower scores than their M3 counterparts do (Table 4.3). In the Macro scoring, H3 subjects perform better in L1 (Chinese) than M3 subjects do in their L1 (English), that the former have more quality outputs and fewer undesirable ones.

Table 4.3. Macro Scoring of L1 writings of H3 and M3 subjects

Macro Index	L1 (Chinese)		L1 (English)	
	N	N%	N	N%
Point 5 or above	19	54.29	5	25
Point 4	14	40	6	30
Point 3 or below	2	5.71	9	45

According to Table 4.4, the L2 writing performances of the two groups of subjects are similar: respectively 68% and 60% of H3 and M3 subjects receive an

average score or above. While similar percentages of H3 and M3 subjects receive below-average scores, significantly more H3 subjects receive above-average scores of Point 5 and Point 6. Similar to the L1 comparisons, H3 subjects are able to produce quality outputs in L2 while M3 subjects produce largely average ones.

Table 4.4. Macro Results of the L2 writings of H3 and M3 subjects

Macro Index	L2 (English)		L2 (French)	
	N	N%	N	N%
Point 5 or above	11	31.43	1	5
Point 4	13	37.14	11	55
Point 3 or below	11	31.43	8	40

It is acknowledged that H3 and M3 subjects are required to perform different tasks of different requirements. Also, although both H3 and M3 subjects have come across the major writing genres (e.g. descriptive, expository, argumentative and etc.) at schools, we cannot be sure if the subjects are familiar (or unfamiliar) to a particular genre of writing.

However, the focus of Macro scoring is to see if the subjects are able to fulfil the basic task of communications and message delivery under normal school conditions. Therefore, the holistic scores should be sufficient to measure this ability regardless of the languages used and the topics and genres of writing.

B. Micro Index

The analysis based on the Micro Index Scoring Schema is a detailed linguistic description of all writing outputs. It provides an overview of the linguistic control of the subjects in each language in the four dimensions defined in the Schema, intra-sentential accuracy, inter-sentential cohesiveness, textual coherence and presentational skills.

1. Micro Bilingual Writing Performance of H3 subjects

a) L1 (*Chinese*)

The outcomes of the analysis based on the Micro Index largely match that based on the Macro Index. The Micro Index analysis (see Appendix 4) shows that the quality of control of the H3 subjects over their L1 is relatively good. They show good control over sentence constructions, sentence linking and textual development. They appear to have mastered to a great extent the vertical and linear dimensions of linguistic construction in L1. The only area where the quality of control is relatively weak is the presentational dimension, particularly the proper writing of the Chinese characters.

Table 4.5. Classification of Inaccuracies in the L1 (Chinese)*writings of H3 subjects*

Dimensions/Types of Inaccuracies	L1 (Chinese)		
	I	I% ²⁴	R
Dimension 1- Intra-Sentence	33	26.4%	2
1A – Omission	5	4%	
1B – Redundancy	12	9.6%	
1C – Vertical	2	1.6%	
1D – Linear	0	0%	
1E – Lexical	14	11.2%	2
Dimension 2- Inter-Sentence	8	6.4%	0
2 – Structural	8	6.4%	
Dimension 3- Textual	4	3.2%	1
3A – Coherence & Reference	2	1.6%	1
3B – Tense/Aspect	2	1.6%	
Dimension 4 – Presentation	80	64%	0
Total	125	100%	3

²⁴ I ratio (I%) is the proportion of incidences of inaccuracies in each dimensions and types of inaccuracies. The Red Card ratio (R/I%) is the proportion of inaccuracies given a Red Card to total number of inaccuracies. The higher the R/I ratio, the more negative effects the incidences of inaccuracies have on the communication.

According to Table 4.5, the classification of inaccuracies (I) in the L1 (Chinese) writings using the Micro Index Scoring Schema is shown. Scoring based on the Micro Index shows that there are a total of 125 instances of inaccuracies in 35 pieces of L1 (Chinese) writings (19,863 Chinese characters). On average, there are only 3 inaccuracies found in each piece of writing.

These inaccuracies are unevenly distributed across the different dimensions and types of the Schema. Specifically, most of the inaccuracies are Type 4/presentational inaccuracies (64%). 11.2% are Type 1E/lexical inaccuracies and 9.6% are Type 1B/redundancy inaccuracies. The remaining types are very few in numbers while no Type 1D/linear inaccuracy (0%) is found.

Red Cards given are few in numbers, which are amounted to only 2.4% of the total inaccuracies. It means that the inaccuracies made by H3 subjects in their L1 writing are not serious and that the message is successfully conveyed to the readers as intended.

(1) Intra-sentential Dimension

The focus of the intra-sentential dimension is the basic skills in forming sentences. The areas of concerns therefore include redundancy and omission (the completeness and repetitions of sentence constituents); linear and vertical accuracy (the positions and word classes of sentence constituents); and lexical accuracy (i.e. word choice and collocation).

Along the intra-sentential dimension, the majority of inaccuracies are found in the lexical dimension. Most lexical inaccuracies are related to verbs and

prepositions. Although lexical richness is not measured by type/token ratio, H3 subjects have shown to have a rich lexicon and are articulated to use appropriate four-word idioms (in Chinese), a variety of adjectives and adverbs to describe objects and actions and various similes and metaphors.

In the L1 (Chinese) writings of H3 subjects, inaccuracies in omission are fewer in number than those in redundancy. H3 subjects have an adequate control to form complete sentences; they tend less to omit necessary constituents than to include unnecessary ones.

Also, few incidences of vertical and linear inaccuracies are found in L1 (Chinese) writings of H3 subjects. On the vertical dimension, they perform relatively well in understanding and using the appropriate word classes and placing them in appropriate positions. On the linear dimension, no problems in word order or in agreements are found.

(2) Inter-sentential Dimension

The focus of the inter-sentential dimension is the extent to which discourse cohesiveness and clarity is achieved by the appropriate use of sentence-linking strategies (sentence variety and clarity) and use of punctuation marks. Conciseness is also discussed when necessary.

The majority of H3 subjects have shown adequate skills to link phrases and sentences clearly and cohesively, making use of conjunctions (e.g. 雖然、所以²⁵),

²⁵ English translation: “although”, “but”

temporal markers (e.g. 這時²⁶), and locative markers or particles (e.g. 途中、陽光下²⁷). Sentence variety is achieved by using various types of similes, metaphors and anthropomorphization to illustrate, emphasize and add life to their observation, feelings and actions.

Omissions of conjunctions in the L1 (Chinese) writing are not frequent, so do the use of them. In their discussion of sentence-linking in spoken Chinese, Li and Thompson (1989) point out that there is high flexibility in the use (and omission) of conjunctions, or sentence-linking elements. Both forward and backward linking can be accomplished without any linking element, “but can occur simply by virtue of the speaker’s intention that (the two clauses) be related” (p.641). In context-reduced activities like writing, the writer’s intention can often be inferred.

However, it is observed in the data that some H3 subjects overdo the flexibility of omitting conjunctions, leading to obscure meanings and fragmented structures (see the example below). The explicit marking of the particular relationships should be highlighted when the sequences of linking are longer than two clauses and when the inter-sentential relationships are complicated and multi-leveled.

²⁶ English translation: “At that moment”

²⁷ English translation: “Along the way”, “in the sunlight”

e.g. * 想起他很喜歡籃球，^ (但是) 送個新籃球給他不好，^ (因為) 他已有一籃球，再送不是多餘嗎？^ (還是) 想其他的吧！²⁸ (A6)

A few subjects misuse some common sentence patterns. For example, “時而...時而...”²⁹ is a sentence pattern for describing a pair of alternate actions of the doer. It is a parallel construction. But A23 subject wrote “時而...” as equivalence to “sometimes” and used it alone. Other sentence patterns using common connecting devices are used correctly. But attempts to use more complex or parallel structures are few.

(3) Textual Dimension

Along the textual dimension, when sentences, ideas, and details fit well together, readers can follow along easily, and the writing is said to be coherent.

In writing a descriptive essay, all H3 subjects show the ability to describe the scenes, static and dynamic, far and near, in a coherent manner. Only a few subjects fail to give one, clear dominant impression. Because of the lack of one central focus, the selection of details appears staccato and minute.

The rhetoric organization in L1 writing is good. Responding to the writing topic of “Morning of Shatin”, most subjects give a dominant impression in the writing to guide their selection of detail and make clear to the reader in the thesis

²⁸ English translation (literal): “I know that he loves basketball. ^ (*But*) It is not good to give him a new basketball. ^ (*because*) He already has a basketball. Isn't it redundant to give him another one? ^ (*It'd be better to*) Think of something else.”

²⁹ English translation (literal): “At some times... at other times...”

sentence. They make subjective descriptions, delineating the observations and happenings during the route from home to school in the morning. They also make use of emotions and reflecting statements to strengthen the dominant impression. They succeed to move the readers through space and time chronologically. No serious confusions in the textual development are observed.

To make a coherent text, H3 subjects have used strategies like repeating key terms or phrases, use of synonyms, use of transitional words or connecting devices and parallel sentence patterns. For instance,

(a) *Repeating key terms or phrases:*

1. 微微細雨下，桃園美景又重現眼前。雨停了，這是一陣過雲雨。滿天的愁雲都被雨點洗淨了，洗出一個清朗的藍天來。悶熱的空氣也給雨洗得新鮮、清爽。³⁰(A8)

(b) *Use of synonyms for emphasis:*

1. 公園裡瀰漫著一股濃烈的香氣，在一瞬間，各式各樣的花在同時間內吐香，使整個公園充滿了不同種類的芬芳。³¹(A4)

³⁰ English translation): "In a drizzle, the beautiful scenes came alive before us. The rain stopped; it is a light rain. The sky of dull clouds was washed by the raindrops and a clear blue sky appeared. The hot air was also refreshed by the rainwater."

³¹ English translation (literal): "The garden was filled with strong pleasant scents. In a minute, all flowers gave out their fragrance, scenting the garden with different aroma."

(c) *Use of transitional words or phrases:*

Subject A3, Subject A22 and Subjects 25 are exemplary in using transitional words or connecting devices to make a coherent text (Exhibits 4.1, 4.2 and 4.3). All three essays have a Macro score of Point 5 (above average).

Exhibit 4.1. Paragraphs of L1 Essay by Subject A3

Paragraph	Topic line
Introductory	「沙田 – 我的家。...」 “Shatin is my home...”
Body #1	「我家是在沙田的一條村莊裡的。...」 “My home is in a village of Shatin...”
Body #2	「我家附近，有一條小小的河流。...」 Near my home, there is a brook...”
Body #3	「我每天步行回校，也會經過村口的一個休憩公園。...」 “Everyday, when I walk to school, I pass by a rest area in the village’s entrance...”
Body #4	「回校途中，必定經過沙田名點 – 城門河。...」 Along the walk to school, I always pass by the main spot of Shatin – Shing Mun River...”
Concluding	「沙田既是我們的家。...」 “As Shatin is our home...”

Exhibit 4.2. Paragraphs of L1 Essay by Subject A22

Paragraph	Topic line
Introductory	「... 平常還是要在大清早起床去上學。」 “As usual, I have to get up early in the morning and go to school.”
Body #1	「每天上學途經的路，走過的路都是一樣，但這天天氣格外寒冷...」 “The route to school is the same every day. But today the weather was extraordinarily cold...”
Body #2	「我帶著沉重的步伐著、走著，看見路旁的樹木隨風搖曳生姿。...」 “I was walking slowly, slowly, seeing that the trees were wavering with the blowing wind...”
Body #3	「我一直向前走，走到一處比較多人的地方。...」 “I continued to walk straight to a place where more people were around...”
Body #4	「不知不覺地，我走到一個寒風撲面的地方。...」 “Unknowingly, I went to a windy place...”
Concluding	「經過這場爭鬥後，我慢慢走到學校門口，結束了這場早晨的觀賞。...」 “After the struggle (with the wind), I slowly reached the school gate and ended this morning show...”

Exhibit 4.3 Paragraphs of L1 Essay by Subject A25

Paragraph	Topic line
Introductory	「...在我居住的地方 - 沙田，它的清晨特別多姿多采。 “... In the place where I live, Shatin, the morning scenes are fabulous.”
Body #1	「...但一想到早晨種種特別、美麗的景象，我心便開始雀躍起來，背起書包，早早上學去了。」 “When I just think of the special and superb morning scenes outside, I will get very excited, pick up my schoolbag and head to school early.”
Body #2	「每早出門，我總會遇見隔壁的老公公、老婆婆們... “Every morning when I leave home, I always greet the elderly people living nearby.”
Body #3	「...看到勤力的露珠和小鳥...」 “...I see the diligent morning dew and birds...”
Body #4	「離開這些悠閒的景象，我行到了巴士站...」 “Leaving these quiet scenes behind, I walk to the bus stop...”
Concluding	「沙田的早晨是多面的，有動也有靜，有悠閒的也有匆忙的一面...」 “The morning of Shatin is multi-faceted; moving and quiet, leisure and hectic.”

To make a coherent text, in each paragraph, Subject A3 described different “landmarks” to represent the movement from home to school; Subject A22 used parallel constructions of the “walking” action; and Subjects A25 described the actions of different inanimate or animate objects to achieve coherence. The progression of plot development is smooth. The concluding paragraphs also echoed with the introductory ones. It is evident that most H3 subjects have done a deliberate textual outline before or while writing.

Both Subjects A9 and A10's essays receive a Macro score of Point 3. They also show efforts to organize the text in a coherent manner, as shown in Exhibit 4.4 and 4.5 respectively.

Exhibit 4.4. Paragraphs of L1 Essay by Subject A9

Paragraph	Topic line
Introductory	「每天早晨，我都要上學，看到各種不同事物...」 “Every morning, I go to school and see a lot of different things...”
Body #1	「當我在春天裡上學，...」 “When I go to school in spring...”
Body #2	「當我在夏天時上學，...」 “When I go to school in summer...”
Body #3	「當我在秋天的時候，...」 “When I go to school in autumn...”
Body #4	「當我在冬天時上學，...」 “When I go to school in winter...”
Concluding	「沙田是一個景色怡人的地方，在不同的季節內能帶出我不同的感情。...」 “Shatin is a nice place; it brings out different emotions in me in different seasons...”

Exhibit 4.5. Paragraphs of L1 Essay by Subject A10

Paragraph	Topic line
Introductory	「...每天卻要在床上掙扎著起來，實在不好受！」 “... every morning I have a hard time to make myself leave the bed. It's tough!”
Body #1	「在每次我要乘巴士回校...」 “Every morning, I go to school by bus...”
Body #2	「在車子上，...」 “On the bus,...”
Body #3	「在我回校的路上，...」 “On the way to school...”
Concluding	「沿著河走，...」 “Along the river...”

The textual organization of Subject A9 is very neat, but the multiple foci (i.e. the four seasons) thin out the cohesiveness of the whole piece and unfortunately

make the text appear to be staccato. For Subject A10, although “landmarks” are used as the transitional devices, the textual flow is disorganized, as the elaboration on each point is slim. A flaky piece of writing is resulted.

In general, H3 subjects have no serious problems in textual coherence to convey the message to the readers clearly and smoothly. Areas that need refining are the ability to include (and exclude) appropriate pieces of information and that to control the degree of elaboration in writing descriptive essays.

(4) Presentational Dimension

In the L1 writing, H3 subjects are the weakest in the presentational dimension. The major problems lie in the writing of wrong characters, either homonyms or non-existent words of wrong stroke configuration. As shown in the examples listed below, the wrong characters usually share certain similarities with the right ones, either in pronunciations, representations or both. About 70% of total inaccuracies found in H3 subjects are wrong characters, which phenomenon deserves much attention³².

(a) Similar pronunciations:

囧(熟)識、無源(緣)無故、建(見)地、雙(相)映成趣、境(景)物、清優(幽)

³² The problem of using wrong characters in the Chinese writing has been widely reported (for example, Tse 1995, Chan 1996, Ho 1998).

(b) *Similar representations:*

神采飛揚(揚)、照耀(耀)、海鷗(鷗)、慘(慘)不忍睹、忽忽(匆)地、濟(擠)迫

(c) *Similar pronunciations and representations:*

還(環)境、巴(疤)痕、周(週)日、廉(簾)縫、漠(莫)名奇妙、尉(蔚)藍色

b) L2 (English)

The Micro analyses (see Appendix 5) show that the H3 subjects have relatively good control of their L2 at the inter-sentential dimension and at the dimension of coherence and reference; they have relatively fewer problems in linking sentences and paragraphs. They show, however, a weaker control along the intra-sentential dimension and the dimension of tense and aspect.

According to Table 4.6, specifically the Micro Index analyses show that there are a total of 240 instances of inaccuracies in 35 pieces of L2 (English) writings (7,799 words). On average, there are about 6 incidences of inaccuracies in each piece of writing.

The inaccuracies are evenly distributed across the different dimensions and types of the Micro Index Schema. Type 1D/linear (17.08%) and Type 3B/tense and aspect (17.08%) inaccuracies are the most common. Whereas Type 3A/Coherence and reference inaccuracies are the fewest (2.09%).

Table 4.6. Classification of Inaccuracies in the L2 (English)**Writings of H3 Subjects**

Dimensions/Types of Inaccuracies	L2 (English)		
	I	I%	R
Dimension 1- Intra-Sentence	153	63.75%	9
1A – Omission	32	13.33%	3
1B – Redundancy	21	8.75%	
1C – Vertical	21	8.75%	
1D – Linear	41	17.08%	2
1E – Lexical	38	15.84%	4
Dimension 2- Inter-Sentence	29	12.08%	1
2 – Structural	29	12.08%	1
Dimension 3- Textual	46	19.17%	0
3A – Coherence & Reference	5	2.09%	
3B – Tense/Aspect	41	17.08%	
Dimension 4 – Presentation	12	5%	0
Total	240	100%	10

Red Cards are few in numbers, which are amounted to only 4.16% of the total inaccuracies. It means that the inaccuracies made by H3 subjects in their L2 writing are not serious and that the message is successfully conveyed to the readers as intended.

(1) Intra-sentential Dimension

Along the intra-sentential dimension of their L2 (English) writing, H3 subjects have a considerable number of inaccuracies in sentence construction which cover all types defined in the Micro Index Schema.

In the L2 (English) writing, in contrast to their L1, H3 subjects have more inaccuracies in omission than in redundancy. H3 subjects do not have an adequate control to form complete sentences in L2; they tend more to omit necessary constituents than to include unnecessary ones.

Specifically, the most frequently omitted items include conjunctions, determiners and prepositions. The most commonly omitted conjunctions by H3 subjects are the coordinator “and” before the last item of a long series; but on the other hand, “and” is also redundantly used to result in run-on sentences.

Determiners are also often omitted, in particular the definite article “the” preceding singular and plural nouns when the noun is particular or specific; and with uncountable nouns that are made more specific by a limiting modifying phrase or clause.

Prepositions are frequently omitted while sometimes used redundantly. In English, most prepositions are used to express spatial relations (both directions and

locations) and to form idiomatic verb phrases. But in Chinese, prepositions are not often immediately linked to the verbs of actions; and the phrasal verbs are fewer in Chinese. As seen from the following examples, it is possible that the omissions and redundancies of prepositions in L2 are related to L1 transfer.

(a) *Omitted prepositions:*

1. * I could not think ^ any solution. (B1)
2. * I had arrived ^ the top of the hill. (B4)

(b) *Redundant prepositions:*

1. * When I went back ~~to~~ home,... (B27)
2. * The boys started to light up the fire and the girls prepared ~~for~~ the food. (B33)

On the vertical dimension, H3 subjects in general follow the rules governing the morphology of different parts of speech. They have shown an adequate control to use different grammatical groups. The confusion on homomorphs (e.g. fast, criminal, intellectual, and etc.), that have more than one grammatical characteristic, is not evident.

Most inaccuracies on the vertical dimension are related to nouns. H3 subjects have yet mastered under what conditions should plural nouns be used. Also, nouns are often misused as adjectives to pre-modify another noun, and/or pre-modified by the intensifier “very” or “more”. For example,

1. * It was very noise. (B2)
2. * The clouds became darkness and the sun was not shine now. (B15)

H3 subjects have the major weakness on the linear dimension. As shown in the following examples, problems are found in the morphologies of verb forms (especially those relating to bare and to infinitives), subject-verb agreements and verb voices. H3 subjects lack control in the morphological transformation of English that the linear agreements of sentence constituents are often violated. On the other hand, H3 subjects do not have many problems with word order and that they show an adequate control in the linear arrangement of sentence constituents.

(a) *Verb forms:*

1. * I would arrived at my destination soon. (B11)
2. * She had to looked after me as I caught a cold. (B12)

(c) *Subject-verb agreement:*

1. * It help me to get dry the clothes. (B1)
2. * He said that he haven't finished his homework yet, his mother disagreed let him went. (B7)

(d) *Active/passive voice:*

1. * When I was walking on the hill, I caught in a heavy shower of rain. (B4)
2. * The sky was begun to rain. (B7)

The lexical dimension is the second major weakness in L2 of H3 subjects. The foci of lexical accuracy are the use and form of lexical items and collocations. The richness of vocabulary is not measured. But most H3 subjects are successful to involve the readers enough to actually visualize the things being described. But

some H3 subjects showed relatively weak control over the use of common words that sound alike and over the use of prepositions and verbs, as shown in the following examples:

(b) Similar words:

1. * That day was a shiny day. (B13)
2. * On the mothers' day, mother should have no need to do anything in the flat. (B12)

(e) Prepositions:

1. * The destination was a hill after my house. (B4)
2. * I ...absent for school for a week. (B11)

(f) Verbs:

1. * It was such a heavy shower of rain that wet through my whole body and suffered me a bad cold. (B16)
2. * The rain pretended to become smaller. (B24)

(2) Inter-sentential Dimension

Along the inter-sentential dimension, most H3 subjects write clearly and cohesively. They write short, direct simple sentences, mainly in active voice. However, the sentence variety is not sophisticated. The most common sentence varieties are coordination and subordination, using coordinators “before”, “when”, “while”, “as”, “since” and subordinator “that”. Participles and prepositional phrases to

subordinate the main clause are uncommon. Despite the lack of sentence variety, there is no interruption of main clauses. Therefore, in general, H3 subjects write concisely in their L2. The details are consistent and coherent. They also use transitional words or phrases like “by now”, “later”, “suddenly” and so on, to vary the rhythm of the sentences.

Common inter-sentential inaccuracies are comma splices and run-on sentences, which are partly resulted from “and”-omission. The subjects tend to place a comma where a full stop is required, and where the sentences are not regarded as forming a series.

Another common inaccuracy is the omission of the subordinating conjunction “that” in cleft or pseudo-cleft sentences, which results in sentences with double verbs. “That”-omission indicated that H3 subjects are not very skillful to use the sentence strategies of relativization, the embedding of relative clauses.

H3 subjects also have problems in common sentence patterns in L2, which may be evident of L1 transfer. For instance,

1. * Every mothers should have most of the power, no need to do anything...
(B12)
2. * The clouds was too white that like the milk. (B15)
3. * Our shirts, trousers, socks, all were wet seems could squeeze water from them. (B25)

(3) Textual Dimension

Along the textual dimension, H3 subjects show adequate skills to produce a coherent descriptive text in L2 (English). But many of them have difficulties to control the temporal dimension in English.

Responding to the topic of “Caught in a Heavy Shower of Rain”, most subjects succeed to give a dominant impression in the writing. This focus guides their selection of detail; which is made clear to the reader in the thesis sentence. The major transitions are the sudden downpour in a sunny day and the responses of the subjects towards the unexpected event. Describing this one-time experience, H3 subjects are able to include necessary concrete and sensory details to convey the message. They often make use of emotions to strengthen the dominant impression.

To make a coherent text, H3 subjects have used strategies like repetitions of key terms or phrases, and use of transitional words or connecting devices. However, the repetitions of key terms are done at the expense of conciseness. Unskilled H3 subjects do not use synonyms or pronouns to define old and new information. For instance,

(a) *Repeating key terms or phrases:*

1. Before I had my lunch, I had arrived (sic) the top of the hill. When I was having my lunch, suddenly, it was raining. Since I was having my lunch, I could not tidy up my things as quickly as possible. (B4)
2. Before I saw my house, I saw a huge tree was fired (sic). Suddenly, the tree fell down and blocked my way. So I must climb over the tree to come back my home. After I came back my home, I caught a cold. (B4)

In the first example, Subject B4 repeats the phrase of “having lunch” thrice, but it is unnecessary. In the second example, the same subject is skillful to use the definite article to mark the old information of “a huge tree” in the second sentence. But it is better to use a pronoun in the third sentence to replace “the tree” to avoid wordiness. He/she should have also used a synonym in the fourth sentence to replace “I came back my home” to achieve conciseness and sentence variety.

The few attempts to use synonyms for emphasis and pronouns for connection may be attributed to the subjects’ limited vocabulary and low level of confidence in handling relatively more demanding tasks such as to balance clarity and conciseness by using pronouns and participle phrases.

(b) *Use of transitional words or phrases:*

The writing topic of “Caught in a Heavy Shower of Rain” prompts the writers to provide both objective and subjective descriptions; the objective descriptions of the rain and the road scenes and the subjective descriptions of personal experiences under the pour. The majority of H3 subjects show adequate skills to play with the details and organize them in a coherent and meaningful way.

The essays of Subject B17 and Subject B20 are given a score Point of 5 in the Macro Scoring Exhibits 4.6 and 4.7. They use temporal and location markers or phrases as transitional devices to guide the readers along. They also attach personal responses along or following the descriptions of the changing weather.

Exhibit 4.6. Paragraphs of L2 Essay by Subject B17

Paragraph	Topic line
Introductory	"Last Sunday, the weather was very good."
Body #1	"In the early morning, we met at the bus station near the beach..."
Body #2	"On the beach, there were swarmed with people..."
Body #3	"Suddenly, the sky became gloomy..."
Body #4	"About twenty minutes later, the rain stopped..."
Body #5	"When night (sic) falls, we rushed to catch a bus home."
Concluding	"When I cam home, I had a bad cold."

Exhibit 4.7. Paragraphs of L2 Essay by Subject B20

Paragraph	Topic line
Introductory	"Today is Monday, but I'm not at school..."
Body #1	"Last Saturday morning, I wanted to go to a court to watch a football match."
Body #2	"But when I went to the court, it became darker and darker..."
Body #3	"Suddenly, a drop of rain dropped on my head..."
Concluding	"The next day, I got a temperature."

While not many H3 subjects have problems on the dimensions of coherence and reference, over 70% of H3 subjects have problems in the use of appropriate verb tenses in L2 writing. They have not mastered the temporal relations and the grammatical constructions attached to the changes in time in English.

The essay topic prompts the subjects to describe a past event and thus solicits an extensive use of past tense. However, as shown in the following examples, the subjects use the present tense to relate past events. The use of tense is also inconsistent. They use past and present tense interchangeably regardless of the

temporal conditions. They also have problems to indicate the aspects of actions by using present or past participles.

(a) *Verb tense*

1. * Before I started the journey, the weather is very good. (B1)
2. * Since Ivy hates cloud sky, she was quite annoyed. (B8)

(b) *Verb aspect*

1. * At the same time I heard many people screamed. (B29)
2. * ...it really rained and very heavy, just like some ... dropped from the sky.
(B5)

(4) Presentational Dimension

In the presentational dimension, H3 subjects show good control in the dimension of mechanics in L2 writing. In general, the presentations, including handwritings, of H3 subjects in L2 are careful, neat and formal. Indentations are done properly. Only a few incidences of misspellings and homophones are found.

2. Micro Bilingual Writing Performance of M3 subjects

a) L1 (English)

The outcomes of the analysis based on the Micro Index are better than that based on the Macro Index. The Micro Index analysis (see Appendix 6) shows that the quality of control of M3 subjects over their L1 is good. M3 subjects show good control over sentence construction, sentence linking and textual development.

They appear to have mastered to a great extent the vertical and linear dimensions of linguistic construction in L1. Some problems are found along the inter-sentential dimension, but they are not serious. Similar to the L1 of H3 subjects, the only area where the quality of control is relatively weak is the presentational dimension, particularly the spellings and use of homophones.

According to Table 4.7, specifically there are a total of 101 instances of inaccuracies in 20 pieces of L1 (English) writings (1674 words) of the M3 subjects. On average, there are 5 inaccuracies in each piece of L1 writing.

The inaccuracies cover all the dimensions identified by the Schema albeit not in the same proportions. 50.5% of the inaccuracies are Type 4/presentational inaccuracies; 11.88% are Type 2/inter-sentential inaccuracies. Other types of inaccuracies are therefore of relatively small percentages. Type 3B/tense and aspect has the fewest inaccuracies (1.98%). Most Type 4 inaccuracies made are misspellings.

Table 4.7. Classification of Inaccuracies in the L1 (English)**Writings of M3 Subjects**

Dimensions/Types of Inaccuracies	L1 (English)		
	I	I%	R
Dimension 1 - Intra-Sentence	32	31.68%	0
1A – Omission	7	6.93%	
1B – Redundancy	7	6.93%	
1C – Vertical	7	6.93%	
1D – Linear	5	4.95%	
1E – Lexical	6	5.94%	
Dimension 2 - Inter-Sentence	12	11.88%	2
2 – Structural	12	11.88%	2
Dimension 3- Textual	6	5.94%	0
3A – Coherence & Reference	4	3.96%	
3B – Tense/Aspect	2	1.98%	
Dimension 4 – Presentation	51	50.50%	4
Total	101	100%	6

Red Cards are few in numbers, which are amounted to only 5.94% of the total inaccuracies. It means that the inaccuracies made by M3 subjects in their L1

writing are not serious and that the message is successfully conveyed to the readers as intended.

(1) Intra-sentential Dimension

M3 subjects show a satisfactory performance along the intra-sentential dimension. Only a few inaccuracies are found in each of the types.

In the L1 writing, M3 subjects have not many inaccuracies in both omission and redundancy. They have a good control to include and exclude appropriate sentence constituents to form complete and grammatical sentences.

Although the number of inaccuracies are not sufficient to warrant a generalization, it can be noted that the most frequently omitted and redundant items found in the L1 writing are prepositions, especially those used to denote time such as “^ (at) 8:00am”, “^ (in) a week”, and those used for the noun class such as “intervene ~~with~~”. It is also noted that M3 subjects often write redundantly the phrasal expressions which might be acceptable in the spoken form. For instance,

1. * ~~To me~~ my ~~personal~~ opinion is that you job should never interfere with your very important and essential school work. (C12)
2. * In my opinion, ~~I feel that~~ parttime jobs only put stress on teenagers. (C19)

M3 subjects also have a good control on both the vertical and linear dimensions. While the vertical dimension concerns mainly with the subjects' knowledge of the grammatical groups, M3 subjects show no problems in this aspect. Most vertical inaccuracies are the use of singular nouns in generic cases.

The linear inaccuracies are also few. M3 subjects have few problems to agree subjects and verbs and agree the numbers in English.

On the lexical dimension, M3 subjects have adequate ability to choose the appropriate words that no serious inaccuracies are found.

(2) Inter-sentential Dimension

Along the inter-sentential dimension, M3 subjects have shown adequate skills to increase sentence variety by using strategies like coordination, subordination, and use of relative pronouns, participles and prepositional phrases. Sentence clarity is also evident that M3 subjects often use active voice and action verbs over forms of “be”, and seldom use noun forms of verbs or multiple negatives.

The major inaccuracies found along this dimension are the misuse of relative pronouns in subordinate clauses; and the sentence construction in reported speech. M3 subjects tend to overuse the relative pronoun “that” in cases where a better choice is available (e.g. who/which), probably because they often use “that” in spoken form. Also, as shown in the following examples, they tend to write in similar ways as they speak that they often ignore the rules in writing reported speech.

1. * ... he/she should think about the outcome in the end Will it be positive or negative. (C17)
2. * I am writing on behalf of the subject of teenagers and parttime jobs, do they affect our success in school. (C19)

These inaccuracies on the inter-sentential dimension do not affect significantly the message to be conveyed. The readers should have no problems to understand the message despite the inappropriate use of relative pronouns and the “direct speech” without quotation marks.

(3) Textual Dimension

Along the textual dimension, writing on the topic of “High School Students and Part time Jobs”, M3 subjects have shown adequate skills to organize the argumentative text into a formal format, with a thesis statement in the introductory paragraph, supporting evidences in the body paragraphs and a conclusion or summary in the concluding paragraph. As shown in the following examples (Exhibits 4.8 and 4.9), Subjects C18 and C19 are exemplary to offer a clear format and a logical flow of arguments.

Exhibit 4.8. Paragraphs of L1 Essay by Subject C18

Paragraph	Topic line
Introductory	“There are many people who believe that part-time jobs affect students in a negative way. As far as I’m concerned, they’re right.”
Body #1	“First of all, in my opinion, students already have enough stressing work.”
Body #2	“Second, recent studies show that part-time jobs have a negative effect on student’s (sic) health.”
Concluding	“In conclusion, ... the only advantages are the money and experience of working in a working environment. But the negatives outnumber the positives.”

Exhibit 4.9. Paragraphs of L1 Essay by Subject C19

Paragraph	Topic line
Introductory	"In my opinion, I feel that part time jobs only put stress on teenagers."
Body #1	"Firstly, between friends, hobbies and school, a teenager's schedule is already hectic."
Body #2	"Secondly, with all the stress and loss of time, students never get to sit and have a good healthy meal, which puts their health in jeopardy."
Concluding	"In conclusion, I feel that part time jobs are a waste of time and teenagers should live their childhood. A job brings a salary but..."

To make a coherent text, H3 subjects have used strategies like repeating key terms or phrases, and use of transitional words or connecting devices. Subject C18 repeats the use of key term, "negative" (effects), in the introduction and conclusion. Subject C19 repeats the use of key terms, "stress", "time" and "teenagers" throughout the writing and make cases of them. This repetition of key terms enables the readers to focus and follow along easily. They also use transitional words, like "firstly", "secondly", "in conclusion" to make a coherent text. Other subjects use "personally", "first of all", "finally" and so on to link up the paragraphs.

Discourse wise, Subject C18 and Subject C19 provide a clear thesis statement in the introductory paragraphs. They use two body paragraphs to support the arguments against the notion of high school students doing part time jobs. In the conclusion, both subjects are skillful to provide a counter-evidence to augment their argument and reiterate the thesis statement in an affirmative tone.

However, although most M3 subjects follow the format of writing argumentative texts, not few of them fail to achieve discourse coherence, that is to tie the sentences, ideas, and details together clearly and lead readers to follow along easily.

The problems of discourse incoherence for these M3 subjects are attributed to the failure to give one, dominant impression; the absence (or infrequent use) of argument indicators and premise indicators. They are sometimes illogical in their argument. The shortness in length is also a factor.

About a quarter of the subjects fail to give a focused argument. As shown in the examples below (Exhibits 4.10 and 4.11), Subject C4 and Subject C17 are two of those who at the same time argue for and against the thesis by giving similarly convincing evidence. The readers are therefore not clearly informed of the writers' view on the issue.

Exhibit 4.10. Paragraphs of L1 Essay by Subject C4

Paragraph	Topic line
Introductory	"I think that a part time job has it's (sic) pros and cons."
Body #1	"First of all, you make money... A con, is that you loose (sic) time to sleep..."
Body #2	"Secondly, I feel that it's also the responsibility of the part time employee to check his time."
Concluding	"In conclusion, if the person decides to have a part time job, loose sleep and be cranky all day at school it's his/her choice."

Exhibit 4.11. Paragraphs of L1 Essay by Subject C17

Paragraph	Topic line
Introductory	"I have very mixed thought about this subject (Part Time Jobs affect Secondary School Work & Sleep of Teenagers). Think teenagers should and shouldn't have part time jobs."
Body #1	"First, getting a part time does affect school work somewhat and the amount of sleep a teenager gets. However, getting a part time job trains you how to handle and budget your money."
Body #2	"Second, if a teenager wishes to get a part time job he/she should think about the outcome in the end."

Concluding	“My main point of this letter is to say that teenagers should really really (sic) think hard about getting a job.”
------------	--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Subject C4 and Subject C17 give both negative and positive premises on the issue, but not reaching a conclusion based on the evaluation of them. Subject C4's concluding paragraph appears to be against the notion of working part time but this conclusion is not deduced from the arguments aforementioned. Subject C17's concluding paragraph is similarly not resulted from the line of arguments, but an abrupt end to the writer's struggle on the issue. Strictly speaking, the nature of these writings is largely reflective, not argumentative.

Some subjects are not firm in their arguments. Because of the poorly established standpoint, use of argument indicators and premise indicators to make a strong case is infrequent. Common argument indicators used to state writers' propositions include “should”, “must”, “ought”, “necessarily” and so on. Common premise indicators used to introduce a piece of evidence to support an argument include “since”, “because”, “for”, “as”, “for the reason that” and so on. M3 subjects seldom use these indicators, but often use the conditional “if-clause” to offer possibilities, not propositions.

Also, without a dominant focus in an argumentative text, the selection of details would be problematic for the unskilled young writers, especially in only 100-200 words. Some subjects are weak at the logical development of arguments.

Subject C8 offers an example of logical weakness. In the introductory paragraph and the body paragraphs, Subject C8 (see Exhibit 4.12) attempts to argue

in favour of the notion of students working part time. However, he/she writes to conclude with a rhetorical question, “When are people going to learn to live their life slow and not rush into the working world?”, the tone of which question is in fact challenging the students working part time and the subject is after all arguing against the notion. Most readers would find the peculiar logic confusing.

Exhibit 4.12. Paragraphs of L1 Essay by Subject C8

Paragraph	Topic line
Introductory	“In my advice part time jobs are good in certain cases.”
Body #1	“First of all I think that Parttime jobs can be very good in some cases.”
Body #2	“Secondly, I think that there are certain students who can handle it.”
Concluding	“In conclusion I would like to say that if kids are trying to grow up too fast and have jobs then they should able (sic) to deal with the consequences. When are people going to learn to live their life slow and not rush into the working world?”

(4) Presentational Dimension

Similar to H3 subjects in their L1 writing, M3 subjects are also the weakest in the presentational dimension. Half of the inaccuracies made in the L1 writing of M3 subjects are misspellings, homophones and layout problems (e.g. capitalization, indentation, and etc.). It appears that M3 subjects are not very careful and attentive in completing the writing tasks in their L1.

Misspellings like * *believ* or * *bettween* may be resulted from inconsistent and incongruent match in English phonics (matching of spelling and sounds). Homophone confusions are frequent that M3 subjects mix up the word pairs that sound alike. They also have problems in the use of apostrophes. For instance,

(a) *Misspellings:*

1. * ...you have time to eat propary (properly) and do your work. (C8)
2. * The teechers (teachers) could give you less homework. (C9)
3. * He was in air cadets but unfortanatlly (unfortunately) he had to quit too. (C10)

(b) *Word pairs that sound alike:*

1. * ... both teens and parents should take part in the decision in weather (whether) or not the teen should get a job... (C7)
2. * They good bye (could buy) themselves their own stuff and they could save up their own money for what ever they want. (C9)
3. * ...their (there) is bearylly (sic) any time to do their homework. (C16)

(c) *Use of apostrophes:*

1. * When the puck is dropped at center ice, we will see who's (whose) sport it is. (C2)
2. * About 25% of high school student's (students) actually have part-time jobs and only 5% are suffering academicaly. (C11)

3. * ... they will be tired and wont (sic) do they're (their) school work properly...
(C13)

b) L2 (French)

The outcomes of the analysis based on the Micro Index largely match that based on the Macro Index. The Micro analysis (see Appendix 7) shows that M3 subjects are relatively weak along the intra-sentential dimension, though they show a good control over the inter-sentential dimension well as the textual dimension. The samples are written cohesively and coherently. Specifically there are a total of 323 instances of inaccuracies in 20 pieces of L2 (French) writings (1867 words) of M3 subjects. On average, there are 16 inaccuracies in each piece of L1 writing. Among the four sets of writings, M3 subjects' L2 writings have the greatest average number of inaccuracies.

According to Table 4.8, the inaccuracies occurred at all the dimensions identified by the Schema and are evenly spread across its types. The major types of inaccuracies are Type 1E/lexical inaccuracies (27.41%), Type 4 (22.43%) and Type 1D/linear inaccuracies (16.83%). Type 1C/vertical inaccuracies (10.28%) and Type 1A/omission inaccuracies (11.21%) are also significant. Fewer instances of inaccuracies are found in Type 1B/redundancy (1.87%), Type 3A/cohesion and reference (1.87%) and Type 3B/tense and aspect (1.56%).

Table 4.8. Classification of Inaccuracies in the L2 (French)**Writings of M3 Subjects**

Dimensions/Types of Inaccuracies	L2 (French)		
	E	I%	R
Dimension 1 – Intra-Sentence	217	67.60%	6
1A – Omission	36	11.21%	2
1B – Redundancy	6	1.87%	
1C – Vertical	33	10.28%	
1D – Linear	54	16.83%	
1E – Lexical	88	27.41%	4
Dimension 2 – Inter-Sentence	21	6.54%	4
2 – Structural	21	6.54%	4
Dimension 3 – Textual	11	3.43%	0
3A – Coherence & Reference	6	1.87%	
3B – Tense/Aspect	5	1.56%	
Dimension 4 – Presentation	72	22.43%	1
Total	321	100%	11

Most Type 1E/lexical inaccuracies are borrowed words from L1 (English).

M3 subjects also show a lack of control in making agreements with subjects, verbs

and adjectives in terms of genres and numbers. A low percentage of Type 3B/tense and reference inaccuracies is found but this might be a function of avoidance strategies commonly adopted by L2 learners rather than an indication of good quality control.

Red Cards are few in numbers, which are amounted to only 3.42% of the total inaccuracies. It means that the inaccuracies made by M3 subjects in their L2 writing are not serious and that the message is successfully conveyed to the readers as intended.

(1) Intra-sentential Dimension

Along the intra-sentential dimension of their L2 (French) writing, M3 subjects have a considerable number of inaccuracies in sentences construction which occupied all types defined in the Micro Index Schema.

M3 subjects have far more inaccuracies in omission than in redundancy. They do not have an adequate control to form complete sentences in L2; they tend more to omit necessary constituents than to include unnecessary ones.

Specifically, the most frequently omitted items include determiners and prepositions. The particle “ne” in negative constructions of “ne...pas” is also often omitted. It may be because in colloquial French (Québécois) that “ne” can be omitted, the subjects tend to leave this particle out in writing.

Determiners are often omitted, in particular the definite article “le”, “la” and “les” preceding singular and plural nouns when the noun is particular or specific (example 1). Also, some M3 subjects fail to appreciate the rule that there are no

“shared” use of determiner (example 2) in French that they have to attach a determiner separately in a string of nouns. It is necessary that M3 subjects have to un-learn the use of determiners in their L1 (English) when they learn the corresponding use in L2 (French).

1. * J’ai toujours des bonnes notes en ^ (l’) école.³³ (D14)
2. * On manque d’informations pour des examens ou ^ (des) tests.³⁴ (D2)

Prepositions are frequently omitted in particular the preposition “de” preceding nouns and verbs. Prepositions should also be directly attached to the nouns and not be shared among a string of nouns.

On the vertical dimension, M3 subjects in general follow the rules governing the morphology of different parts of speech in L2. There are only a few cases that the verbs are used as adjectives or nouns, while the mix-up may have more to do with misspellings than vertical confusion. They have shown an adequate control to use different grammatical groups.

Over half of the vertical inaccuracies are related to gender that M3 subjects confused masculine nouns with feminine ones; and failed to match appropriate determiners (i.e. “le” preceding masculine nouns and “la” preceding feminine ones). For native speakers of French, as they are gender sensitive, the nouns are learnt together with the determiners as units. It seems natural to them that apple is

³³ English translation: “I always get good grades at school.”

³⁴ English translation: “One forgets the information for examinations or tests.”

feminine as “la pomme”³⁵, pen is masculine as “le stylo”³⁶, and so on. But for L2 learners of French, they have to first learn the equivalence.

M3 subjects are relatively weak on the linear dimension. They use correct tenses but they have not mastered the morphological transformation of verbs when the numbers of subjects change. As shown in the following examples, problems are found in the morphologies of verb forms, subject-verb and subject-adjective agreements. In particular, M3 subjects lack control in the morphological transformation of French when the subjects are plural. On the other hand, M3 subjects have not many problems in word order, that they showed adequate control in arranging the sentence constituents linearly.

(c) *Verb forms:*

1. * ... parce-ce que il n'est pas capable de balance le devoir et la traivaille a temp partiel³⁷(D6)
2. * Les élèves peux faire ce qu'ils décides de...³⁸(D15)

(a) *Subject-verb agreement:*

1. * Des études recents montre que...³⁹(D19)

³⁵ English translation: “the apple”

³⁶ English translation: “the pen”

³⁷ English translation: “...because he is not capable to balance the homework and the part time job...”

³⁸ English translation: “The students can do what they decide...”

³⁹ English translation: “Some recent studies show that...”

2. * La mal alimentation peuvent...⁴⁰ (D16)

(b) *Subject-adjective agreement:*

1. * car ils sont stressé...⁴¹ (D19)
2. * Il y a plus en plus de professeurs qui sont inquiet des études...⁴²(D9)

For M3 subjects, the lexical dimension is the weakest area in their L2 writing, which accounts for about 40% of the total intra-sentential inaccuracies. It is observed that they misuse a wide range of lexical items in constructing sentences. With a limited vocabulary, M3 subjects tend to use simpler and more common words at the expense of preciseness. Some M3 subjects show relatively weak control in the precise use of verbs and use of prepositions, as shown in the following examples. They often borrow similar words from English.

(c) *Verbs:*

1. * Quand ces adultes voient que pas tous les adolescent sont la même, il vont probablement donné les autres jeunes un temps plus facile.⁴³(D3)

⁴⁰ English translation: "The bad nutrition can..."

⁴¹ English translation: "because they are stressful..."

⁴² English translation: "There are more and more teachers who are worried about the studies..."

⁴³ English translation: "If these adults see that not all adolescents are the same, they will probably give other young people an easier time." Subject D3 used the verb "voir" (means "to see" in English) to express the meaning of "to understand (or realize) that not all adolescents are the same...". It is suggested to use "realizent" instead.

2. * Même si je suis fatiguer (sic), j'ai toujours des bonnes notes en école (sic).

⁴⁴(D14)

(d) *Prepositions:*

1. * Les élèves peux faire ce qu'ils décides de faire en ce cas... ⁴⁵(D15)

2. * Je pense que ça dépende sur (de) l'individu. ⁴⁶ (D17)

(e) *Similar words in English:*

1. * Tu peu acheter des choses expensives que les parents n'achèterait pas pour toi. ⁴⁷ (D4)

2. * Son horaire consiste à deux choses, son occupation et sa blonde. ⁴⁸(D10)

3. * Dans mon opinion,... ⁴⁹ (D12)

4. * Le plus vieille enfant... ⁵⁰(D8)

⁴⁴ English translation: "Also I am tired, I always get good grades at school." Subjects D14 should have used a more precise word of "obtiener" (means "to obtain" in English) in French instead of "avoir" (means "to have in English) to express the meaning of "I get good grades at school".

⁴⁵ English translation: "The students can do what they decide in this case..."

⁴⁶ English translation: "I think that it depends on the individual..."

⁴⁷ English translation: "You can buy expensive things that the parents won't buy for you." Subject 4 borrows the L1 vocabularies into their L2 writing. There is not a vocabulary of "expensives" in French, carrying similar meaning in English. In French, "cher(s)" is the word.

⁴⁸ English translation: "Your schedule consists of two things, your job and your blonde (girl friend)." Subject 10 borrows the L1 vocabularies into their L2 writing. "Un occupation" in French does not carry dual meaning as the word in English, which means both a job and the act of possession by military force. In French it only means the latter. "Un travail" should be used instead.

⁴⁹ English translation: "In my opinion..." Subject D12 borrows the A1 syntax into their A2 writing. Subject D12 translates from English to French that he/she writes "in my opinion" as "dans mon opinion", while it should be read as "à mon avis" in proper French.

5. * Ils prennent le fast food le midi parce qu'ils n'ont pas le temps pour faire une dîner nutritif le jour avant.⁵¹ (D16)

(2) Inter-sentential Dimension

Along the inter-sentential dimension, M3 subjects have shown no serious problems. The sentence linking strategies they used in their L2 writing are mainly coordination, subordination, and use of conditional clauses and relative pronouns. They often use active voice and action verbs.

However, it is found that some M3 subjects have employed L1 sentence structures in their L2 writing. The use of L1 structures affected sentence clarity and conciseness. First, in subordination, they sometimes overuse “qui” (means “who” in English) or “que” (means “that” in English) and sometimes use participle or prepositional phrases as subordinate clauses as they do in English. Second, they are unskillful to use expletives in French. For example,

(a) Subordination:

1. * De récentes études démontrent (sic) que la proportions des adolescents et adolescentes qui occupent un emploi varie entre 40 et 70 p. 100, qui montre que plus

⁵⁰ English translation: “The oldest child...”. Subject D16 borrows the A1 syntax into their A2 writing. Subject D8 borrows the A1 syntax into their A2 writing. Subject D8 also makes similar mistake as Subject D12 that he/she directly translates “the oldest child” into “le plus vieille enfant”, which should instead to be written as “l’aîné des enfants”.

⁵¹ English translation: “They take the fast food at night because they don’t have time for having a nutritious dinner the day before.” Subject D16 borrows the A1 syntax into their A2 writing. Subject D16 constructs a time phrase of “the day before” as “le jour avant”. In French, it should be written as “le veille”.

que 50p. 100 des élèves ont une occupation et ils ont une dépréciation dans leurs marques (sic).⁵² (D19)

2. * Les jeunes de l'école secondaire avec un travail à temps partiel...⁵³ (D1)

(b) *Expletives:*

1. * Si son études suffre de a cause de cet travail, ^ le choix ce le travail où son études.⁵⁴ (D1)

2. * Je suis en désaccord avec l'idée que un travail à temps partiel et tout les études peuvent être fait en même temps et passé tout les cours. (D12)⁵⁵

(3) Textual Dimension

- Along the textual dimension, similar to their L1 writing, M3 subjects perform well in the L2 writing. M3 subjects have shown adequate skills to organize the argumentative text into a formal format, with a thesis statement in the introductory

⁵² English translation: "Recent studies demonstrate that the proportions of adolescents and adolescents who work vary between 40 and 70 per cent, who find that more than 50 per cent of students have a job and they have a drop in the marks."

Suggestion: "De récentes études démontrent que la proportion des adolescents et adolescentes qui occupent un emploi varie entre 40 et 70 p. 100. Elles démontrent aussi que plus que 50p. 100 des élèves ont un emploi et que leurs notes baissent en conséquence."

⁵³ English translation: "They young people of secondary school have a part time job..."
Suggestion: "Des élèves secondaire qui travaillent à temps partiel."

⁵⁴ English translation: "If his studies suffer because of the job, the choice is the job or his studies."

Suggestion: "Si ses études souffrent à cause de cet travail, il faut faire de choix entre le travail et ses études."

⁵⁵ English translation: "I disagree with the idea that a part time job and all the students can be done at the same time and passed all the courses."

paragraph, supporting evidences in the body paragraphs and a conclusion or summary in the concluding paragraph. They also use transitional words, like “premièrement”⁵⁶, “deuxièmement”⁵⁷, “en conclusion”⁵⁸ and “finalement”⁵⁹ to lead the readers to locate the premises, arguments and conclusion of the writing. As the rhetoric organization of the L1 and L2 writings of M3 subjects are similar, it is believed that the discussion detailed in previous section would be sufficient to show how M3 subjects organized their L2 texts (i.e. in a way similar to how they do with their L1 texts).

It is also observed that M3 subjects have few problems with the use of tense and aspect in both languages, which are supposed to be problematic for unskilled writers. This may be explained by the “avoiding strategies” employed by the subjects in the use of verb tenses. They avoid using the complicated and unfamiliar tenses like *conditionnelle* or *imparfait* in French by sticking to the “safe” present tense.

(4) Presentational Dimension

Suggestion: “Je suis en désaccord avec l’idée qu’on peut travail à temps partiel et fait tout les études en même temps et passe tout les cours.”

⁵⁶ English translation: “Firstly”

⁵⁷ English translation: “Secondly”

⁵⁸ English translation: “In conclusion”

⁵⁹ English translation: “Finally”

Unlike the L2 (English) of H3 subjects, M3 subjects have a relatively weak control along the presentational dimension in L2 (French). Half of the inaccuracies made in the L2 writings of M3 subjects are misspellings, omission of accents and homophones. Some of them are *les congénères*, the words which are similar in spelling or meaning in both English and French, like “exemple” (Fr)/”example” (Eng). It appears that M3 subjects were not very careful and attentive in completing the writing tasks in their L2.

M3 subjects very often missed the ending –e in words like “examin(e)”, “heur(e)” and the like. But there are no clues to why M3 subjects have made many spelling mistakes in L2, while the L1 influence is not evident. One of the subjects misspelled “malicieux” as *milicieux. If L1 influence is prominent, the subjects should have been able to spell the word correctly, which is spelled “malicious” in English, because of the similarity.

(a) *Misspellings:*

1. * ...j’exprime que c’est le coix (choix)... ⁶⁰(D4)
2. * À mon avis si un adolesen (adolescent) veux... ⁶¹(D5))

(b) *Word pairs that sound alike:*

1. * ...tu peu (peut) acheter des chosses... ⁶²(D8)

⁶⁰ English translation: “I express that it’s a choice...”

⁶¹ English translation: “In my opinion if an adolescent had...”

⁶² English translation: “you can buy the things...”

2. * ...je travail (travaille) seulement sur les fins de semaines...⁶³ (D10)

(c) *Omission of accents:*

1. * si vous etes (êtes) un étudiant...⁶⁴ (D2)
2. * Un etudiant (étudiant) qui travaille...⁶⁵(D3)

3. Statistical Comparison of Micro Writing Performance of H3 and M3 subjects

a) *L1 (Chinese) of H3 subjects vs L1 (English) of M3 subjects*

UNIANOVA is used to compute if there are statistically significant differences in the L1 writing performance between H3 and M3 subjects vis-à-vis the dimensions identified by the Micro Index Schema. It is found that the differences between the numbers of inaccuracies made in each type and dimension, with the essay length as a covariate, are not statistically significant. The statistical insignificance could be attributed to the big difference in the length of the sampled assignments, the lack of unit-size equivalence especially between the Chinese and English languages, the small numbers of inaccuracies in particular types and sample size.

⁶³ English translation: "I work only at weekends..."

⁶⁴ English translation: "if you are a student..."

⁶⁵ English translation: "A student who works..."

b) L2 (English) of H3 Subjects vs L2 (French) of M3 Subjects

UNIANOVA is also used for the L2. It is found that there are statistically significant differences in the writing performance of H3 and M3 subjects in Dimension 1 ($p=0.003$) and Dimension 4 ($p=0.005$). M3 subjects have higher means in both Dimension 1 and Dimension 4. (Note: the higher the statistical means, the more incidences of inaccuracies in that particular dimension).

C. Macro and Micro Indices

The correlation of the Macro index and Micro indices (by the four dimensions of linguistic construction) are computed. No significant correlation is found in the Macro and Micro indices awarded to the same piece of L1 and L2 writings of both H3 and M3 subjects. The strength of the correlation between the two indices for individual performance is very low.

V. CONCLUSION

A. *Bilingual Writing Performances*

The bilingual writing performances of the subjects of this study have been presented. The outcomes of both the first and second languages of secondary school students using L2 as the medium of instruction for three years in Hong Kong and in Canada have been analysed.

The results of the Macro and Micro scorings have shown that the bilingual writing performances of the subjects of Hong Kong and Montréal are comparable. H3 and M3 subjects are able to perform the assigned formal tasks both in their respective L1 and L2 to clearly communicate the ideas and to present them in appropriate formats. Among the four sets of sampled writings, the L2 writings of M3 subjects are in general the least well done.

The Macro results show that the sampled subjects of Hong Kong have a relatively better writing performance in L1 than the counterparts of Montréal. They have a similar Macro writing performance in their L2. The Macro results show that the Hong Kong subjects, after three years of experience in an EMI school, are able to keep up with good writing performance in L1. Over 90% of the students' writings are scored above the average score of Point 4. The L2 writing performance is not as well as their L1, for which about 70% were scored of Point 4 or above in the Macro scoring. The Macro results, on the other hand, show that the Montréal subjects, after three years of French immersion experience, their L1 and L2 writing have attained

a similar level of performance. About 60% of the L1 and L2 writings are scored of Point 4 or above in the Macro scoring.

According to the Micro scoring results, the L1 and L2 writing performance of the two groups are also comparable. For their L1 writings, no significant statistical differences are found in the numbers of inaccuracies made on any of the four dimensions in the Micro Schema. For their L2 writings, no significant statistical differences are found in the numbers of inaccuracies on Dimension 2 and Dimension 3. H3 subjects outperform M3 subjects on both Dimension 1 and Dimension 4.

According to the Micro analyses, the L1 writing performances of H3 and -M3 subjects show similarities and differences. First, both groups have the most number of inaccuracies along Dimension 4. Over half of the inaccuracies in the L1 writings are misspellings, characters in wrong stroke orders, misused punctuation, and other stylistic inaccuracies. It is not known if this tendency to make stylistic errors is due to the assumed mastery of stylistic rules in the teaching and learning of the L1 or the relatively good performance in other dimensions of writing. But it is an area which deserves further attention in the study of L1 writing performance.

Second, at Dimension 1, it is also noted that both groups have more redundancies than omissions in their L1 writing. They have an adequate control to form complete sentences in their respective L1s. They tend less to omit necessary constituents than to include unnecessary ones. They also have good

control in the vertical and linear dimensions. But it should be noted that the requirements of vertical and linear accuracy in the two L1s are not entirely equivalent. The parts of speech and the derivations of root words in the English language do not find much equivalence in the Chinese language. Also, the agreements among sentence constituents in the Chinese language is not as significant in meaning manipulation as those in the English language. Such linguistic differences between distinct languages are normal. In this study, we take such differences into account, at the same time we attempt to focus more on common denominators (i.e. the dimensions) that facilitate inter-lingual comparisons through which assessment of L2 achievement can be conducted in a generic manner. We also give the denominators different weighting (e.g. in affecting understanding or readers' impression) during the assessment so that the differential contribution of the linguistic categories under each dimension to meaning manipulation of the languages concerned has been addressed to some extent.

Third, both groups of subjects have good control at Dimension 2. They use the sentence structures correctly and achieve sentence clarity. But it is found that the H3 subjects tend to use simple sentence structures while M3 subjects show more sentence variety. The major inaccuracies in this Dimension for H3 subjects are the misuse or the omission of conjunctions in sentence-linking. While for M3 subjects, the use of relative pronoun "that" is a major problem.



Fourth, at Dimension 3 in their L1 writings, both groups of subjects show the ability to use various strategies to achieve coherence, like repeating key terms or phrases, use of synonyms, transitional words and parallel sentence patterns.

According to the Micro analyses, the L2 writing performances of the H3 and M3 subjects show more differences than similarities. First, the major inaccuracies of H3 subjects in their L2 writing are found at Dimension 1D and Dimension 3B. They are particularly weak at agreements and verb tenses. M3 subjects have also shown weakness at Dimension 1D, but most of the inaccuracies in the L2 writing are found at Dimension 1E. They are weak at lexical use. They often misuse verbs and prepositions which exhibit their limited vocabulary and probably negative L1 transfer as well.

Second, at Dimension 2, both groups tend to use simple sentence structures. While M3 subjects often use structures similar to their L1, no L1 structures are found in the L2 writings of H3 subjects, which is probably due to the striking differences between the two languages in this particular respect.

Third, at Dimension 3, both groups are able to use various strategies to achieve coherence: use of transitional words and connecting devices. But H3 subjects show relative weakness in the use of verb tenses. On the other hand, H3 subjects perform better than M3 subjects by a large margin along Dimension 4. H3 subjects show the best control of presentational mechanics in their L2 writing among the four sets of writings.

The Micro analyses of the L1 writing samples of H3 and M3 subjects show that they have developed adequate skills in their L1 to choose and organize words and phrases appropriately to communicate an intended meaning according to standard usage. They are also skillful to employ different strategies to achieve sentence variety and textual coherence. The Micro analyses of the L2 writing samples of H3 subjects also show that they have adequate skills to communicate an intended meaning while the incidences of usage not according to standard usage are more frequent than they do in L1. They are particularly weak in the use of appropriate tenses in their L2. Sentence variety is less obvious in their L2 writing while textual coherence is still achieved. M3 subjects are found to frequently write in their L2 not according to the standard usage especially in the dimensions of lexical and linear accuracy, although the intended message can be generally understood.

The findings show that the L2 written skills of the Hong Kong subjects are not compared unfavourably to their counterparts in Montréal who learn in similar bilingual programmes and also have few opportunities to use L2 outside schools. Based on this finding, one may argue that the development L2 writing skills of the Hong Kong subjects may be taken to be normal in the given sociolinguistic context. In fact, in the Micro analyses, the Hong Kong subjects are found to have made fewer average incidences of inaccuracy and fewer varieties of inaccuracies in their L2 than the Montréal counterparts.

The emphasis on linguistic accuracy in Hong Kong may have contributed to the relatively better L2 writing performance of the Hong Kong subjects. Mohan and Lo (1985) have found that sentence-level accuracy in writing is the main concern of the Hong Kong teachers, that “the Hong Kong teachers indicated that their main objective was to teach students how to write correct English and that much time and effort were spent in teaching grammar rules and English usage to meet the requirements of the Hong Kong Certificate of Education English composition examination (p.525). Hong Kong students also indicated that “their learning experiences with English composition in Hong Kong were oriented to accuracy at the sentence level” (*ibid*, p. 527).

B. Construction of Bilingual Norms

This study is one of the earliest attempts to assess the Chinese and English standards of Hong Kong students without using a monolingual frame of reference. The linguistic outcomes of the Hong Kong bilingual subjects are compared to subjects educated in programmes where bilingualism is practised and given top priority.

When the Hong Kong students are compared to the counterparts in similar sociolinguistic and educational contexts, their writing outcomes in both L1 and L2 are as well if not better. It helps to avoid the pitfalls of pitching our expectations on the basis of monolingual norms which may not be appropriate to Hong Kong’s EMI schools. This understanding of the level of L1 and L2 proficiency that students from schools situated in a largely monolingual (L1) environment and employ L2 as a

medium of instruction would normally achieve helps us to formulate practical pedagogy and realistic expectations for language teaching and learning.

It also shows how data from similar programmes situated in similar sociolinguistic environments may help us to formulate proper expectations (i.e. bilingual norms) of linguistic L1 and L2 outcomes of Hong Kong students as well as Montréal students. Educators and parents should bear in mind that "...the chances of a bilingual program being successful depend on the objectives which are set for it" (Macnamara 1972). Only by setting realistic objectives for our students and teachers that we would be able to achieve what we can and to take further steps.

C. *Limitations of the Study*

First, because of the sampling procedures, the sample size and the scope of study, this study is a pilot rather than a representative study. Nonetheless it is believed that this study has managed to provide a measure of bilingual written proficiency attained by students in schools and/or programmes typified by the two sampled schools.

Second, the study is based on only one writing sample in each of the subjects' L1 and L2. The writing submitted may not be representative of one's actual performance. To obtain a better understanding of the L1 and L2 writing performance, it is desirable to analyze more than one writing sample and also various genres of writing. Portfolio assessment is suggested for future studies if time and resources are allowed.

The third limitation is on the instrumentation. In order to facilitate the analysis of bilingual proficiency across language groups, the schema requires further refinement in the scope and depth. In addition, inter-rater reliability in the Macro scoring should be enhanced by using more than one rater in future studies.

Lastly, in the study proficiency is primarily assessed vis-à-vis inaccuracies identified. There is indeed a need to develop a more linguistically-adequate approach to measure bilingual proficiency. According to Wolfe-Quintero, Inagaki, and Kim (1998), the commonest accuracy measure in writing is holistic or impressionistic assessment. Some of the most frequently used tools to study accuracy in writing, T-unit analysis and type/token ratios are highly language specific, that are not fit for cross-lingual assessment.

VI. CITED REFERENCES

- Baker, C. (1988). *Key Issues in Bilingualism and Bilingual Education*. Clevedon (England); Philadelphia: Multilingual Matters.
- (1995). *Policy and Practice in Bilingual Education: A reader extending the foundations*. Clevedon (England), Philadelphia: Multilingual Matters.
- Baetens Beardsmore, H. (1986). *Bilingualism: Basic Principles* (2nd ed.). Clevedon: Multilingual Matters.
- Bibeau, G. (1984) No easy road to Bilingualism. *Language and Society*, 12: 44-47.
- Brimer, M. A. et al. (1985). *The effects of the medium of instruction on the achievement of Form 2 students in Hong Kong secondary schools*. Hong Kong: Joint project of the Educational Research Establishment, Hong Kong Education Department, and University of Hong Kong, Faculty of Education.
- Brown, J. D., and Bailey, K. M. (1984). A Categorical Instrument for Scoring Second Language Writing Skills. *Language Learning*, 34(4), 21-42.
- Canadian Parents for French. 1996. *Immersion Registry 1996*. Ottawa: Canadian Parents for French.
- Carey, S. (1984). Reflections on a Decade of French Immersion. *Canadian Modern Language Review*, 41:2, 246-259.
- (1997). Language Management, Official Bilingualism, And Multiculturalism in Canada. *Annual Review of Applied Linguistics*. 17, 204-223.
- Carson, J. E. and Kuehn, P. A. (1992). Evidence of Transfer and Loss in Developing Second Language Writers. *Language Learning*. 42 (2), June, 157-182.
- Carson, J. E., Carrell, P. L., Silberstein, S., Kroll, B., and Kuehn, P. A. (1990). Reading-Writing Relationships in First and Second Language. *TESOL Quarterly*, 24(2), Summer, 245-266.
- Census and Statistics Department, Hong Kong. (1996) *1996 Population By-census: Summary Results*. Hong Kong: Government Printer.
- Chan, S. D. 陳瑞端 (1996). *生活錯別字*. 香港：中華書局.

- Chan, W. S. (1990). An analysis of errors in Chinese writing by tertiary level students. *Proceedings of the 5th ILE conference*. Hong Kong : Government Printer.
- Cheng, N. L. et al. (1973). *At What Cost?: Instruction through the English medium in Hong Kong schools: A Report for the public*. Hong Kong: Hong Kong University Press.
- Cheung, Y. S. (1984). The Uses of English and Chinese Languages in Hong Kong. *Language Learning and Communication*, 3, 273-283.
- Choi, C. C. (1998). Language Standards: An HKEA Perspective. In Barry Asker (ed.), *Teaching Language and Culture: Building Hong Kong on Education*. Longman. p.184-92.
- Cooper, C. R. (1976). Holistic Evaluation of Writing. In Cooper, C. R., and Odell, L. (Eds.), *Evaluating Writing: Describing, Measuring, Judging*. Urbana, Ill.: National Council of Teachers of English.
- d'Anglejan, Alison. (1985). Multilingualism in the Canadian Context. *Annual Review of Applied Linguistics*. 6. 113-131.
- Darbelnet, J. (1976). Aspects of Canadian French-English Bilingualism. In Gary D. Keller, Richard V. Teschner, and Silvia Viera (Eds.), *Bilingualism in the Bicentennial and Beyond*. Bilingual Press.
- Education Department, Hong Kong. (1997). *Medium of Instruction: Guidance for Secondary Schools*. Hong Kong: Printing Department.
- Edwards, J. (1995). Monolingualism, Bilingualism, Multiculturalism and Identity: Lessons and Insights from Recent Canadian Experience. *Current Issues in Language and Society*, 2(1): 5-37.
- Fishman, J. A. (1989). The Sociology of Bilingual Education. *Language and Ethnicity: in Minority Sociolinguistic Perspective*. Clevedon, Philadelphia: Multilingual Matters.
- Gagnon, L. (1993). Bilingualism cuts deeply into the Canadian psyche. *Globe & Mail*, 10 April.
- Gaies, S. J. (1980). T-Unit in Second Language Research: Applications, Problems and Limitations. *TESOL Quarterly*, 14 (1), Mar, 53-60.

- Genesee, F. (1976). The Suitability of Immersion Programs for all Children' *The Canadian Modern Language Review*, 32: 5, p.494-515.
- (1987). *Learning Through Two Languages: Studies of Immersion and Bilingual Education*. Cambridge, Mass.: Newbury House Publishers.
- Genesee, F., and Stanley, M. H. (1976). The Development of English Writing Skills in French Immersion School Programs, *Canadian Journal of Education*, 1(3), 1-17.
- Genesee, F., Holobow, N., Lambert, W. E., Cleghorn, A., and Walling, R. (1985). The Linguistic and Academic Development of English-speaking Children in French Schools: Grade 4 Outcomes. *Canadian Modern Language Review*, 41 (4): 669-685.
- Halliday, M. A. K. (1998). Where Languages Meet: The Significance of the Hong Kong Experience. In Barry Asker (ed.), *Teaching Language and Culture: Building Hong Kong on Education*. Longman. p.27-37.
- Hammerly, H. (1989). *French Immersion: Myths and Reality*. Calgary, Alberta: Detselig Enterprises Ltd.
- Harley, B. (1989). Transfer in the Written Compositions of French Immersion Students. In Hans-Wilhelm Dechert and Manfred Raupach (eds.), *Transfer in Language Production*. Norwood, N.J.: Ablex Publishing.
- Harley, B., Allen, P., Cummins, J., and Swain, M. (1990). The Nature of Language Proficiency. In B. Harley et al. (eds.) *The Development of Second Language Proficiency*. Cambridge, New York, Port Chester, Melbourne, Sydney: Cambridge University Press.
- Harley, B., and King, M. L. (1989). Verb Lexis in the Written Compositions of Young L2 Learners. *Studies in Second Language Acquisition*, 11: 415-439.
- Hart, D., Lapkin, S., and Swain, M. (1991). Secondary Level Immersion French Skills: A Possible Plateau Effect. In L. M. Malavé and G. Duquette (Eds.), *Language, culture, and cognition: a collection of studies in first and second language acquisition*. Clevedon, Philadelphia: Multilingual Matters. 250-265.
- Ho, Man Koon. 何萬貫 (1998). *Error Analysis of Secondary Students' Writing*. 中學生作文語誤分析 Hong Kong: Chinese University Press.

- Homburg, T. J. (1984). Holistic evaluation of ESL compositions: Can it be validated objectively? *TESOL Quarterly*, 18, 87-107.
- Hong Kong Education Commission (1994). *Working Group on Language Proficiency*. Hong Kong: Hong Kong Government Printer.
- Hunt, K. W. (1970). Recent measures in syntactic development. In M. Lester (Ed.), *Readings in applied transformational grammar*. New York: Holt, Rinehart and Winston. 179-92.
- Johnson, R. K. (1983). Bilingual switching strategies: A study of the modes of teacher-talk in bilingual secondary school classrooms in Hong Kong. *Language Learning and Communication*. 2: 3, 267-285.
- (1991). Teaching and Learning in the English Stream in Secondary Schools: Implications of ECR4. *Institute of Language in Education Journal*. Hong Kong: Education Department, 8: 10-24.
- (1994). Language policy and planning in Hong Kong. *Annual review of Applied Linguistics*, 14, 177-199.
- Kaczmarek, C.M. (1980). Scoring and Rating Essay Tasks. In J. W. Oller and K. Perkins (Eds.), *Research in Language Testing*, Rowley, Mass: Newbury House Publishers. 149-159.
- Krashen, S. (1984). Immersion: why it works and what it has taught us. *Language and Society*, 12 (Winter), 61-68.
- Kvan, E. (1969). Problems of Bilingual Milieu in Hong Kong: Strain of the Two Language System. In I. Jarvie and J. Agassi (Eds.), *Hong Kong: A Society in Transition*. London: Routledge and Kegan Paul, pp. 327-344.
- Lambert, W. (1990). Persistent issues in Bilingualism. In Birgit Harley *et al.* (eds.), *The Development of Second Language Proficiency*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Lambert, W., and Tucker, G. R. (1972). *Bilingual Education of Children: The St. Lambert Experiment*. Rowley, MA: Newbury House Publishers.
- Lapkin, S. (1982). The English Writing Skills of French Immersion Pupils at Grade 5, *The Canadian Modern Language Review*, October: 39(1), 24-33.

- Lapkin, S., and Swain, M. (1984). Final Report on the evaluation of French immersion programs at grades 3, 6 and 9 in New Brunswick. Toronto: The Ontario Institute for Studies in Education. (mimeo).
- Lee, C., Kennedy, G., and Fullilove, J. (1998). Declining standards of written English among Hong Kong secondary school students: Myth or reality? In Edward Li and Gregory James (Eds.), *Testing and Evaluation in Second Language Education*. Language Centre: Hong Kong University of Science and Technology. 163-176.
- Lee, H. M., Chan, W. S., and Ng, F. P. (1992). An analysis of errors in written Chinese made by upper primary school pupils in Hong Kong. In H. M. Lee and K. C. Ho (Eds.), *Achieving and Maintaining Quality in Language Teaching and Learning*. Hong Kong: Institute of Language in Education. 181-197.
- Lee, P. L. M. (1976). Public Examinations go Bilingual for Hong Kong Primary and Secondary Schools. In Robert Lord and Benjamin K. T'sou (eds.), *Studies in Bilingual Education*. Language Centre, Hong Kong: University of Hong Kong.
- (1988). Educational Assessment in a Bilingual Setting in Hong Kong. In Verner Bickley (ed.), *Languages in Education in a Bilingual or Multilingual Setting*. Institute of Language in Education, Hong Kong: Education Department.
- Lee, W. O. (1993). Social Reactions Towards Education Proposals: Opting Against the Mother Tongue as the Medium of Instruction in Hong Kong. *Journal of Multilingual and Multilingual Development*. 14: 3, 203-216.
- Li, C. N., and Thompson, S. (1981). *Mandarin Chinese: a functional reference grammar*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Lloyd, R. (1991). War of Words Misses Point, *South China Morning Post*, Hong Kong 14 May 1991.
- Lord, R. (1987). Language Policy and Planning in Hong Kong: Past, Present and (Especially) Future. In R. Lord and H. N. L. Cheng (Eds.), *Language Education in Hong Kong*. Hong Kong: The Chinese University Press. 3-26.
- Lyster, R. (1987). Speaking immersion. *Canadian Modern Language Review*, 43 (4): 700-717.

- Macnamara, John (1972). The Objectives of Bilingual Education in Canada from an English-speaking Perspective. *The Canadian Psychologist*.
- Mohan, B. A., and W. A. Lo. (1985). Academic Writing and Chinese Students: Transfer and Developmental Factors. *TESOL Quarterly*, 19, 515-534.
- Pawley, Catherine (1985). How Bilingual are French Immersion Students?, *Canadian Modern Language Review*, 41(5): 865-876.
- Picard, A. (1994). Québécois voices. *Globe & Mail*, 31 March.
- Poon, S. K. (1979). An investigation of the language difficulties experienced by Hong Kong primary school leavers in learning Mathematics through the medium of English. In N. L. Cheng (ed.), *Issues in Language of Instruction in Hong Kong*. Hong Kong: Cosmos.
- Poyen, J. (1986). *Core French In Canada: Volume 1: A Survey of Programs*. Ottawa: Canadian Parents for French.
- Purves, A. C. (1984). In Search of an Internationally-Valid Scheme for Scoring Compositions. *College Composition and Communication*, 35, 426-438.
- Quirk, R., S. Greenbaum, G. Leech, and J. Svantvik. (1985). *A Comprehensive Grammar of the English Language*. London, New York: Longman.
- Richards, J. C. (1980). Second Language Acquisition: Inaccuracy Analysis. *Annual Review of Applied Linguistics*, vol. 1: 91-107.
- Richler, M. (1983). Québec: Language problems. *Atlantic*, June, 10-24.
- Rifkin, B., and Roberts, F. D. (1995). Inaccuracy gravity: A critical review of research design. *Language Learning*, 45: 511-537.
- Santos, Terry. (1988). Professors' Reactions to the Academic Writing of Nonnative –Speaking Students. *TESOL Quarterly*, 22 (1) Mar 1988, 69-90.
- Shek, C. K. W., R.K. Johnson, and E. H. F. Law. (1991). Survey of the language policy and practice in 193 Hong Kong secondary schools. *New Horizons*, 32, 1-10.
- Silva, T. (1993). Toward an Understanding of the Distinct Nature of L2 Writing: The ESL Research and Its Implications. *TESOL Quarterly*, 27(4), Winter, 657-677.

- Siu, P. K. (1980). An error analysis of the use of words and sentence structure in Chinese composition. *Chinese University of Hong Kong Education Journal*, 8:2, 9-19.
- (1985). An analysis of knowledge of Chinese characters and words. *Chinese University of Hong Kong Education Journal*. 13:2, 16-20.
- So, D. (1992). Language-based Bifurcation of Secondary in Hong Kong: Past, Present and Future, In K. K. Luke (ed.), *Into the Twenty First Century: Issues of Language in Education in Hong Kong*. Hong Kong: Linguistic Society of Hong Kong.
- (1998). One Country, Two Cultures and Three Languages: Sociolinguistic Conditions and Language Education in Hong Kong. In Barry Asker (ed.), *Teaching Language and Culture: Building Hong Kong on Education*. Longman. p.152-75.
- Stern, H. H. (1978). French immersion in Canada: Achievements and directions. *Canadian Modern Language Review*, 34 (5).
- (1982). French Core Programs across Canada: How can we improve then? *Canadian Modern Language Review*, 39(1), 34-47.
- Swain, M. (1975). Writing Skills of Grade Three French Immersion Pupils. *Working Papers on Bilingualism*, 7, 1-38.
- T'sou, B. K. 鄒嘉彥 (1997) : 《三言、兩語說香港》。 *Journal of Chinese Linguistics*, 25:2. 290-307.
- Tam, P. T. K. (1980). A survey of the language mode used in teaching junior forms in Anglo-Chinese secondary schools in Hong Kong. *RELJ Journal*, 11: 1, 43-60.
- Tse, S. K. 謝錫金 (1995) : 《香港初中學生錯別字研究》。《教育曙光》36期，104-108頁。
- Vann, Roberta J., Meyer, Daisy E., and Lorenz, Frederick O. (1984). Error Gravity: A Study of Faculty Opinion of ESL Errors. *TESOL Quarterly*, 18 (3), Sep 1984. 427-40.
- Vignola, M. J., and Wesche, M. B. (1991). L'écriture en langue maternelle et en langue seconde chez les diplômés d'immersion française (Writing in the Native Language and the Second Language in French Immersion Program). *Études de Linguistique Appliquée*, 82, Apr-June, 94-115.

- Wolfe-Quintero, K., Inagaki, S., and Kim, H. Y. (1998). *Second language development in writing: measures of fluency, accuracy, & complexity*. Second Language Teaching & Curriculum Centre.
- Wong, J. W. P. (1999). Speech by Mr. Joseph W. P. Wong, GBS, JP, Secretary for Education and Manpower at the Motion on "Promoting extensive use of English" to be moved by Hon James TIEN Pei-chun at the Legislative Council meeting on 26 May 1999.
- Yu, F. Y. (1979). A Report on an Assessment of the Standard of English of Pupils in Hong Kong. *Hong Kong Papers in Linguistics and Language Teaching*, 1, 20-37.
- Yu, V. W. S., and Atkinson, P. A. (1988a). An investigation of the language difficulties experienced by Hong Kong secondary school students in English-medium schools. I. The problems. *Journal of Multilingual and Multicultural Development*, 9: 3, 267-284.
- (1988b). An investigation of the language difficulties experienced by Hong Kong secondary school students in English-medium schools. II. Some causal factors. *Journal of Multilingual and Multicultural Development*, 9:4, 307-322.

VII. BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Aaronson, D., and Ferres, S. (1987). The Impact of Language Differences on Language Processing: An Example from Chinese-English Bilingualism. In Peter Homel *et al.* (eds.), *Childhood Bilingualism: Aspects of Linguistic, Cognitive and Social Development*. Hillsdale, N.J.: L. Erlbaum Associates.
- Afendras, E. A. (1998). The Onset of Bilingualism in Hong Kong: Language Choice in the Home Domain. In M. C. Pennington (ed.), *Language in Hong Kong at Century's End*. Hong Kong: Hong Kong University Press.
- Alatis, J. E. (1978). *International Dimensions of Bilingual Education: Georgetown University Round Table on Languages and Linguistics 1978*. Washington D. C.: Georgetown University.
- (1980). *Current Issues in Bilingual Education: Georgetown University Round Table on Languages and Linguistics 1980*. Washington D. C.: Georgetown University.
- Alatis, J. E., and Stazcek, J. J. (1985). *Perspectives on Bilingualism and Bilingual Education*. Georgetown University Press.
- Alderson, J. C., and Beretta, A. (1992). *Evaluating second language education*. Cambridge ; New York: Cambridge University Press.
- Allan, J. P. B., and Swain, M. (eds.) (1984). *Language Issues and Education Policies: Exploring Canada's Multilingual Resources*. Oxford, New York: Pergamon.
- Allison, D., and Cheung, E. (1991). 'Good' and 'Poor' writing and writers: studying individual performance as a part of placement test validation. *Hong Kong Papers in Linguistics and Language Teaching*. 14, 1-14.
- Angelis, P. J. (1979). *The performance of non-native speakers of English on TOEFL and verbal aptitude tests*. Princeton, N.J.: Educational Testing Service.
- Annual Review of Applied Linguistics*, Rowley, MA: Newbury House.
- Arndt, V. (1991). *Writing in first and second languages: contrasts and comparisons*. Hong Kong: City Polytechnic of Hong Kong.

- Asker, B. (1998). (ed.) *Teaching Language and Culture: Building Hong Kong on Education*. Longman.
- Bachman, L. F. (1989). The Development and Use of Criterion-referenced Tests of Language Ability in Language Program Evaluation. In R. K. Johnson (ed.), *The Second Language Curriculum*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Baker, C. (1988). *Key Issues in Bilingualism and Bilingual Education*. Clevedon (England); Philadelphia: Multilingual Matters.
- (1993). *Foundations of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*. Clevedon, Philadelphia, Adelaide: Multilingual Matters.
- (1995). *Policy and Practice in Bilingual Education: A reader extending the foundations*. Clevedon (England), Philadelphia: Multilingual Matters.
- Bardovi-Harlig, K. and T. Bofman. (1989). Attainment of syntactic and morphological accuracy by advanced learners. *Studies in Second Language Acquisition*, 11, 17-34.
- Barnwell, D. (1988). Some Comments on T-Unit Research. *System*, 16(2), 187-192.
- Beatens Beardsmore, H. (1986). *Bilingualism: Basic Principles* (2nd ed.). Clevedon: Multilingual Matters.
- (1993). Multilingual Concepts in the Schools of Europe. In Ulrich Ammon, Klaus J. Mattheier and Peter H. Nelde (eds.), *Sociolinguistica: International Yearbook of European Sociolinguistics*. Tübingen: Max Niemeyer Verlag.
- Beatens Beardsmore, H., and M. Swain. (1985). Designing Bilingual Education: Aspects of Immersion and 'European School' Models. *Journal of Multilingual and Multicultural Development*, 6(1).
- Bhatt, R. M. (1989). Good Mixes and Odd Mixes: Implications for the Bilinguals' Grammar. *Studies in the Linguistic Sciences*, 19(1).
- Bialystok, E. (1991). *Language Processing in Bilingual Children*. Cambridge, New York: Cambridge University Press.

- Bibeau, G. (1982). *L'éducation en Amérique du Nord*. Montréal: Guérin Éditeur Limité.
- (1984). No easy road to Bilingualism. *Language and Society*, 12: 44-47.
- Bickley, V. (ed.) (1988). *Languages in Education in a Bilingual or Multilingual Setting*. Institute of Language in Education, Hong Kong: Education Department.
- Bourhis, R. (ed.) (1984). *Conflict and Language Planning in Québec*. Clevedon, Philadelphia: Multilingual Matters.
- Brimer, A. (1985). *Mathematics Achievement in Hong Kong Secondary Schools*. Centre of Asian Studies: University of Hong Kong.
- Brimer, M. A. et al. (1985). *The effects of the medium of instruction on the achievement of Form 2 students in Hong Kong secondary schools*. Hong Kong: Joint project of the Educational Research Establishment, Hong Kong Education Department, and University of Hong Kong, Faculty of Education.
- Brodkey, D., and R. Young (1981). Composition Correctness Scores. *TESOL Quarterly*, 15 (2), June, 159-167.
- Brodovi-Harlig, K. (1992). A Second Look at T-Unit Analysis: Reconsidering the Sentence. *TESOL Quarterly*, 26 (2), summer, 390-395.
- Brown, G., Malmkjaer, K., and J. Williams. (1996). *Performance and competence in second language acquisition*. New York: Cambridge University Press.
- Brown, J. D., and Bailey, K. M. (1984). A Categorical Instrument for Scoring Second Language Writing Skills. *Language Learning*, 34(4), 21-42.
- Bruck, M., and M. Swain. (1976). Research Conference on Immersion Education for the Majority Child: Introduction. *Canadian Modern Language Review*, 32: 490-93.
- Bynes, H., and M. Canale. (1987). *Defining and developing proficiency: guidelines, implementations, and concepts*. Lincolnwood, Ill.: National Textbook Co.
- Byram, M. (1997). *Teaching and Assessing Intercultural Communicative Competence*. Clevedon, Philadelphia: Multilingual Matters.

- Cairns, A., and C. Williams. (1985). *The Politics of Gender, Ethnicity and Language in Canada*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press.
- California State Department of Education (1984). *Studies on Immersion Education: A Collection for United States Educators*. Sacramento: The Department.
- Canadian Education Association (1983). *French Immersion and School Boards: Issues and Effects*. Toronto: Canadian Education Association.
- Canadian Parents for French (1996). *The CPF Immersion Registry 1996*.
- Carey, S. (1984). Reflections on a Decade of French Immersion. *Canadian Modern Language Review*, 41:2, 246-259.
- (1997). Language Management, Official Bilingualism, And Multiculturalism in Canada. *Annual Review of Applied Linguistics*. 17, 204-223.
- Carroll, B. J. (1980). *Testing communicative performance: an interim study*. Oxford ; New York: Pergamon Press.
- Carson, J. E., and P. A. Kuehn. (1992). Evidence of Transfer and Loss in Developing Second Language Writers. *Language Learning*, June, 157-182.
- Carson, J. E., P. L. Carrell, , S. Silberstein, , B. Kroll, and P. A. Kuehn. (1990). Reading-Writing Relationships in First and Second Language. *TESOL Quarterly*, 24(2), Summer, 245-266.
- Celce-Murcia, M., and Larsen-Freeman, D. (1983). *The grammar book*. Rowley, MA: Newbury House.
- Census and Statistics Department, Hong Kong. (1996) *1996 Population By-census: Summary Results*. Hong Kong: Government Printer.
- Chan, M. (1985). *A Study of Lexical Borrowing From Chinese into English with Special Reference to Hong Kong*. Hong Kong: Hong Kong University Press.
- Chan, S. D. (1996). *生活錯別字*. 香港：中華書局.

- Chan, W. S. (1990). An analysis of errors in Chinese writing by tertiary level students. *Proceedings of the 5th ILE conference*. Hong Kong : Government Printer.
- Chao, Y. R. (1968). *A Grammar of Spoken Chinese*. Berkeley, Los Angeles, London: University of California Press.
- Cheng, N. L. et al. (1973). *At What Cost?: Instruction through the English medium in Hong Kong schools: A Report for the public*. Hong Kong: Hong Kong University Press.
- Cheung, Y. S. (1984). The Uses of English and Chinese Languages in Hong Kong. *Language Learning and Communication*, 3, 273-283.
- Choi, C. C. (1998). Language Standards: An HKEA Perspective. In Barry Asker (ed.), *Teaching Language and Culture: Building Hong Kong on Education*. Longman. p.184-92.
- Clark, J. L. (1992). Why do students need to learn to write in English. In M. Lau & M. Murphy (Eds), *Developing Writing: Purposes and Practices*. Hong Kong: Institute of Language in Education. 7-11.
- Cohen, A. D. (1982). Researching the Linguistic Outcomes of Bilingual Programs. *The Bilingual Review*, May-Aug: 9 (2).
- Coniam, D. (1990). Essay marking: A Comparison of Criterion-referenced and Norm-referenced Marking. *ILE Journal*, 7, 154-165.
- (1994). Developing an ability scale for English across the range of secondary school forms. *Hong Kong Papers in Linguistics and Language Teaching*, 17, 55-62.
- Connor, U. (1996). *Contrastive Rhetoric: Cross-cultural Aspects of Second-Language Writing*. Cambridge, New York: Cambridge University Press.
- Connor, U., and R. Kaplan. (1987). *Writing Across Languages: Analysis of L2 Text*. Rowley, Mass.: Addison-Wesley.
- Cooper, Charles R. (1976). Holistic Evaluation of Writing. In Cooper, C. R., and Odell, L. (Eds.), *Evaluating Writing: Describing, Measuring, Judging*. Urbana, Ill.: National Council of Teachers of English.

- Cooper, Charles R., and L. Odell. (Eds.) (1976). *Evaluating Writing: Describing, Measuring, Judging*. Urbana, Ill.: National Council of Teachers of English.
- Corson, D. (1990). *Language Policy Across the Curriculum*. Clevedon, Philadelphia: Multilingual Matters.
- Crawford, N., and E. K. P. Hui. (eds.) (1991) *The curriculum and behaviour problems in schools: A response to Education Commission Report No. 4* (Education paper 11). Hong Kong: Faculty of Education, Hong Kong University.
- Cumming, Alister H. (1989). Writing Expertise and Second Language Proficiency. *Language Learning*, 39, 1, Mar, 81-141.
- (Ed.) (1994). *Bilingual Performance in Reading and Writing*. Ann Arbor, Mich: Research Club in Language Learning; Amsterdam/Philadelphia: Distributed by John Benjamins Publishing.
- (1998). Theoretical Perspectives on Writing. *Annual Review of Applied Linguistics*. 18, 61-78.
- Cummins, J., and Swain, M. (1986). *Bilingualism in Education*. London, New York: Longman.
- Curriculum Development Committee. (1983). *Syllabuses for Secondary Schools: Syllabus for English (Forms I-V)*. Hong Kong.
- (1990). *Syllabuses for Secondary Schools: Syllabus for Chinese (Forms I-V)* 中學課程綱要：中國語文科(中一至中五課程綱要). Hong Kong.
- Dagenais, D. (1989). *Perceptions and Processes of French and English Writing in a French Immersion Program*. M. A. Thesis, McGill University: Department of Administration and Policy Studies in Education.
- d'Anglejan, Alison. (1985). Multilingualism in the Canadian Context. *Annual Review of Applied Linguistics*. 6. 113-131.
- Darbelnet, J. (1976). Aspects of Canadian French-English Bilingualism. In Gary D. Keller, Richard V. Teschner, and Silvia Viera (Eds.), *Bilingualism in the Bicentennial and Beyond*. Bilingual Press.

- Davies, A. (1982). Follow my leader: Is That What Language Tests Do?. In Y. P. Lee *et al.* (eds.), *New Directions in Language Testing*. Hong Kong: University of Hong Kong.
- Day, E. M., and Shapson, S. M. (1996). *Studies in Immersion Education*. Clevedon, Philadelphia, Adelaide: Multilingual Matters.
- Dickson, P., and Cumming, A. (Eds.) (1996). *Profiles of Language Education in 25 countries: overview of phase 1 of the IEA language education study*. Slough, England: National Foundation for Education Research.
- Diederich, P. B. (1974). *Measuring Growth in English*. National Council of Teachers of English.
- Duran, R. P. (1985). *TOEFL from a communicative viewpoint on language proficiency: a working paper*. Princeton, N.J.: Educational Testing Service.
- Edelsky, Carole. (1982). Writing in a Bilingual Program: The Relation of L1 and L2 Texts. *TESOL Quarterly*, June: 16 (2).
- (1986). *Writing in a Bilingual Program*. Clevedon, Philadelphia, Adelaide: Multilingual Matters.
- Education Commission (1984). *Education Commission Report No. 1*. Hong Kong: Hong Kong Government Printer.
- (1990). *Education Commission Report No. 4: The Curriculum and Behavioral Problems in Schools*. Hong Kong: Hong Kong Government Printer.
- (1994) *The Report of the Working Group on Language Proficiency*. Hong Kong: Hong Kong Government Printer.
- (1995). *Education Commission Report No. 6: Enhancing Language Proficiency: A Comprehensive Strategy (Part 1 and Part 2)*. Hong Kong: Hong Kong Government Printer.
- Education Department, Hong Kong. (1997). *Medium of Instruction: Guidance for Secondary Schools*. Hong Kong: Printing Department.
- Education Journal 教育學報*. Hong Kong: School of Education, Chinese University of Hong Kong.

- Edwards, J. (1994). *Multilingualism*. London and New York: Routledge.
- (1994). Language Policy and Planning in Canada. *Annual Review of Applied Linguistics*, 14: 126-136.
- (1995). Monolingualism, Bilingualism, Multiculturalism and Identity: Lessons and Insights from Recent Canadian Experience. *Current Issues in Language and Society*, 2(1): 5-37.
- Eichler, M. H. (1981). *Developing basic writing skills in English as a second language*. Pittsburgh, Pa.: University of Pittsburgh Press.
- Engber, C. A. (1995). The Relationship of Lexical Proficiency to the Quality of ESL Compositions. *Journal of Second Language Writing*, 4(2): 139-155.
- Erwin, L., and MacLennan, D. (1994). *Sociology of Education in Canada: Critical Perspectives on Theory, Research and Practice*. Copp Clark Longman.
- Evans, Peter. (1992). *Stages of Writing Maturation: Grades 4-12*. Ontario Institute of Studies in Education.
- Evola, J., Mamer, E., and Lentz B. (1980). Discrete Point versus Global Scoring for Cohesive Devices. In J. W. Oller and K. Perkins (Eds.), *Research in Language Testing*, Rowley, Mass: Newbury House Publishers. 177-181.
- Ferris, D. R. (1994). Lexical and Syntactic Features of ESL Writing by Students at Different Levels of L2 Proficiency. *TESOL Quarterly*, 28, 2 summer, 414-420.
- Ferris, M. R., and Politzer, R. L. (1981). Effects of Early and Delayed Second Language Acquisition: English Composition Skills of Spanish-speaking Junior High School Students. *TESOL Quarterly*, Sept: 15(3).
- Fischer, R. A. (1984). Testing Written Communicative Competence in French. *Modern Language Journal*, 68: 13-20.
- Fishman, J. (1967). Bilingualism With and Without Diglossia; Diglossia With and Without Bilingualism. *Journal of Social Issues*, 23(2): 29-38.
- (1982). Sociolinguistic Foundations of Bilingual Education. *The Bilingual Review*, 9(1), Jan-Apr.

- (1989). The Sociology of Bilingual Education. *Language and Ethnicity: in Minority Sociolinguistic Perspective*. Clevedon, Philadelphia: Multilingual Matters.
- Flahive, D. E., and Snow, B. G. (1980). Measures of Syntactic Complexity in Evaluating ESL Compositions. In J. W. Oller and K. Perkins (Eds.), *Research in Language Testing*. Rowley, Mass: Newbury House Publishers. 171-176.
- Flower, L., and Hayes, J. (1985). A Cognitive Process Theory of Writing. In H. Singer and R. B. Ruddell (Eds.), *Theoretical Models and Processes of Reading (3rd ed.)*. Newark, Del.: International Reading Association.
- Freedman, A., Pringle, I., and Yalden, J. (Eds.) (1983). *Learning to write: first language/ second language: selected papers from the 1979 CCTE Conference, Ottawa, Canada*. London, New York: Longman.
- (1995). The Teaching of Writing in English in Canada. *Journal of Asian Pacific Communication*, 6 (1-2): 29-36.
- Froc, M. L. (1995). Error Correction in French Immersion. *Canadian Modern Language Review*, 51 (4): 708-718.
- Fu Schaeffer, Gail. (1979). Bilingual Education in Hong Kong: A Historical Perspective. *Hong Kong Papers in Linguistics and Language Teaching*, 1, 1-9.
- Fu Schaefer, Gail, and Poon, Emma Y.W. (1995). The Teaching of Writing in Hong Kong: Quality Assured or Inferior Product? *Journal of Asian Pacific Communication*, 6 (1): 45-53.
- Gagnon, L. (1993). Bilingualism cuts deeply into the Canadian psyche. *Globe & Mail*, 10 April.
- Gaies, S. J. (1980). T-Unit in Second Language Research: Applications, Problems and Limitations. *TESOL Quarterly*, 14 (1), Mar, 53-60.
- Gardner, R. C. (1983). Learning another language: A true social psychological experiment. *Journal of Language and Social Psychology*, 2, 219-30.
- Garret, P. *et al.* (1992). Differences and Similarities between and within Bilingual Settings: Some British Data. *Language, Culture and Curriculum*, 5 (2).

- Genesee, F. (1976). The Suitability of Immersion Programs for all Children' *The Canadian Modern Language Review*, 32: 5, p.494-515.
- (1987). *Learning Through Two Languages: Studies of Immersion and Bilingual Education*. Cambridge, Mass.: Newbury House Publishers.
- Genesee, F., and Leblanc, M. (1978). *A Comparative Evaluation of Three Alternative French Immersion Programs: Grades 7 and 8*. Montréal: Protestant School Board of Greater Montréal.
- Genesee, F., and Stanley, M. H. (1976). The Development of English Writing Skills in French Immersion School Programs, *Canadian Journal of Education*, 1(3), 1-17.
- Genesee, F., Holobow, N., Lambert, W. E., Cleghorn, A., and Walling, R. (1985). The Linguistic and Academic Development of English-speaking Children in French Schools: Grade 4 Outcomes. *Canadian Modern Language Review*, 41 (4): 669-685.
- Genesee, F. et al. Three Elementary School Alternatives for Learning through a Second Language. *Modern Language Journal*, 73: 3. Fall 1989. 250-63.
- Gibbons, J. (1982). The Issue of The Language of Instruction in the Lower Forms of Hong Kong Secondary Schools. *Journal of Multilingual and Multicultural Development*, 3 (2): 117-128
- (1984). Interpreting the English Proficiency Profile in Hong Kong. *RELJ Journal*, 15 (1): 64-74.
- Gibbons, P. (1991). *Learning to Learn in a Second Language*. Portsmouth, N.H.: Heinemann; Newtown, N.S.W.: Primary English Teaching Association.
- Gleason, Jean Berko (1997). *The Development of Language*. (4th Edition). Boston, London: Allyn and Bacon.
- Gorman, T. P., Purves, A. C., and Degenhart, R. E. (1988). *The IEA Study of Written Composition I: The International Writing Tasks and Scoring Scales*. Oxford, England: Published for the International Association for the Evaluation of Educational Achievement by Pergamon Press.
- Greenberg, K. L., Weiner, H. S., and Donovan, R. A. (eds.) (1986). *Writing Assessment: Issues and Strategies*. New York, London: Longman.

- Grosjean, F. (1985). *Life With Two Languages: An Introduction to Bilingualism*. Cambridge, Massachusetts, London: Harvard University Press.
- (1989). Neurolinguists, Beware! The Bilingual is not Two Monolinguals in One Person. *Brain and Language*, Jan: 36(1).
- Gruter, H. (1992). Case Study Explorations of Second Language Writing Development in Early French Immersion Grade One Students. *Dissertation Abstracts International, A, The Humanities and Social Sciences*, 52, 11, p.38-46.
- Haas, W. (ed.) (1982). *Standard Languages: Spoken and Written*. Manchester, Totowa: Manchester University Press, Barnes and Noble.
- Hakuta, K. (1986). *Mirror of Language: The Debate on Bilingualism*. New York: Basic Books.
- Hale, G. A. (1980). *Effects of item disclosure on TOEFL performance*. Princeton, N.J.: Educational Testing Service.
- Halliday, M. A. K. (1998). Where Languages Meet: The Significance of the Hong Kong Experience. In Barry Asker (ed.), *Teaching Language and Culture: Building Hong Kong on Education*. Longman. p.27-37.
- Halliday, M. A. K., and Hasan, R. (1976). *Cohesion in English*. London: Longman.
- Hamers, J. F., and Blanc, M. H. A. (1989). *Bilinguality and Bilingualism*. New York, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Hammerly, H. (1989). *French Immersion: Myths and Reality*. Calgary, Alberta: Detselig Enterprises Ltd.
- Hamp-Lyons, L. (1990). Second Language Writing: Assessment issues. In B. Kroll (ed.), *Second Language Writing: Research Insights for the classroom*. Cambridge University Press.
- (1995). Rating Nonnative Writing: The Trouble with Holistic Scoring. *TESOL Quarterly*, 29: 759-762.
- Hamp-Lyons, L., and Henning G. (1991). Communicative Writing Profiles: An Investigation of the Transferability of a Multiple-Trait Scoring Instrument Across ESL Writing Assessment Contexts. *Language Learning*, 41 (3), Sep 1991, 337-73.

- Harley, B. (1989). Transfer in the Written Compositions of French Immersion Students. In Hans-Wilhelm Dechert and Manfred Raupach (eds.), *Transfer in Language Production*. Norwood, N.J.: Ablex Publishing.
- Harley, B., Allen, P., Cummins, J., and Swain, M. (Eds.) (1990). *The Development of Second Language Proficiency*. Cambridge, New York, Port Chester, Melbourne, Sydney: Cambridge University Press.
- Harley, B., and King, M. L. (1989). Verb Lexis in the Written Compositions of Young L2 Learners. *Studies in Second Language Acquisition*, 11: 415-439.
- Harris, John. (1993). I see what I mean! Exploring the relationships between writing and learning and learning to write. In N. Bird, J. Harris and M. Ingham (Eds.), *Language and Content*, Institute of Language Education, Hong Kong. 506-17.
- Hart, D., Lapkin, S., and Swain, M. (1991). Secondary Level Immersion French Skills: A Possible Plateau Effect. In L. M. Malavé and G. Duquette (Eds.), *Language, culture, and cognition: a collection of studies in first and second language acquisition*. Clevedon, Philadelphia: Multilingual Matters. 250-265.
- Haugen, E. (1987). *Blessings of Babel: Bilingualism and Language Planning: Problems and Pleasures*. Berlin, New York, Amsterdam: Mouton de Gruyter.
- Henning, G. (1987). *A Guide to Language Testing: Development, Evaluation, Research*. Cambridge, Massachusetts: Newbury House Publishers.
- Hirvela, Alan. (1991). Footing the English Bill in Hong Kong: Language Politics and Linguistic Schizophrenia. *Journal of Asian Pacific Communication*, 2 (1).
- Hirvela, Alan., and Law, E. (1991). A Survey of Local English Teachers' Attitudes toward English and ELT, *Institute of Language in Education Journal*, 8, 25-38.
- Ho, Kwok Keung. (1985). The Paradox of Immersion in a Second Language. *NABE Journal*, Fall 1985: 51-64.
- Ho, Man Koon. 何萬貫 (1998). *Error Analysis of Secondary Students' Writing*. 中學生作文語誤分析 Hong Kong: Chinese University Press.

- Hoffmann, C. (1991). *An introduction to bilingualism*. London, New York: Longman.
- Homburg, T. J. (1984). Holistic evaluation of ESL compositions: Can it be validated objectively? *TESOL Quarterly*, 18: 87-107.
- Hong Kong Education Department. (1998). *Evaluation study on the implementation of medium of instruction grouping in secondary schools (1994/95-1996/97)*. Hong Kong Educational Research Section, Education Department.
- Hong Kong Government (1974a). *Official Languages Ordinance*, no. 10/74. Hong Kong: Hong Kong Government Printer.
- (1974b). *Secondary Education in Hong Kong during the Next Decade*. Hong Kong: Hong Kong Government Printer.
- Hong Kong Papers in Linguistics and Language Teaching*. Hong Kong: Language Centre, University of Hong Kong.
- Hudelson, S. (1989). Writing in a Second Language. *Annual Review of Applied Linguistics*, 9, 210-222.
- Humphreys, G. M. (1995). *Societal and individual bilingualism in Hong Kong: a study of students' use of and exposure to English*. Hong Kong: Department of English, Hong Kong Polytechnic University.
- Hunt, K. W. (1970). Recent measures in syntactic development. In M. Lester (Ed.), *Readings in applied transformational grammar*. New York: Holt, Rinehart and Winston. 179-92.
- (1976) Early Blooming and Late Blooming Syntactic Structures. In C. R. Cooper and L. Odell (Eds.), *Evaluating Writing: Describing, Measuring, Judging*. National Council of Teachers of English.
- Hussey, S. S. (1995). *The English language: structure and development*. London, New York: Longman.
- Ishikawa, S. (1995). Objective measurement of low-proficiency EFL narrative writing. *Journal of Second Language Writing*, 4: 51-70.

Jacobs, H. L. et al. (1981). *Testing ESL composition: a practical approach*. Rowley, Mass.: Newbury House.

Johnson, R. K. (1980). Developmental Complexity in the Syntax of L1 and L2 Speakers of English. In E. A. Afendras (ed.), *Patterns of Bilingualism: Selected Papers from the RELC Seminar on "Acquisition of Bilingual Ability and Patterns of Bilingualism with Special Reference to Southeast Asian Contexts"*, Singapore, April 1979. Singapore University Press for SEAMEO Regional Language Center.

----- (1983). Bilingual switching strategies: A study of the modes of teacher-talk in bilingual secondary school classrooms in Hong Kong. *Language Learning and Communication*. 2: 3, 267-285.

----- (1991). Teaching and Learning in the English Stream in Secondary Schools: Implications of ECR4. *Institute of Language in Education Journal*. Hong Kong: Education Department, 8: 10-24.

----- (1993). *Using English as the medium of instruction*. Hong Kong: Longman.

----- (1994a). Assessment, Examination and the Medium of Instruction. In Joseph Boyle and Peter Falvey (eds.), *English Language Testing in Hong Kong*. Hong Kong: Chinese University Press.

----- (1994b). Language policy and planning in Hong Kong. *Annual review of Applied Linguistics*, 14, 177-199.

----- (1997). The Hong Kong education system: Late immersion under stress. In R. K. Johnson and M. Swain (eds.), *Immersion Education: International Perspectives*. Cambridge, New York: Cambridge University Press.

Johnson, R. K., and Cheung, Y. S. (1992). Reading literacy in Hong Kong. In N. Bird and J. Morris (eds.), *Quilt and Quill: Achieving and maintaining quality in language teaching and learning*. Hong Kong: Institute of Language in Education, 408-419.

----- (1995). *Reading literacy in Hong Kong: an IEA world literacy project on the reading proficiency of Hong Kong students in Chinese and English*. Hong Kong: Department of Chinese and Bilingual Studies, Hong Kong Polytechnic University.

- Johnson, R. K., Shek, C. K. W., and Law, E. H. F. (1993). *Teaching in Hong Kong: Using English as the Medium of Instruction*. Hong Kong: Longman.
- Johnson, R. K., and Swain, M. (1994). From core to content: Bridging the L2 proficiency gap in late immersion. *Language and Education*, 8(4), 211-229.
- (Eds.) (1997). *Immersion Education: International Perspectives*. Cambridge, New York: Cambridge University Press.
- Johnson, W. (1994). *A Canadian Myth: Québec, between Canada and the Illusion of Utopia*. Robert Davies Publishing.
- Jones, R., and Spolsky, B. (1975). *Testing language proficiency*. Arlington, Va.: Center for Applied Linguistics.
- Jorgensen, J. N., Hansen, E., Holmen, A., and Gimbel, J. (eds.) (1988). *Bilingualism in Society and School*. Clevedon, Avon, England; Philadelphia: Multilingual Matters.
- Journal of multilingual and multicultural development*. Avon, Eng.: Tieto Ltd. P1A1J65
- Journal of second language writing*. Norwood, N.J.: Ablex Pub. Corp. PE1128.J68
- Kaczmarek, C. M. (1980). Scoring and Rating Essay Tasks. In J. W. Oller and K. Perkins (Eds.), *Research in Language Testing*, Rowley, Mass: Newbury House Publishers. 149-159.
- Kaplan, R. B. (1966). Cultural thought patterns in intercultural education. *Language Learning*, 16(1), 1-20.
- (1987). English in the Language Policy of the Pacific Rim. In *World Englishes*, Autumn, 6:2, 137-148.
- (1996). Language Policies in English-Dominant Countries: Six Case Studies. In *TESOL Quarterly*, Autumn, 30:3, 626-630.
- Keller, G. D. (1976). Constructing valid goals for bilingual and bidialectical education: the role of applied linguist and the bilingual educator. In Gary D. Keller, Richard V. Teschner, and Silvia Viera (Eds.), *Bilingualism in the Bicentennial and Beyond*. Bilingual Press.

- Kelly, L. G. (1969). *Description and measurement of bilingualism: an international seminar, University of Moncton, June 6-14, 1967*. Toronto: Published in association with Canadian National Commission for UNESCO by University of Toronto Press.
- King, Rex (1994). Historical Survey of English Language Testing in Hong Kong. In Joseph Boyle and Peter Falvey (eds.), *English Language Testing in Hong Kong*. Hong Kong: Chinese University Press.
- Krashen, S (1981). Bilingual education and second language acquisition theory. In *Schooling and Language Minority Students: A Theoretical Framework*. Los Angeles, Calif.: Evaluation, Dissemination, and Assessment Center, California State University, Los Angeles.
- (1984). Immersion: why it works and what it has taught us. *Language and Society*, 12 (Winter), 61-68.
- Kroll, Barbara. (1990). *Second Language Writing: Research insights for the classroom*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- (1998). Assessing Writing Abilities. *Annual Review of Applied Linguistics*, 18, p. 219-240.
- Kvan, E. (1969). Problems of Bilingual Milieu in Hong Kong: Strain of the Two Language System. In I. Jarvie and J. Agassi (Eds.), *Hong Kong: A Society in Transition*. London: Routledge and Kegan Paul, pp. 327-344.
- (1976). Bilingual Education: A socio-psychological perspective. In R. Lord, and B. T'sou (Eds.), *Studies in Bilingual Education*. Hong Kong: Language Centre, The University of Hong Kong. p.24-28.
- Lambert, W. (1974). Culture and Language as Factors in Learning and Education. In A. Wolfgang (ed.), *Education of Immigrant Student*. Toronto: Ontario Institute for Studies in Education.
- (1990). Persistent issues in Bilingualism. In Birgit Harley *et al.* (eds.), *The Development of Second Language Proficiency*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Lambert, W., and Tucker, G. R. (1972). *Bilingual Education of Children: The St. Lambert Experiment*. Rowley, MA: Newbury House Publishers.

- LaPolla, R. J. (1990). *Grammatical Relations in Chinese: Synchronic and Diachronic Considerations*. Berkeley: University of California.
- Language learning: a journal of applied linguistics*. Ann Arbor: Research Club in Language Learning, University of Michigan.
- Language learning and communication: a journal of applied linguistics in Chinese and English*. New York: John Wiley.
- Language testing*. London: Edward Arnold.
- Lapkin, S. (1982). The English Writing Skills of French Immersion Pupils at Grade 5, *The Canadian Modern Language Review*, October: 39(1), 24-33.
- Lapkin, S., Andrew, C. M., Harley, B., Swain, M., and Kamin, J. (1981). The Immersion Centre and the Dual-Track School: A study of the relationship between school environment and achievement in a French immersion program, *Canadian Journal of Education*, 2.
- Lapkin, S., and Swain, M. (1984). Final Report on the evaluation of French immersion programs at grades 3, 6 and 9 in New Brunswick. Toronto: The Ontario Institute for Studies in Education. (mimeo).
- Lapkin, S., Swain, M., Kamin, J., and Hanna, G. (1982). Late Immersion in Perspective: The Peel Study, *Canadian Modern Language Review*, 39 (2): 182-206.
- Larsen-Freeman, D. (1978). An ESL Index of Development. *TESOL Quarterly*, 12(4), Dec, 539-448.
- Larsen-Freeman, D., and Long, M. H. (1991). *An introduction to second language acquisition research*. London ; New York: Longman.
- Larsen-Freeman, D., and Strom, V. (1977). The Construction of a Second Language Acquisition Index of Development. *Language Learning*, 27(1), June, 123-134.
- Laxer, R. M., Jackson, W., and MacDermott, P. (eds.) (1979). *Bilingual Tensions in Canada: A Joint Project of the Ontario Institute for Studies in Education and the Canada Studies Foundation*. Toronto: Ontario Institute for Studies in Education.

- Lee, C., Kennedy, G., and Fullilove, J. (1998). Declining standards of written English among Hong Kong secondary school students: Myth or reality? In Edward Li and Gregory James (Eds.), *Testing and Evaluation in Second Language Education*. Language Centre: Hong Kong University of Science and Technology. 163-176.
- Lee, H. M., Chan, W. S., and Ng, F. P. (1992). An analysis of errors in written Chinese made by upper primary school pupils in Hong Kong. In H. M. Lee and K. C. Ho (Eds.), *Achieving and Maintaining Quality in Language Teaching and Learning*. Hong Kong: Institute of Language in Education. 181-197.
- Lee, P. L. M. (1976). Public Examinations go Bilingual for Hong Kong Primary and Secondary Schools. In Robert Lord and Benjamin K. T'sou (eds.), *Studies in Bilingual Education*. Language Centre, Hong Kong: University of Hong Kong
- (1988). Educational Assessment in a Bilingual Setting in Hong Kong. In Verner Bickley (ed.), *Languages in Education in a Bilingual or Multilingual Setting*. Institute of Language in Education, Hong Kong: Education Department.
- Lee, W. O. (1993). Social Reactions Towards Education Proposals: Opting Against the Mother Tongue as the Medium of Instruction in Hong Kong. *Journal of Multilingual and Multilingual Development*. 14: 3, 203-216.
- Lessow-Hurley, J. (1990). *The Foundations of Dual Language Instruction*. New York, London: Longman.
- Lewis, E. G. (1980). *Bilingualism and Bilingual Education: A Comparative Study*. Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press.
- Li, C. N., and Thompson, S. (1981). *Mandarin Chinese: a functional reference grammar*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Li, D. C. S. (1996). *Issues in Bilingualism and Biculturalism: A Hong Kong Case Study*. New York: Peter Lang Publishing.
- Li, E., and G. James. (1998). *Testing and evaluation in second language education*. Hong Kong: Hong Kong University of Science and Technology, Language Centre.
- Li, X. M. (1996). *"Good Writing" in Cross-Cultural Context*. Albany: State University of New York Press.

- Lim, A. S. E., Gan, L. and Sharpe, P. (1997). Immersion in Singapore preschools. In R. K. Johnson, and M. Swain (eds.), *Immersion Education: International Perspectives*. Cambridge, New York: Cambridge University Press.
- Lindholm, K. J. (1990). Bilingual immersion education: Criteria for program development. In A. M. Padilla, H. H. Fairchild and C. M. Valadez (eds.), *Bilingual Education: Issues and Strategies*. London: Sage 1990
- Linguistics*. The Hague: Mouton.
- Linnarud, M. (1986). *Lexis in Composition: A Performance Analysis of Swedish Learners' Written English*. Malmo, Sweden: CWK Gleerup.
- Littlewood, W. T., and Liu, N. F. (1996). *Hong Kong students and their English*. Hong Kong: English Centre, The University of Hong Kong
- Lloyd, R. (1991). War of Words Misses Point, *South China Morning Post*, Hong Kong 14 May 1991.
- Lo, M. F., G. H. F. Chan, and B. T. C. H. Ip. (1985). *A comparison of academic performance of junior secondary students in Anglo-Chinese and Chinese middle schools*. Hong Kong: Educational Research Establishment, Education Department.
- Lo, T. (1988). Using the Mother tongue as the teaching medium in Hong Kong? But whose? In V. Bickley (ed.), *Languages in education in a bilingual and multilingual setting*. Hong Kong: Institute of Language in Education. 210-219.
- Lord, R. (1987). Language Policy and Planning in Hong Kong: Past, Present and (Especially) Future. In R. Lord and H. N. L. Cheng (Eds.), *Language Education in Hong Kong*. Hong Kong: The Chinese University Press. 3-26.
- Lord, R., and H. N. L. Cheng. (Eds.) (1987). *Language Education in Hong Kong*. Hong Kong: The Chinese University Press.
- Lord, R., and B. K. T'sou. (Eds.) (1976). *Studies in Bilingual Education*. Hong Kong: Language Centre, The University of Hong Kong.
- (1985). *The Language Bomb: The Language Issue in Hong Kong*, Hong Kong: Longman.

- Lowe, P., and C. W. Stansfield. (1988). *Second language proficiency assessment: current issues*. Englewood Cliffs, N.J.: Prentice Hall Regents, 1988.
- Luke, K. K. (Ed.) (1992). *Into the twenty-first century: Issues of language in education in Hong Kong*. Hong Kong: Linguistic Society of Hong Kong.
- Luke, K. K., and J. C. Richards. (1982). English in Hong Kong: Functions and Status. *English World Wide*, 3(1), 47-64.
- Lyon, J. (1996). *Becoming Bilingual: Language Acquisition in a Bilingual Community*. Clevedon (England): Multilingual Matters.
- Lyster, R. (1987). Speaking immersion. *Canadian Modern Language Review*, 43 (4): 700-717.
- (1990). The role of analytic teaching in French immersion programs. *Canadian Modern Language Review*, 47 (1): 159-176.
- (1995). *Instructional Strategies in French immersion: an annotated bibliography*. Canadian Association for Immersion Teachers.
- MacFarlane, A. and M. B. Wesche. (1994). Immersion Outcomes: Beyond Language Proficiency. *Canadian Modern Language Review*, 51 (2): 250-286.
- Mackey, William F. (1962). The Description of Bilingualism. *Canadian Journal of Linguistics*, 7: 51-85.
- (1970). A Typology of Bilingual Education. *Foreign Language Annuals*, 4: 596-608.
- (1977). The Evaluation of Bilingual Education. In B. Spolsky & C. Cooper (Eds.), *Frontiers of Bilingual Education*. MA: Newbury. 226-281.
- Macnamara, John. (1967). The Effects of Instruction in a weaker Language. *Journal of Social Issues*, 23(2): 121-135.
- (1972). The Objectives of Bilingual Education in Canada from an English-Speaking Perspective.

- Magiste, E. (1985). Development of Intra- and Interlingual Interference in Bilinguals, *Journal of Psycholinguistics Research*, 14(2).
- Malavé, L. M., Duquette, G. (Eds.) (1991). *Language, culture, and cognition: a collection of studies in first and second language acquisition*. Clevedon, Philadelphia: Multilingual Matters.
- Mallea, J. R. (1989) *Schooling in a Plural Canada*. Clevedon, Philadelphia: Multilingual Matters.
- Matthews, Stephen, and Virginia Yip. (1995). *Cantonese: A Comprehensive Grammar*. London and New York: Routledge.
- McNamara, T. F. (1996). *Measuring second language performance*. London ; New York: Longman.
- Mohan, B. A., and W. A. Lo. (1985). Academic Writing and Chinese Students: Transfer and Developmental Factors. *TESOL Quarterly*. 19, 515-534.
- Mullen, K. A. (1980). Evaluating Writing Proficiency in ESL. In J. W. Oller and K. Perkins (Eds.), *Research in Language Testing*, Rowley, Mass: Newbury House Publishers. 160-170.
- Nelson, J. E., and J. J. Rebuffot. (1984). A Sociolinguistic Study of Montréal, *Canadian Modern Language Review*, 40(3).
- New horizons in education 教育曙光*. Hong Kong: Hong Kong Teachers' Association.
- Ng, Seok Moi (1994). Report to the Working Group on Language Proficiency on Language Teaching and Bilingual Literacy at Pre-primary and Primary Levels in Hong Kong'. *Education Commission Report No.6*. Hong Kong: Hong Kong Education Department.
- North, B. (1993). *The development of descriptors on scales of language proficiency*. Washington, D.C.: National Foreign Language Center at the Johns Hopkins University.
- Obadia, A., and M. Martin. (1995). French Immersion Teacher Shortage: Seeing the Light at the End of the Tunnel, *Canadian Modern Language Review*, 52 (1): 81-100.
- O'Donnell, R. C. (1976). A Critique of Some Indices of Syntactic Maturity. *Research in the Teaching of English*, 10(1), Spring, 31-38.

- Office of the Commissioner of Official Languages. (1984). *The Immersion phenomenon: English-speaking Canadians come to grips with the country's language duality*. Ottawa, Ont.: Office of the Commissioner of Official Languages.
- Olson, C. P., and G. Burns. (1981). Immersed for Change: Politics and Planning in French Immersion. *Orbit*, 12: 7-14.
- Oltman, P. K. (1988). *Native language, English proficiency, and the structure of the Test of English as a Foreign Language*. Princeton, N.J.: Educational Testing Service.
- Paulson, D. L. (1993). The Effects of Task Focus and L2 Grammatical Knowledge on Writing in Spanish as a Second Language. *Dissertation Abstracts International, A: The Humanities and Social Sciences*, 54, 5, p.1784.
- Paulston, C. B. (1980). *Bilingual Education: Theories and Issues*. Rowley, Mass.: Newbury House Publishers.
- (1983). Problems in the Comparative Analysis of Bilingual Education. In Torsten Husen and Susan Oppen (eds.), *Multicultural and Multilingual Education in Immigrant Countries: Proceedings of International Symposium Held at Wenner-Gren Center, Stockholm, Aug 2 and 3, 1982*. Oxford (Oxfordshire); New York: Pergamon Press.
- (1988). *International Handbook of Bilingualism and Bilingual Education*. New York: Greenwood Press.
- (1992). *Sociolinguistic Perspectives on Bilingual Education*. Clevedon, Philadelphia: Multilingual Matters.
- Pawley, Catherine (1985). How Bilingual are French Immersion Students?, *Canadian Modern Language Review*, 41(5): 865-876.
- Pennington, M. C. (ed.) (1998). *Language in Hong Kong at Century's End*. Hong Kong: Hong Kong University Press.
- Perkins, K. (1980). Using objective methods of attained writing proficiency to discriminate among holistic evaluations. *TESOL Quarterly*, 14: 61-69.

- (1983). On the use of composition scoring techniques, objective measures and objective tests to evaluate ESL writing ability. *TESOL Quarterly*, 17, 651-671.
- Pery, W., and P. Marie. (1991). French and English Passives in the Construction of Text. *Journal of French Language Studies*. 1, 1, Mar, 55-70.
- Picard, A. (1994). Quebecois voices. *Globe & Mail*, 31 March.
- Pierson, H. D., G. Fu-Schaeffer, and S. Y. Lee. (1980). *An analysis of the relationship between language attitudes and English attainment of secondary students in Hong Kong*. Hong Kong: Social Research Centre, Chinese University of Hong Kong.
- Polio, C. G. (1997). Measures of Linguistic Accuracy in Second Language Writing Research. *Language Learning*, 47(1), March, 101-143.
- Poon, S. K. (1979). An investigation of the language difficulties experienced by Hong Kong primary school leavers in learning Mathematics through the medium of English. In N. L. Cheng (ed.), *Issues in Language of Instruction in Hong Kong*. Hong Kong: Cosmos.
- Poyen, Janet. (1986). *Core French In Canada: Volume 1: A Survey of Programs*. Ottawa: Canadian Parents for French.
- Pugh, S. M. (1991). L2 Literacy and Biliteracy: Linguistic Consequences, *Annual Review of Applied Linguistics*, 12.
- Purves, A. C. (1984). In Search of an Internationally-Valid Scheme for Scoring Compositions. *College Composition and Communication*, 35, 426-438.
- (1988). *The IEA Study of Written Composition II: Education and Performance in Fourteen Countries*. Oxford, England: Published for the International Association for the Evaluation of Educational Achievement by Pergamon Press.
- (Ed.) (1988). *Writing Across Languages and Cultures: Issues in Contrastive Rhetoric*. Newbury Park, Beverly Hills, London, New Delhi: Sage.
- Purves, A. C., Gorman, T. P., and Takala, S. (1988). The Development of the Scoring Scheme and Scales. In T. P. Gorman, A. C. Purves, and R. E. Degenhart, *The IEA Study of Written Composition I: The International Writing Tasks and Scoring Scales*. Oxford, England:

Published for the International Association for the Evaluation of Educational Achievement by Pergamon Press.

- Quirk, R., S. Greenbaum, G. Leech, and J. Svantvik. (1985). *A Comprehensive Grammar of the English Language*. London, New York: Longman.
- Raimes, A. (1985). What unskilled ESL students do as they write: A classroom study of composing. *TESOL Quarterly*, 19: 220-258.
- (1991). Errors: Windows into the Mind. In *College ESL*, Dec, 1:2, 55-64.
- Rebuffot, J. (1988). L'immersion en français: l'heure du bilan? *Québec Français: Pédagogie, littérature, langue et société (Dossier pédagogique: l'immersion)*, 70: 23-27.
- (1993). *Point sur l'immersion au Canada*. Centre Éducatif et Culturel inc.
- Richards, J. C. (1974). *Error Analysis: Perspectives on Second Language Acquisition*. Singapore: Longman.
- (1980). Second Language Acquisition: Error Analysis. *Annual Review of Applied Linguistics*, vol. 1: 91-107.
- Richards, S. (1993). *Motivation in second language learning: a Hong Kong perspective*. Hong Kong: City Polytechnic of Hong Kong, Department of English.
- Richler, M. (1983). Quebec: Language problems. *Atlantic*, June, 10-24.
- Rifkin, B., and Roberts, F. D. (1995). Error gravity: A critical review of research design. *Language Learning*, 45: 511-537.
- Rivera, C. (1983). *An Ethnographic/sociolinguistic approach to language proficiency assessment*. Clevedon, Avon, England: Multilingual Matters.
- Romaine, Suzanne (1995). *Bilingualism (2nd edition)*. Oxford, Cambridge, Mass.: Blackwell.
- Rosansky, E. J. (1979). A Review of the Bilingual Syntax Measure, in B. Spolsky (ed.), *Some Major Tests*. Arlington: Center for Applied Linguistics.

- Santos, Terry. (1988). Professors' Reactions to the Academic Writing of Nonnative –Speaking Students. *TESOL Quarterly*, 22 (1) Mar 1988, 69-90.
- Scott, M. S., and G. R. Tucker. (1974). Error Analysis and English-Language Strategies of Arab Students. *Language Learning*, 24(1), 69-97.
- Second language research*. London: E. Arnolds. P118.2S42 (PolyU)
- Seliger, H. W. (1989). *Second language research methods*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Shek, C. K. W., R.K. Johnson, and E. H. F. Law. (1991). Survey of the language policy and practice in 193 Hong Kong secondary schools. *New Horizons*, 32, 1-10.
- Sibayan, B. P. (1991). Becoming Bilingual in English in a Non-English Environment: A Retrospective Essay in Honour of Joshua A. Fishman. In Ofélia Garcia (ed.), *Bilingual Education: Focusschrift in Honour of Joshua A. Fishman on the Occasion of His 65th Birthday*. Amsterdam: Benjamins.
- Siguan, M., and W. F. Mackay. (1987). *Education and Bilingualism*. Kogan Page in association with UNESCO.
- Silva, T. (1993). Toward an Understanding of the Distinct Nature of L2 Writing: The ESL Research and Its Implications. *TESOL Quarterly*, 27(4), Winter, 657-677.
- Silva, T., and C. Brice. (1996). Selected Bibliography of Recent Scholarship in Second Language Writing. *Journal of Second Language Writing*, 5(3), 295-309.
- Singh, R. (1986). Immersion: Problems and Principles. *Canadian Modern Language Review*, 42 (3): 559-571.
- Siu, P. K. (1980). An error analysis of the use of words and sentence structure in Chinese composition. *Chinese University of Hong Kong Education Journal*, 8:2, 9-19.
- (1985). An analysis of knowledge of Chinese characters and words. *Chinese University of Hong Kong Education Journal*. 13:2, 16-20.

- Siu, P. K. *et al.* (1979) *The final report on the effects of the medium of instruction on student cognitive development and academic achievement*. Hong Kong: Chinese University of Hong Kong, School of Education.
- Siu, P. K., and Mak, S. Y. (1989). The effects of change in the medium of instruction from English to Chinese on the academic achievement of students. *Hong Kong Educational Research Journal*, 4: 21-27. (Chinese)
- Smith, W. J. (1995). Education and Language. In *Themes and Traditions in Québec Education: A Source Book for Educators*. Montréal: Office of Research on Educational Policy.
- So, D. (1987). Searching for a bilingual exit. In R. Lord and H. N. L. Cheng (eds.), *Language Education in Hong Kong*. Hong Kong: The Chinese University Press.
- (1989). Implementing mother-tongue education amidst societal transition from diglossia to triglossia in Hong Kong. *Language and Education*, 3 (1), 29-44.
- (1992). Language-based Bifurcation of Secondary in Hong Kong: Past, Present and Future, In K. K. Luke (ed.), *Into the Twenty First Century: Issues of Language in Education in Hong Kong*. Hong Kong: Linguistic Society of Hong Kong.
- (1998). One Country, Two Cultures and Three Languages: Sociolinguistic Conditions and Language Education in Hong Kong. In Barry Asker (ed.), *Teaching Language and Culture: Building Hong Kong on Education*. Longman. p.152-75.
- Spilka, I. (1976). Assessment of Second Language Performance in Immersion Programs, *Canadian Modern Language Review*, 32.
- Spolsky, B. (1989). *Conditions for Second Language Learning: Introduction to a general theory*. Oxford University Press.
- Stern, H. H. (1978). French immersion in Canada: Achievements and directions. *Canadian Modern Language Review*, 34 (5).
- (1982). French Core Programs across Canada: How can we improve then? *Canadian Modern Language Review*, 39(1), 34-47.

- (1986). Second-language Education in Canada: Innovation, Research and Policies. *Interchange*, 17: 41-54.
- Stevenson, R. J. (1988). *Models of language development*. Milton Keynes [England] ; Philadelphia: Open University Press.
- Stripp, M. G., and W. Bellin. (1985). Bilingual Linguistic Systems Revisited, *Linguistics*, 23(1): 123-135.
- Studies in second language acquisition*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. P118.S83
- Swain, M. (Ed.) (1972). *Bilingual Schooling: Some Experiences in Canada and the United States*. Toronto: Ontario Institute for Studies in Education.
- (1975). Writing Skills of Grade Three French Immersion Pupils. *Working Papers on Bilingualism*, 7, 1-38.
- (1978). Home-school Language Switching. In J. C. Richards (ed.), *Understanding Second and Foreign Language Learning: Issues and Approaches*. Washington D. C.: Georgetown University Press.
- (1981a). Linguistic environment as a Factor in the Acquisition of Target Language Skills. In Roger W. Andersen (ed.), *Second Language Acquisition and Use Under Different Circumstances*. Rowley, Mass.: Newbury House Publishers.
- (1981b). Linguistic Expectations: Core, Extended and Immersion Programs. *Canadian Modern Language Review*, Mar, 37(3): 486-497.
- (1993). The Output Hypothesis: Just Speaking and Writing aren't enough. *Canadian Modern Language Review*, 50, 1, October, 158-164.
- (1996). Integrating language and content in immersion classrooms: Research perspectives. *Canadian Modern Language Review*, 52 (4): 529-548.
- Swain, M., and Barik, H. (1978). Bilingual Education in Canada: French and English. In B. Spolsky and R. L. Cooper (Eds.), *Case Studies in Bilingual Education*. Rowley, MA: Newbury.
- Swain, M., and Genesee, F. (1981). Target Language Use in the Wider Environment as a Factor in Its Acquisition. In Roger W. Anderson (ed.),

- New Dimensions in Second Language Acquisition Research*. Rowley, Mass.: Newbury House Publishers.
- Swain, M. and Lapkin, S. (1982). *Evaluating bilingual education: A Canadian case study*. Clevedon, England: Multilingual Matters.
- Sweeting, A. (1990). *Education in Hong Kong Pre-1841 to 1941: fact and opinion: materials for a history of education in Hong Kong*. Hong Kong: Hong Kong University Press.
- Tam, P. T. K. (1980). A survey of the language mode used in teaching junior forms in Anglo-Chinese secondary schools in Hong Kong. *RELJ Journal*, 11: 1, 43-60.
- (1984). *A longitudinal study of the effects of changing the instructional medium on students' performance in selected Anglo-Chinese secondary schools in Hong Kong*. Hong Kong: HKU Faculty of Education.
- Truscott, J. (1996). The Case Against Grammar Correction in L2 Writing Classes. *Language Learning*, 46, 2, June, 327-369.
- Tsao, F. F. (1982). Linguistics and Written Discourse in Particular Languages: Contrastive Studies: English and Chinese (Mandarin). *Annual Review of Applied Linguistics*, 3, 99-117.
- T'sou, B. K. (1976). Language loyalty among Minority Groups in Hong Kong. In B. K. T'sou (ed.), *Papers from the Asian Round Table Conference on Chinese Language and Linguistics*.
- (1977). Some current issues relevant to language and education in Hong Kong. In P. M. Whyte (ed.), *Education Careers in Hong Kong 1977*. Hong Kong: University of Hong Kong.
- (1980). Critical sociolinguistic realignment in Multilingual Societies. In E. A. Afendras (ed.) *Patterns of Bilingualism: Selected Papers from the RELC Seminar on "Acquisition of Bilingual Ability and Patterns of Bilingualism with Special Reference to Southeast Asian Contexts"*, Singapore, April 1979. Singapore University Press for SEAMEO Regional Language Center.
- Tucker, G. R. (1977). The Linguistic Perspective. *Bilingual Education: Current Perspective: Linguistics*, 2, 1-40.

- Uzawa, K. (1996). Second Language Learners' Processes of L1 Writing, L2 Writing, and Translation from L1 to L2. *Journal of Second Language Writing*, 5(3): 271-294.
- Valdés, G., Haro, P., and Echevarriarza, M. P. (1992). The Development of Writing Abilities in a Foreign Language: Contributions toward a General Theory of L2 Writing. *Modern Language Journal*. 76, 3, autumn, 333-352.
- Valdés, G. and Figueroa, R. A. (1994). *Bilingualism and Testing: A Special Case of Bias*. New Hersey: Ablex Publishing Corp.
- Van der Leilen, M. (1995). Use of French, Attitudes and Motivations of French Immersion Students. *Canadian Modern Language Review*, 51 (2): 287-304.
- Vann, Roberta J., Meyer, Daisy E., and Lorenz, Frederick O. (1984). Error Gravity: A Study of Faculty Opinion of ESL Errors. *TESOL Quarterly*, 18 (3), Sep 1984. 427-40.
- Vignola, M. J. (1995). Les prises de décision lors du processus d'écriture en langue maternelle et en langue seconde chez les diplômés d'immersion française (Choices Made by French Immersion Graduates during the Process of Writing in Their First and Second Language). *Dissertation Abstracts International, A: The Humanities and Social Sciences*, 56, 4, Oct, 1274A.
- Vignola, M. J., and Wesche, M. B. (1991). L'écriture en langue maternelle et en langue seconde chez les diplômés d'immersion français (Writing in the Native Language and the Second Language in French Immersion Program). *Études de Linguistique Appliquée*, 82, Apr-June, 94-115.
- Webb, A. E. (1975). *Relevance of written English ability of Hong Kong school leavers to employment demands*. M. Phil Thesis. Hong Kong: The University of Hong Kong. 283 pp.
- Whalen, K., and Ménard, N. (1995). L1 and L2 Writers' Strategic and Linguistic Knowledge: A Model of Multiple-Level Discourse Processing. *Language Learning*, 45, 3, September, 381-418.
- Widdowson, H. G. (1983). New starts and different kinds of failure. In A. Freedman, I. Pringle, and J. Yalden, (Eds.) *Learning to write: first language/ second language: selected papers from the 1979 CCTE Conference, Ottawa, Canada*. London, New York: Longman.

- Wong, J. W. P. (1999). Speech by Mr. Joseph W. P. Wong, GBS, JP, Secretary for Education and Manpower at the Motion on "Promoting extensive use of English" to be moved by Hon James TIEN Pei-chun at the Legislative Council meeting on 26 May 1999.
- Wojtowicz, T. J. (1997). *Attitudes and proficiency concerning a second language among tertiary students*. Hong Kong: Department of Health Sciences, The Hong Kong Polytechnic University.
- Wolck, W. (1987). Types of Natural Bilingual Behaviour, *The Bilingual Review*, Sept-Dec, 14(3).
- Wolfe-Quintero, K., Inagaki, S., and Kim, H. Y. (1998). *Second language development in writing: measures of fluency, accuracy, & complexity*. Second Language Teaching & Curriculum Centre.
- Yalden, M. F. (1981). The Bilingual Experience in Canada. In M. Ridge (ed.), *The New Bilingualism*. University of California Press, pp. 71-88.
- Yau, M. S. S. (1991). The Role of Language Factors in Second Language Writing. In L. M. Malavé, and G. Duquette (Eds.), *Language, culture, and cognition: a collection of studies in first and second language acquisition*. Clevedon ; Philadelphia: Multilingual Matters.
- Yip, V., and Matthews, S. (1992). Tough Movement in Chinese/English Interlanguage: Contrastive Analysis and Learnability. In T. Lee (Ed.), *Research on Chinese Linguistics in Hong Kong*, pp. 177-191. Hong Kong: The Linguistic Society of Hong Kong.
- Yorio, C. A. (1989). Idiomaticity as an Indicator of Second Language Proficiency. In Kenneth Hyltenstam and Loraine K. Obler (eds.), *Bilingualism across the Lifespan: Aspects of Acquisition, Maturity and Loss*. Cambridge, New York: Cambridge University Press.
- Yu, F. Y. (1979). A Report on an Assessment of the Standard of English of Pupils in Hong Kong. *Hong Kong Papers in Linguistics and Language Teaching*, 1, 20-37.
- Yu, V. W. S., and Atkinson, P. A. (1988a). An investigation of the language difficulties experienced by Hong Kong secondary school students in English-medium schools. I. The problems. *Journal of Multilingual and Multicultural Development*, 9: 3, 267-284.

- (1988b). An investigation of the language difficulties experienced by Hong Kong secondary school students in English-medium schools. II. Some causal factors. *Journal of Multilingual and Multicultural Development*, 9:4, 307-322.
- Zamel, V. (1987). Recent Research on Writing Pedagogy. *TESOL Quarterly*, 21 (4): 697-716.
- 司徒秀薇 (1995)：《三種作文評分方法信度比較研究》。《中文教育論文集第三輯》，香港教育學院中文系。
- 唐秀玲 (1995)：《港滬小六學生書面句型運用差異研究》。《中文教育論文集第三輯》，何國祥編，香港教育學院中文系。
- 祝新華 (1995)：《學生漢語書面表達能力發展研究》。《中文教育論文集第三輯》，何國祥編，香港教育學院中文系。
- 張本楠 (1995)：《「合則雙美、離則兩傷」—香港中文的規範化》。《中文教育論文集第三輯》，何國祥編，香港教育學院中文系。
- 楊自儉、李瑞華 (編) (1990)：《英漢對比研究論文集》。上海：上海外語教育出版社。
- 胡裕樹 (1992)：《現代漢語》(增訂本)。香港：三聯書店。
- 謝錫金 (1995)：《香港初中學生錯別字研究》。《教育曙光》36期，104-108頁。
- 蕭炳基 (1980)：《香港中學生作文字句病例分析》。《教育學報》8期，2號，9-19頁。
- 曾志雄 (1996)：《香港中國語文的夾縫現象》。《一九九七與香港中國語文研討會論文集》。香港：香港中文大學。187-190頁。
- 鄒嘉彥 (1997)：《三言、兩語說香港》。 *Journal of Chinese Linguistics*, 25: 2. 290-307頁。

**Constructing Bilingual Norms for
Bilingual Program Assessment:
A Study of Bilingual Writing Performance of
Cantonese-speaking Students in Hong Kong (China) and
Anglophone Students in Montréal (Canada)**

by

CAROL SUI-YEE KWOK

APPENDICES

Of a thesis submitted in partial fulfillment
of the requirements for the degree of
Master of Philosophy
Department of Chinese and Bilingual Studies
Hong Kong Polytechnic University

December 1999

Chief Supervisor: Dr. Daniel Wing Cheung So
Co-Supervisor: Dr. Kang Kwong Luke

CONTENT

APPENDIX 1 – QUESTIONNAIRES	1
APPENDIX 2 – MACRO INDEX SCHEMA	5
APPENDIX 3 – MICRO INDEX SCHEMA	6
APPENDIX 4 – A LIST OF INCIDENCES OF INACCURACY IN L1 (CHINESE) WRITINGS OF H3 SUBJECTS.....	7
APPENDIX 5 – A LIST OF INCIDENCES OF INACCURACY IN L2 (ENGLISH) WRITINGS OF H3 SUBJECTS.....	12
APPENDIX 6 – A LIST OF INCIDENCES OF INACCURACY IN L1 (ENGLISH) WRITINGS OF M3 SUBJECTS.....	21
APPENDIX 7 – A LIST OF INCIDENCES OF INACCURACY IN L2 (FRENCH) WRITINGS OF M3 SUBJECTS.....	26

Appendix 1 – Questionnaires

A. Questionnaire for Hong Kong subjects

基本資料

1. 年齡：
2. 性別：
3. 你在哪一間小學畢業？
4. 小學時，除語文科外，你的老師以何種語言授課？
☐粵語 ☐英語 ☐普通話 ☐其他
5. 除語文科外，你的小學課本用何種語文編寫？
☐中文 ☐英文 ☐其他
6. 媽媽的教育程度：
☐小學 ☐中學 ☐大學或以上 ☐其他
媽媽的職業：
7. 爸爸的教育程度：
☐小學 ☐中學 ☐大學或以上 ☐其他
爸爸的職業：
8. 放學/放假後，你通常有甚麼活動？

語用資料

1. 你懂得說哪些語言？
☐粵語 ☐英語 ☐普通話 ☐其他
2. 你的媽媽懂得說哪些語言？
☐粵語 ☐英語 ☐普通話 ☐其他
3. 你的爸爸懂得說哪些語言？
☐粵語 ☐英語 ☐普通話 ☐其他
4. 你通常用哪種語言與父母交談？
☐粵語 ☐英語 ☐普通話 ☐其他
5. 你會否用英語與父母交談或以英文溝通？
☐必定 ☐經常 ☐間中 ☐很少 ☐不會
6. 你家中是否有聘請外籍女傭？☐有 ☐沒有 ☐不適用
7. 在過去一星期中，你有否看英文的電視節目？☐有 ☐沒有
 若有，你看甚麼節目？
8. 你的家人是否經常租西片影碟？☐有 ☐沒有
 若是，平均多久一次？
9. 在過去一星期中，除了家課外，你有否書寫英文？☐有 ☐沒有
 若有寫英文，你寫的是甚麼東西？
10. 在過去一星期中，除了家課外，你有否書寫中文？☐有 ☐沒有
 若有寫中文，你寫的是甚麼東西？
11. 你是否喜歡書寫英文？☐喜歡 ☐不喜歡 ☐不適用
12. 你是否喜歡書寫中文？☐喜歡 ☐不喜歡 ☐不適用

B. Questionnaire for Montréal subjects

☆☆☆☆☆☆☆☆☆☆☆☆☆☆☆☆☆☆☆☆☆☆☆☆☆☆☆☆☆☆
 Please tick the circles which best describe you.
 ☆☆☆☆☆☆☆☆☆☆☆☆☆☆☆☆☆☆☆☆☆☆☆☆☆☆☆☆☆

1. How old are you?
2. Are you a boy or a girl? ☐ Boy ☐ Girl
3. How many languages do you speak?
 What are they?
4. How many languages does your mother speak? What are they?
5. How many languages does your father speak? What are they?
6. Your mother's education:
☐ elementary ☐ high ☐ university or above ☐ Not applicable
 Her occupation is:
7. Your father's education:
☐ elementary ☐ high ☐ university or above ☐ Not applicable
 His occupation is:
8. In what language do you speak to your parents?
☐ English ☐ French ☐ Others ☐ Not applicable
9. In what language do you write to your parents?
☐ English ☐ French ☐ Others ☐ Not applicable
10. Do you live with a French-speaking family member?
☐ Yes ☐ No ☐ Not applicable
11. Do you speak French with any of your family members?
☐ Always ☐ Sometimes ☐ Seldom ☐ Never
☐ Not applicable
12. Last week, did you write in French besides school works?
☐ Yes ☐ No ☐ Not applicable
 If yes, what did you write?
13. Last week, did you write in English besides school works?
☐ Yes ☐ No ☐ Not applicable
 If yes, what did you write?

14. Do you like writing in French?
☐Yes ☐No ☐Not applicable
15. Do you like writing in English?
☐Yes ☐No ☐Not applicable
16. Do you watch French TV and/or movies?
☐Always ☐Sometimes ☐Seldom ☐Never
☐Not applicable
17. Do you play games and/or computer games in French?
☐Always ☐Sometimes ☐Seldom ☐Never
☐Not applicable
18. What are your interests/hobbies?
19. What do you like to do after school or during vacation?

Appendix 2 – Macro Index Schema

1 Incomprehensible

The paper may not communicate. Incomprehensible or no attempt.
Several and frequent inaccuracies in all areas – organization, development, language use, vocabulary, syntax, and conventions - are characteristic.

2 Inadequate

The paper is minimally communicative. It may not address the question topic or do so only superficially.

It is seriously disorganized, with no clear plan. Most points are hard to understand and/or there are serious contradictions or inconsistencies
Language use, including word choice, may seriously obscure meaning.

3 Limited

The paper is communicatively limited. It addresses the question/topic but has several weaknesses.

Organization may be uneven. The meaning is sometimes hard to understand and/or there are serious contradictions or inconsistencies.

Language use may at times obscure meaning.

3 Average

The paper communicates adequately. It addresses the question/topic, but development is limited.

It is adequately organized. Organization and transitions are occasionally difficult to follow, but there are no glaring inconsistencies or incomprehensible sequences.

Language use is inconsistent but does not obscure meaning.

5 Good

The paper communicates adequately. It addresses the question/topic but does so less effectively than a paper that scores a 6.

It is generally well organized. Meaning is easy to follow throughout, and there are no obvious weak transitions or awkward sequences.

Language use is fluent but may be somewhat inconsistent.

6 Excellent

The paper is communicative. It effectively addresses the question/topic.

It is well organized. Well-written native-like composition with practically no inaccuracies.

Language use is consistently fluent.

Appendix 3 – Micro Index Schema

	Type	Quality
Dimension 1 - Intra-sentence		
Omission	1A	Red/Yellow
Redundancy	1B	Red/Yellow
Vertical Accuracy	1C	Red/Yellow
Linear Accuracy	1D	Red/Yellow
Lexical Accuracy	1E	Red/Yellow
Dimension 2 - Inter-sentence		
Structural Accuracy	2	Red/Yellow
Dimension 3 - Textual		
Cohesion and Reference	3A	Red/Yellow
Tense/Aspect/Mood	3B	Red/Yellow
Dimension 4 - Presentation	4	Red/Yellow

Appendix 4 – A List of Incidences of Inaccuracy in L1 (Chinese) Writings of H3 Subjects

1A - OMISSION

(A1)	口裏還咬著兩 [^] 麵包	Omission: Classifier	口裏還咬著兩塊麵包
(A1)	我才找到自己，在深濃的還境裏 [^] 過來...	Omission: verb	我才找到自己，在深濃的還境裏醒過來...
(A13)	有的便帶著他們的狗隻，在溫和的晨光下，在清新的空氣 [^] 散步...	Omission: Prep	有的帶著他們的狗隻，在溫和的晨光下，在清新的空氣中散步...
(A14)	這些活動在陽光 [^] 明顯地增加了動感...	Omission: Prep	這些活動在陽光下明顯地增加了動感...
(A35)	沙田，是我居住的地方。沙田， [^] 是我上學的地方。	Omission: auxiliary	沙田，是我居住的地方，沙田，也是我上學的地方。

1B - REDUNDANCY

(A1)	這時，曙光初露，我已回到校園，我已定過神來，回想起剛才的經歷，...	Duplication (Subject)	這時，曙光初露，我已回到校園，定過神來，回想起剛才的經歷，...
(A4)	他們正在慢慢地練習剛柔並重的太極拳，但他們的姿勢實在十分有趣，所以引來很多人圍觀。	Redundant Conj	他們正在慢慢地練習剛柔並重的太極拳，他們的姿勢實在十分有趣，所以引來很多人圍觀，
(A4)	我選了一個靠窗的位子坐下，希望能清楚地看見巴士行駛中的景物是甚麼的模樣。	Redundant “的”	我選了一個靠窗的位子坐下，希望能清楚地看見巴士行駛中的景物是甚麼模樣。
(A10)	在每次我要乘巴士回校，我都要經過附近的商場。	Redundant: Subject	每次乘巴士回校，我都要經過附近的商場。
(A10)	在早晨，經常也有大霧，像一層輕紗，迷迷茫茫...	Redundant: Conjunction	在早晨，經常有大霧，像一層輕紗，迷迷茫茫...
(A16)	沙田的早晨如一套電影，似一幅的名畫，給人和諧的心境，給人喜悅的感情，使我忘記不得。	Redundant “的”	沙田的早晨如一套電影，似一幅名畫，給人和諧的心境，給人喜悅的感情，使我忘記不得。
(A19)	在這麼幽美的環境下，一大群小朋友自由自在地玩耍遊戲，十分開心快活。	Redundant: verb	在這麼優美的環境下，一大群小朋友自由自在地遊戲，十分開心快活。
(A25)	好夢正酣，聽到斷續的鬧鐘的鬧鐘聲，...	Redundant	好夢正酣，聽到斷續的鬧鐘聲，...
(A29)	輕輕鬆鬆的旅程完了，我真的有點兒捨不得下車的感覺呢！	Redundant	輕輕鬆鬆的旅程完了，我真的有點兒捨不得下車呢！
(A31)	而平日繁忙的馬路現在卻剛巧相反，冷冷清清的，...	Redundant: auxiliary	而平日繁忙的馬路現在卻剛巧相反，冷冷清清的，...
(A32)	但每天晨早，總會有一班公公婆婆走來耍太極，他們還會配上一些音樂來配合，...	Redundant: verb	但每天晨早，總會有一班公公婆婆走來耍太極，他們還會配上一些音樂，...
(A34)	路旁邊有一排灌木，大部份的都是杜鵑花。	Redundant “的”	路旁邊有一排灌木，大部份都是杜鵑花。

1C - VERTICAL ACCURACY

(A3)	她是一個充滿魅力和 <u>潤洽</u> 的城市。	Adj used as N	她是一個充滿魅力和融洽氣氛的城市。
(A22)	不知不覺地，我走到一個寒風撲面的地方， <u>風</u> 變得特別厲害，...	N used as V	不知不覺地，我走到一個寒風撲面的地方，風刮得特別厲害，...

1E - LEXICAL ACCURACY

(A2)	除學生哥外，家庭主婦、工人、地盆雜工、文員……都可輕易發現，...	Lexical: verb	除學生哥外，家庭主婦、工人、地盆雜工、文員...都不難碰到
------	-----------------------------------	---------------	-------------------------------

(A4)	微弱的晨光從 <u>廉縫裏</u> 中投射在我身上，帶給清晨已經來臨的信息，	Lexical: preposition	微弱的晨光從廉縫間投射在我身上，帶來清晨已經來臨的信息。
(A4)	微弱的晨光從廉縫裏中投射在我身上，帶給清晨已經來臨的信息，	Lexical: preposition	微弱的晨光從廉縫間投射在我身上，帶來清晨已經來臨的信息。
(A5)	我不禁停留在 <u>通過</u> 學校那面的橫跨城門河的小橋上觀賞沙田美麗的景色。	Lexical: preposition	我不禁停留在通往學校那面的橫跨城門河的小橋上觀賞沙田美麗的景色。
(A6)	沙田的風景很美，既有山，又有水，深刻的印象叫人無法忘卻，它的夜晚 <u>更美</u> ，如一條巨龍盤踞於此，安寧之餘也醞釀著生氣，但我更熱愛沙田的早晨，	Lexical: comparative	沙田的風景很美，既有山，又有水，深刻的印象叫人無法忘卻，它的夜晚也美，如一條巨龍盤踞於此，安寧之餘也醞釀著生氣，但我更熱愛沙田的早晨。
(A6)	但最好笑的是一些遲來的乘客要趕上巴士，就不惜好像獵豹一樣飛跑過來巴士站。	Lexical: adverb	但最好笑的是一些遲來的乘客要趕上巴士，就不管一切好像獵豹一樣飛跑過來巴士站。
(A8)	正值 <u>朦朧</u> 之間，一團不可思議的白光在我眼前 <u>展現</u> 著，是陽光，還是幻影？	Lexical: verb	正值朦朧之間，一團不可思議的白光在我眼前出現，是陽光，還是幻影？
(A8)	我欲觀看遠處 <u>遒</u> 岸然的遠山，卻被林立的大廈所掩蓋著。我所期望的美好影像與光和熱已不復見，	Lexical: verb	我欲觀看遠處遒岸然的遠山，卻被林立的大廈所掩蓋，我所期望的美好影像與光和熱已不復見。
(A9) (R)	看到河畔的中年男女，大汗淋漓，汗水如黃豆般的，我彷彿感到炎熱、疲倦的感覺，儘管有著無數的 <u>蟬聲</u> 嘗試令我從感覺中吵醒，但對我仍是不了了之。	Lexical: verb	看到河畔的中年男女，大汗淋漓，汗水如黃豆般的，我彷彿感到炎熱、疲倦的感覺，儘管有著無數的蟬聲嘗試把我吵醒，但對我仍是無甚作用。
(A13)	他們為了保持身體健康，不惜犧牲寶貴的睡眠時間，這種努力不懈的精神真使人 <u>敬仰</u> 。	Lexical: verb	他們為了保持身體健康，不惜犧牲寶貴的睡眠時間，這種努力不懈的精神真使人敬佩。
(A14) (R)	每天從那些駛出的車輛多不勝數，有時候更會有 <u>擠車</u> 來。	Lexical: verb	每天從那些住宅區駛出的車輛多不勝數，有時候更會出現擠車。
(A15)	當 <u>臨</u> 到學校時，經過一條小徑，那裏滿是花草樹木...	Lexical: verb	臨近學校時，經過一條小徑，那裏滿是花草樹木...
(A19)	在陽光下 <u>滴著</u> 點點露珠，送來清新空氣，樹上傳著悅耳鳥鳴...	Lexical: preposition	在陽光下滴著點點露珠，送來清新空氣，樹上傳出悅耳鳥鳴...
(A26)	在巴士站裡已出現了 <u>不同系列</u> 的人龍，...	Lexical: classifier	在巴士站裡已出現了一列列的人龍，

2 - INTER-SENTENTIAL ACCURACY

(A4)	靜看河畔的中年男女， <u>服裝上而有</u> 慢慢的變動，看到他們的速度比以前慢了不少，便知道天氣已開始變冷了。	Structural: deviated construction	靜看河畔的中年男女，衣飾慢慢加厚，他們的速度也比以前慢了，便知道天氣已開始變冷了。
(A10)	沿著河走，很快便看到了矮小的校舍， <u>可能是由於這是一間學校</u> ，因此，它好像在散發出一般聖潔的光芒……	Punctuation (.)	沿著河走，很快便看到了矮小的校舍。可能是由於這是一間學校，因此，它好像在散發出一般聖潔的光芒……
(A11)	在平常日子裡的我，於星期日的早上都仍然是呼呼入睡，又或是留在家中收看电视，很少機會離開家門半步，然而，今天卻有點與別不同，因為...	Punctuation (.)	在平常日子裡的我，於星期日的早上都仍然是呼呼入睡，又或是留在家中收看电视，很少機會離開家門半步。然而，今天卻有點與別不同，因為...
(A15)	而商店也 <u>陸續</u> 地開業了有些店裏的工人趕快地清理雜物，希望盡快賺到別人的金錢，而有的便已收拾妥當，開始做生意，尤其是在快餐店和報紙攤檔。	Punctuation (:)	而商店也陸續地開業了，有些店裏的工人趕快地清理雜物，希望盡快賺到別人的金錢：有的早已收拾妥當，開始做生意，尤其是快餐店和報紙攤檔。
(A17)	首先，那些侍應生手忙腳亂地工作， <u>一副透不過氣的樣子</u> 澄現在他們的臉上...	Structural: phrase	首先，那些侍應生手忙腳亂地工作，臉上一副透不過氣的樣子...

(A18)	河中還有很多魚兒成群地游游。有些還躍上水面呢!	Punctuation (,)	河中還有很多魚兒成群地游游，有些還躍上水面呢!
(A23)	她們時而拿著羽扇或絲巾似的，不論放晴或有雨，都會在公園裏起舞。	Structural: Pattern misuse	她們常常拿著羽扇或絲巾似的，不論放晴或有雨，都會在公園裏起舞。
(A24)	陽光照在含苞待放的大紅花上，使花兒們綻放光彩，亦使我感到它們無盡的生命力。	Punctuation (,)	陽光照在含苞待放的大紅花上，使花兒們綻放光彩，亦使我感到它們無盡的生命力。

3A - TEXTUAL COHERENCE AND REFERENCE

(A4) (R)	當時他十分狼狽，雖然我很希望幫助他，但因巴士已到了，所以我只好看著他上車，回校上課。	Reference	當時他十分狼狽，雖然我很希望幫助他，但因巴士已到了，所以我只好一面看著他，一面上車，回校上課。
(A24)	啊！原來太陽伯伯已經正式投入工作了！它將整個沙田都照亮起來，使這個早晨亦溫暖起來！	Reference: Personification	啊！原來太陽伯伯已經正式投入工作了！他將整個沙田都照亮起來，使這個早晨亦溫暖起來！

3B - TENSE, ASPECT AND MOOD

(A4)	那兒雖然沒有商店營業，但是有一個很老的伯伯在擺賣報紙。	Tense/Aspect	那兒雖然未有商店營業，但是已有一個很老的伯伯在擺賣報紙。
(A28)	從高處望著這擠擁的人群，確是有趣非常，他們令幽靜的早晨變得熱鬧起來吧！	Mood	從高處望著這擠擁的人群，確是有趣非常，他們令幽靜的早晨變得熱鬧起來呢！

4 - PRESENTATION

(A1)	我忽忽的梳洗...	形近別字	我匆匆的梳洗...
(A1)	我才找到自已，在濛濛的還境裏過來...	音形俱近別字	我才找到自已，在朦朧的環境裏醒過來...
(A1)	我才找到自已，在濛濛的還境裏過來...	音形俱近別字	我才找到自已，在朦朧的環境裏醒過來...
(A1)	這時，我才發覺身旁的境物...	音近別字	這時，我才發覺身旁的景物...
(A2)		Wrong Strokes	麵包
(A2)		Wrong Strokes	鼻樑
(A2)	每每見到均是高聳入雲的大廈，形成一座「鐵壁森林」。	音形俱近別字	每每見到均是高聳入雲的大廈，形成一座「鐵壁森林」。
(A2)	難道幽美的環境是不能與文明共存嗎？	音近別字	難道優美的環境是不能與文明共存嗎？
(A2)	但這幾年已改善不少，河水也可徹底的，常有三五成群的鷺子在河塘旁邊。	音近別字	但這幾年已改善不少，河水也算徹底的，常有三五成群的鷺子在河塘旁邊。
(A3)	那裏常常都非常熱鬧，不只是村裏的人，還有人們飼養的雞吠。	形近別字	那裏常常都非常熱鬧，不只是村裏的人，還有人們飼養的雞犬。
(A3)	你一言、我一語，甚是有建地。	音近別字	你一言、我一語，甚是有見地。
(A4)		Wrong Strokes	一瞬間
(A4)	微弱的晨光從簾縫裏中投射在我身上，帶給清晨已經來臨的信息。	音形俱近別字	微弱的晨光從簾縫間投射在我身上，帶來清晨已經來臨的信息。
(A4)	在公園的別一邊，就有一班老當益壯的公公婆婆。	形近別字	在公園的另一邊，有一班老當益壯的公公婆婆。
(A4)	他的臉十分憔悴，也有很經歷風霜的疤痕。	音形俱近別字	他的臉十分憔悴，也有很經歷風霜的疤痕。
(A6)		Wrong Strokes	麤程
(A6)		Wrong Strokes	匆忙
(A6)	他們有的抿著咀，緊扣著眉，掛著一副吃了苦茶的樣子，有的前後踱來踱去，看了叫人心煩不已，有的眼觀鼻、鼻觀心，如老僧入定一樣寧定如常。	Punctuation (;)	他們有的抿著咀，緊扣著眉，掛著一副吃了苦茶的樣子；有的前後踱來踱去，看了叫人心煩不已；有的眼觀鼻、鼻觀心，如老僧入定一樣寧定如常。

(A6)		Wrong Strokes	溫馨
(A6)		Wrong Strokes	匆匆地
(A6)	一切煩惱彷彿都已忘懷，天地間甚麼都不怎重要了。	音近別字	一切煩惱彷彿都已忘懷，天地間甚麼都不怎重要了。
(A8)	我感到一種莫名奇妙的寂寞，彷彿我已不再認識這個世界。	音形俱近別字	我感到一種莫名其妙的寂寞，彷彿我已不再認識這個世界。
(A8)	我感到一種莫名奇妙的寂寞，彷彿我已不再認識這個世界。	音形俱近別字	我感到一種莫名奇妙的寂寞，彷彿我已不再認識這個世界。
(A8)		Wrong Strokes	污煙瘴氣
(A8)		Wrong Strokes	清爽
(A9)	在渡河小橋之上，看到一大群白鷺，在蔚藍色的天翱翔。	音形俱近別字	在渡河小橋之上，看到一大群白鷺，在蔚藍色的天翱翔。
(A9)	當我在夏天時上學，從擠迫、悶熱的巴士下車，...	形近別字	當我在夏天時上學，從擠迫、悶熱的巴士下車，...
(A9)	天氣清涼，我的步伐亦隨著天氣而變得輕快，...	音形俱近別字	天氣清涼，我的步伐亦隨著天氣而變得輕快，...
(A9)	沙田是一個景色怡人的地方。	音近別字	沙田是一個景色怡人的地方。
(A10)	交織出一幅和平寧靜的景像。	音形俱近別字	交織出一幅和平寧靜的景象。
(A10)	神采飛揚	形近別字	神采飛揚
(A10)	白色的海鸚是這裏的「常客」。	形近別字	白色的海鸚是這裏的「常客」。
(A10)		Wrong Strokes	商場
(A10)		Wrong Strokes	踏自行車
(A11)	簡直與平日繁華的街道起了強烈的對比，雙映成趣。	音近別字	簡直與平日繁華的街道起了強烈的對比，相映成趣。
(A11)	這也使我在每週日的早上都提早起床，來欣賞這充滿傳奇和魅力的幽美景象。	音形俱近別字	這也使我在每週日的早上都提早起床，來欣賞這充滿傳奇和魅力的優美景象。
(A11)	這也使我在每週日的早上都提早起床，來欣賞這充滿傳奇和魅力的幽美景象。	音近別字	這也使我在每週日的早上都提早起床，來欣賞這充滿傳奇和魅力的優美景象。
(A12)	令我彷彿感到身處在地盤中央。	音形俱近別字	令我彷彿感到身處在地盤中央。
(A12)	而火車所發出那尖銳刺耳的「吱吱」聲，使你爭恨這裏的環境，急得乘車離開。	音近別字	而火車所發出那尖銳刺耳的「吱吱」聲，使你憎恨這裏的環境，急得乘車離開。
(A12)	一滴滴的眼淚如瀑布般不禁從我的眼眶滾滾而下了。	音形俱近別字	一滴滴的眼淚如瀑布般不禁從我的眼眶滾滾而下了。
(A12)		Wrong Strokes	飛鳥翱翔
(A13)	在那些環境清幽的公園裡，有很多老伯伯在下棋。	音近別字	在那些環境清幽的公園裡，有很多老伯伯在下棋。
(A13)	從他們身上散發出一種健康的氣息...	音近別字	從他們身上散發出一種健康的氣息...
(A15)	而旁邊也點綴著一些「 <u>亭亭玉立</u> 」的樹木。	音近別字	而旁邊也點綴著一些「亭亭玉立」的樹木。
(A15)	青蔥的綠山包圍著高樓大廈。	形近別字	青蔥的綠山包圍著高樓大廈。
(A16)	太陽先生冒出頭兒，徐徐地變成丹紅的籃球，光芒四射...	音形俱近別字	太陽先生冒出頭兒，徐徐地變成丹紅的籃球，光芒四射...
(A17)	偶然，我仰頭望長空，...	形近別字	偶然，我仰頭望長空，...
(A17)	一副欲睡難睡的樣子...	形近別字	一副欲睡難睡的樣子...
(A17)	然而，當我回家的途中，看到的又是另一番景象...	音形俱近別字	然而，當我回家的途中，看到的又是另一番景象...
(A19)		Wrong Strokes	琴聲
(A19)	這些一切均令你不知所措，就像走入迷宮中，永無翻身之日。	形近別字	這些一切均令你不知所措，就像走入迷宮中，永無翻身之日。
(A19)	那裏種滿各式各樣， <u>琳琳種種</u> 的花草樹木，...	音形俱近別字	那裏種滿各式各樣， <u>林林種種</u> 的花草樹木，...
(A19)	在這 <u>麼</u> 幽美的環境下，一大群小朋友自由自在地玩耍遊戲，十分開心快活。	音近別字	在這 <u>麼</u> 優美的環境下，一大群小朋友自由自在地遊戲，十分開心快活。
(A20)	遙望遠景，一片迷離。	音近別字	遙望遠景，一片迷濛。
(A21)	淺紅色的喇叭花，點綴著 <u>週圍</u> 像柳絲般幼小的草...	音形俱近別字	淺紅色的喇叭花，點綴著 <u>周圍</u> 像柳絲般幼小的草...
(A22)		Wrong Strokes	琴聲
(A23)		Wrong Strokes	疲倦

(A23)	來到車站，見到的都是 <u>屬識</u> 的臉孔，同一輛的巴士，真是感到厭倦。	音近別字	來到車站，見到的都是熟識的臉孔，同一輛的巴士，真是感到厭倦。
(A23)	在陽光的 <u>照耀</u> 下，...	形近別字	在陽光的照耀下，...
(A23)	實在 <u>慘不忍睹</u> ，令人不屑一看。	形近別字	實在慘不忍睹，令人不屑一看。
(A23)	有數十隻的 <u>白露</u> 環繞著城門河畔自由地飛翔。	音近別字	有數十隻的白鷺環繞著城門河畔自由地飛翔。
(A23)	在 <u>括大風</u> 時，河畔的樹都被吹得左搖右擺。	形近別字	在刮大風時，河畔的樹都被吹得左搖右擺。
(A24)	把地上掃地的婦孺弄得「 <u>攞攞轉</u> 」，...	音形俱近別字	把地上掃地的婦孺弄得「團團轉」，...
(A24)		Wrong Strokes	落下
(A25)	每人都要迎接無數個天明， <u>渡過</u> 無數個清早，體驗無數個早晨。	音形俱近別字	每人都要迎接無數個天明，度過無數個清早，體驗無數個早晨。
(A25)	他們亦會報以和 <u>藹</u> 的微笑，...	音形俱近別字	他們亦會報以和藹的微笑，...
(A25)	有時看到這些臉，自己也會 <u>無源無故</u> 沒精打采起來。	音近別字	有時看到這些臉，自己也會無緣無故沒精打采起來。
(A25)	離開這些悠閒的 <u>景像</u> ，...	音形俱近別字	離開這些悠閒的景象，...
(A28)		Wrong Strokes	暢快
(A28)	我伸著腰，打個 <u>呵欠</u> 。	形近別字	我伸著腰，打個呵欠。
(A29)	與河水（滾滾流下）雄壯、澎湃的 <u>景象</u> 形成了 <u>強列</u> 的對比。	音形俱近別字	與河水（滾滾流下）雄壯、澎湃的景象形成了強烈的對比。
(A29)	當你看到如此 <u>悠美</u> 的景色時，...	音近別字	當你看到如此優美的景色時，...
(A29)		Wrong Strokes	搖曳
(A29)		Wrong Strokes	俯覽
(A29)		Wrong Strokes	高塔
(A30)	有的精神爽朗，昂首闊步的走， <u>各式其式</u> 。	音形俱近別字	有的精神爽朗，昂首闊步的走，各適其適。
(A31)	我愛看早晨的 <u>境色</u> ，...	音形俱近別字	我愛看早晨的景色，...
(A34)		Wrong Strokes	樹葉茂盛
(A34)	希望每天我也能夠觀賞這樣 <u>幽美</u> 的景色！	音近別字	希望每天我也能夠觀賞這樣優美的景色！
(A35)	<u>儼然</u> 是...	音形俱近別字	儼然是...

Appendix 5 – A List of Incidences of Inaccuracy in L2 (English) Writings of H3 Subjects

1A - OMISSION

	Single Incidence	Description	Suggestion
(B1)	<i>I listened ^ the bird's song.</i>	Omission: preposition	I listened to the bird's singing.
(B1)	<i>I could not think ^ any solutions.</i>	Omission: preposition	I could not think of any solutions.
(B2)	<i>I turned off the radio after listened ^ the weather report.</i>	Omission: preposition	I turned off the radio after listening to the weather report
(B4)	<i>Before I had my lunch, I had arrived ^ the top of the hill.</i>	Omission: preposition	Before I had my lunch, I had arrived at the top of the hill.
(B4)	<i>On the way, there were many trees, birds, butterflies, ^ frogs.</i>	Omission: conjunction	On the way, there were many trees, birds, butterflies and frogs.
(B5)	<i>It rained more and more fiercely on my way to ^ hospital.</i>	Omission: determiner	It rained more and more fiercely on my way to the hospital.
(B6)	<i>We jumped into a bus in ^ hurry.</i>	Omission	We jumped into a bus in a hurry.
(B6)	<i>^ Moment later, the sun reappeared, the warm sunlight shined onto my face, I felt warm and calm.</i>	Omission: determiner	Some moment later, the sun reappeared. The warm sunlight shone onto my face and I felt warm and calm.
(B7)	<i>.... his mother disagreed ^ let him went.</i>	Omission: preposition, his mother disagreed to let him go.
(B7)	<i>But on the half way to ^ destination,...</i>	Omission: determiner	But on the half way to the destination,...
(B7)	<i>But in ^ next morning after that day....</i>	Omission: determiner	But in the next morning,....
(B9)	<i>I waited the suitable bus came and went to my home.</i>	Omission: preposition	I waited for the right bus and went home.
(B10)	<i>But the sky suddenly became full of black clouds, lighting ^ in the sky and storm blown out.</i>	Omission: verb	But the sky suddenly became full of black clouds. Lightning flashed in the sky and storms broke/ raged.
(B11)	<i>How unlucky I would ^!</i>	Omission: verb	How unlucky I would be!
(B11)	<i>After I had arrived ^ the bus stop....</i>	Omission: preposition	After I had arrived at the bus stop...
(B12)	<i>I seemed ^ a shame dog and hit by the heavy rain.</i>	Omission: adverb	I seemed like a shame dog and was hit by the heavy rain.
(B13)	<i>My friends agreed ^ my suggestion.</i>	Omission: preposition	My friends agreed to my suggestion.
(B13) (R)	<i>Suddenly, some water ^ onto the ground.</i>	Omission: verb	Suddenly, some water dropped onto the ground.
(B13)	<i>We looked ^ our clothes one another.</i>	Omission: preposition	We looked at one another's clothes.
(B14) (R)	<i>I would like to bring an umbrella ^ the Observatory said it will rain today.</i>	Omission: conjunction	I would like to bring an umbrella because the Observatory said it would rain today.
(B14)	<i>The hot sun came out again, and helped me to dry up my clothes, and ^ air-conditioned bus came and I got on the bus.</i>	Omission: determiner	The hot sun came out again, and helped me to dry up my clothes, and an air-conditioned bus came and I got on the bus.
(B15)	<i>After ^ few days....</i>	Omission: determiner	After a few days,....
(B16)	<i>Then light from the sky disappeared, instead, the sky was full of dark clouds, clouds were dark enough to blocked my sight.</i>	Omission: determiner	Then the light from the sky dimmed. Instead, the sky was full of dark clouds, which were dark enough to affect my sight.
(B16) (R)	<i>Some people ran, even the dog ^.</i>	Omission: verb	Some people were running, so did the dog.
(B20)	<i>The sun was hidden by black clouds. It seemed to rain ^.</i>	Omission: adverb	The sun was hidden by black clouds. It seemed to rain soon.
(B20)	<i>I got wet and dirty all ^ the body.</i>	Omission: preposition	I got wet and dirty all over the body.
(B20)	<i>Therefore, I tried to go ^ another place, but I was unsuccessful.</i>	Omission: preposition	Therefore, I tried to go to another place, but I was unsuccessful.
(B27)	<i>At least, we can ^ swimming, can't we?</i>	Omission: verb	At least, we can go swimming, can't we?

(B30)	On 6 th July last year,...	Omission: determiner	On the 6 th of July last year
(B32)	No one had ^ umbrella, neither have I.	Omission: determiner	No one had an umbrella, neither did I.
(B34)	I and my classmate decided to run to the shopping centre to shelter ^ the rain.	Omission: preposition	My classmate and I decided to run to the shopping centre to shelter from the rain.
(B34)	I found that I had a bad headache, so I went to see the doctor ^ next day.	Omission: determiner	I found that I had a bad headache, so I went to see the doctor the next day.

1B - REDUNDANCY

(B1)	It help me to get dry the clothes.	Redundant verb	It helps me to dry the clothes.
(B2)	I saw that the sky was turning to black.	Redundant preposition	I saw that the sky was turning black.
(B2)	The rain was more heavier time to time.	Redundant adverb	The rain was getting heavier.
(B2)	I was angerily about the weather forecast's weather report was not true.	Redundant noun	I was angry that the weather forecast was not true.
(B4)	The event happened on Friday. On that day, it was a sunny day.	Redundant phrase	The event happened on Friday. It was a sunny day.
(B5)	The doctor told me, "the operation have been very successful, but your mother had to rest for two week in there."	Redundant preposition	The doctor me, "the operation was very successful, but your mother has to rest for two weeks there."
(B7)	But in next morning after the day ...	Redundant phrase	But in the next morning...
(B7)	And I also had a headache and sore-throat and fever. This made me couldn't go to school and stayed at the bed for a week.	Redundant determiner	I also had a headache, sore-throat and fever. This made me couldn't go to school and stayed at the bed for a week.
(B9)	I saw that the sky was turning to black.	Redundant preposition	I saw that the sky was turning black.
(B9)	I waited the suitable bus came and went to my home.	Redundant verb	I waited for the right bus and went home.
(B10)	I ran as fast as I could, everyone on the street ran away too.	Redundant preposition	I ran as fast as I could and everyone on the street was running too.
(B13)	Although I changed my clothes immediately. But I still had a bad cold.	Redundant conjunction	Although I changed my clothes immediately, I still had a bad cold.
(B13)	The rain was slow and light. So we still played the basketball originally .	Redundant adverb	The rain was slow and light. So we still played the game.
(B19)	At that time, I felt very sad that why the God punished me, why.	Redundant determiner	At that time, I felt very sad that why God punished me.
(B21)	We went downstairs of the mall and we came to a bus stop because I want to take her home. But we waited it for a long time.	Redundant subject	We went downstairs of the mall and came to a bus stop because I wanted to take her home. But we had waited it for a long time.
(B23)	Although they were staying under the tree, but our clothes and the belongings still got wet.	Redundant conjunction	Although we were staying under the tree, our clothes and the belongings still got wet.
(B24)	I knew it was going to be rain.	Redundant verb	I knew it was going to rain.
(B27)	When I went back to home....	Redundant preposition	When I went back home....
(B29)	When I ran towards to a restaurant....	Redundant preposition	When I ran towards a restaurant...
(B29)	I realized that some people will made you disappointed when you meet on problems.	Redundant preposition	I realized that some people will make you disappointed when you meet problems.
(B33)	The boys started to light up the fire and the girls prepared for the food.	Redundant preposition	The boys started to light up the fire and the girls prepared the food.

1C - VERTICAL ACCURACY

(B1)	I always lated for school and forgot to bring books.	Vertical: Adj used as V	I was always late for school and forgot to bring books.
(B2)	I was angerily about the weather forecast's weather report was not true.	Vertical: Adv used as Adj	I was angry that the weather forecast was not true.
(B2)	It was very noise .	Vertical: N used as Adj	It was very noisy.
(B3)	A moment later, it really rained and very heavy, just like some dogs and cats dropped from the sky.	Vertical: Adj used as Adv	A moment later, it really rained very heavily, just like some dogs and cats dropping from the sky.

(B8)	Since Ivy hates cloud sky, she was quite annoyed at this gruesome scenery.	Vertical: N used as Adj	Since Ivy hated cloudy sky, she was quite annoyed at this gruesome scenery.
(B10)	The flowers became more showy and everythings were clean.	Vertical: Adj Comp wrongly constructed	The flowers became more showy and everythings were clean.
(B10)	I wore my best clothes, my best socks and my best shoes. Going to a party – the beauty Phebe's birthday party.	Vertical: N used as Adj	I wore my best clothes, my best socks and my best shoes, going to a party – the beautiful Phebe's birthday party.
(B11)	I got a bad cold, and absent from school for a week.	Vertical: Adj used as V	I got a bad cold, and was absent from school for a week.
(B15)	The clouds became darkness and the sun was not shine now.	Vertical: N used as Adj	The clouds became dark and the sun was not shining now.
(B17)	Some people laid under the coloured tents.	Vertical: AdjClass used as AdjQualit	Some people lay inside the colourful tents.
(B18)	Then it lightning and thundering.	Vertical: N used as V	Then there was thunder and lightning.
(B21)	When we were choosing some clothes in one of the shop on that street,...	Vertical: plural N	When we were choosing some clothes in one of the shops on that street,...
(B21)	Vivian cried because she felt very pain.	Vertical: N used as Adj	Vivian cried because she felt very painful.
(B25)	The rain fell liked waterfall.	Vertical: V used as Adj	The rain was falling like a waterfall.
(B29)	I saw a piece of gray clouds floated towards above me.	Vertical: Ppart used as PrPart	I saw a piece of gray clouds floating towards above me.
(B30)	May had already been there, her face was full of impatient.	Vertical: Adj used as N	May had already been there and her face was full of impatience.
(B31)	It was a heavy raining.	Vertical: V used as N	It was a heavy rain.
(B32)	I did not go to visit my uncle since I caught a cold during escaped. I had to go home to take a bath.	Vertical: Adj used as V	I did not go to visit my uncle since I caught a cold during escape. I had to go home to take a bath.
(B32)	But the sky suddenly full of dark cloud.	Vertical: Adj used as V	But the sky was suddenly full of dark cloud.
(B32)	But the sky suddenly full of dark cloud.	Vertical: plural N	But the sky was suddenly full of dark clouds.
(B34)	I caught a cold and had to rest for a few day.	Vertical: plural N	I caught a cold and had to rest for a few days.

ID – LINEAR ACCURACY

(B1)	It help me to get dry the clothes.	Linear: S-V agreement	It helps me to dry the clothes.
(B1)	I knew it would raining soon.	Linear: v-form	I knew it would rain soon.
(B1)	Since there was many mosquitoes, it made my legs itch.	Linear: number agreement	Since there were many mosquitoes, they made my legs itch.
(B4)	When I was walking on the hill, I caught in a heavy shower of rain.	Linear: voice	When I was walking on the hill, I was caught in a heavy shower of rain.
(B5)	The doctor told me, "the operation have been very successful, but your mother had to rest for two week in there."	Linear: number agreement	The doctor me, "the operation was very successful, but your mother has to rest for two weeks there."
(B6)	We located about 2 kilo apart to where with roof, so we continuously ran forward and much faster.	Linear: voice	We were located about 2 kilo apart to where with roof, so we continuously ran forward and much faster.
(B7)	But Sam was refused. He said that he haven't finished his homework yet, his mother disagreed let him went.	Linear: voice	But Sam refused. He said that he hadn't finished his homework yet that his mother disagreed to let him go.
(B7)	The sky was begun to rain.	Linear: voice	The sky began to rain.
(B7)	The weather was so quickly to change from bad to good, I thought the god may play a trick with me.	Linear: voice	The weather quickly changed from bad to good. I thought that God might have played a trick on me..
(B7)	But Sam was refused. He said that he haven't finished his homework yet, his mother disagreed let him went.	Linear: S-V agreement	But Sam refused. He said that he hadn't finished his homework yet that his mother disagreed to let him go.

(B8)	Since we were neighbourhoods, I has fell in love with her.	Linear: S-V agreement	Since we were neighbourhoods, I has fallen in love with her.
(B9)	I turned off the TV set. Since I have already to make an appointment with my friend, Tom.	Linear: v-form	I turned off the TV set. Since I have already made an appointment with my friend, Tom.
(B11)	I would arrived at my destination soon.	Linear: v-form	I would arrive at my destination soon.
(B11)	The most unlucky thing was my brand-new camera was out of order, and failed to repair.	Linear: voice	The most unlucky thing was that my brand-new camera was out of order, and couldn't be repaired.
(B11)	I seemed a shame dog and hit by the heavy rain.	Linear: voice	I seemed like a shame dog and was hit by the heavy rain.
(B12)	She had to looked after me as I caught a cold.	Linear: v-form	She had to look after me as I caught a cold.
(B13) (R)	We looked our clothes one another.	Linear: voice	We looked at one another's clothes.
(B14)	The sunshine is very good, you need not to bring the umbrella. This made me to believe the weather forecast.	Linear: infinitive	The sunshine is very good, you need not bring the umbrella. This made me believe the weather forecast.
(B14)	I will bring an umbrella to go out when the Observatory forecast a rainy day.	Linear: S-V agreement	I will bring an umbrella to go out when the Observatory forecasts a rainy day.
(B15)	The clouds was too white that like the milk	Linear: number agreement	The clouds were as white as milk.
(B15)	We was still swimming.	Linear: number agreement	We were still swimming.
(B15)	The clouds became darkness and the sun was not shine now.	Linear: v-form	The clouds became darkness and the sun was not shining now.
(B16)	Mr. Sun was smiled at me.	Linear: v-form	Mr. Sun was smiling at me.
(B16)	The sun hid and the wind brought me coolness.	Linear: voice	The sun was hidden and the wind brought me coolness.
(B19)	The sky was cloudy so that I couldn't see the sun.	Linear: word order	The sky was so cloudy that I couldn't see the sun.
(B20)	I didn't go to a shelter to wait for the rain stop because I didn't wanted to missed the exciting football match.	Linear: v-form	I didn't go to a shelter to wait for the rain stop because I didn't want to miss the exciting football match.
(B20)	I didn't go to a shelter to wait for the rain stop because...	Linear: infinitive (LI)	I didn't go to a shelter to wait for the rain to stop because...
(B22)	My clothes was very wet and the rain had stopped after a few minutes. It was sunny again.	Linear: number agreement	My clothes were very wet and the rain had stopped after a few minutes. It was sunny again.
(B23)	I have learn that I will always bring an umbrella when I go out.	Linear: v-form	I have learned that I will always bring an umbrella when I go out.
(B29)	I realized the some people will made you disappointed when you meet on problems.	Linear: v-form	I realized the some people will make you disappointed when you meet on problems.
(B29)	The sun was shine and I waited.	Linear: v-form	The sun was shining and I waited.
(B30)	Only a few people was walking on the pedestrian, they also didn't have a raincoat...	Linear: number agreement	Only a few people were walking on the pedestrian, they also didn't have a raincoat...
(B30)	I had to went home...	Linear: v-form	I had to go home...
(B31)	I didn't brought my umbrella since I was in a hurry.	Linear: v-form	I didn't bring my umbrella since I was in a hurry.
(B33)	The rain had last for 5 minutes.	Linear: v-form	The rain had lasted for 5 minutes.
(B25)	The thing we only could do is 'enjoyed' the heavy rain,...	Linear: word order	The only thing we could do is to 'enjoy' the heavy rain,...
(B25)	The thing we only could do is 'enjoyed' the heavy rain, took a shower of rain and drank rain.	Linear: infinitive	The thing we only could do was to 'enjoy' the heavy rain, take a shower of rain and drink rain.
(B27)	I saw the sun appeared again.	Linear: v-form	I saw the sun appear again.
(B29)	I couldn't avoid 'washed' by the heavy rains.	Linear: voice	I couldn't avoid being 'washed' by the heavy rain.
(B30) (R)	I love the sunshine but hate the rain very much, it often makes me wet because I don't bring my umbrella when I leave my home the sun is shining.	Linear: word order	I love the sunshine but hate the rain very much, for the latter often makes me wet because I don't bring umbrella if the sun is shining when I leave home.
(B33)	Our food couldn't eat anymore!	Linear: voice	Our food couldn't be eaten anymore!

1E – LEXICAL ACCURACY

(B1)	<i>The black clouds moved over. It <u>discovered</u> the sunlight.</i>	Lexical: verb	The sky clouded over blocking the sunlight.
(B2)	<i>The rain was more heavier time to time</i>	Lexical: adverb	The rain was getting heavier.
(B3) (R)	<i>After this time, I put a umbrella in my locker to prevent the sudden rain.</i>	Lexical: verb	After then, I always put an umbrella in my locker to get ready for the sudden rain.
(B4)	<i>The destination was a hill after my house.</i>	Lexical: preposition	The destination was a hill behind my house.
(B4) (R)	<i>Before I saw my house, I saw a huge tree was fired. So I must climb over the tree to come back my home.</i>	Lexical: verb	Before I saw my house, I saw a huge tree was on fire. So I must climb over the tree to go back my home.
(B4)	<i>Before I saw my house, I saw a huge tree was fired. So I must climb over the tree to <u>come</u> back my home.</i>	Lexical: verb	Before I saw my house, I saw a huge tree was on fire. So I have to climb over the tree to go back my home.
(B6)	<i>As our voice spoke louder and louder, ...</i>	Lexical: verb	As our voice was louder and louder, ...
(B6)	<i>We all felt that water fell <u>unto</u> our head and clothes.</i>	Lexical: preposition	We all felt that water was falling on our head and clothes.
(B6)	<i>We located about 2 kilo apart to where with roof, so we continuously ran forward and much faster.</i>	Lexical: preposition	We were located about 2 kilo apart from where with roof, so we continuously ran forward and much faster.
(B6)	<i>Gradually, the rainwater went into my T-shirt and then my short, it even <u>laid</u> inside the shoes.</i>	Lexical: verb	Gradually, the rainwater went into my T-shirt and then my short. It even got into the shoes.
(B6)	<i>We jumped into a bus in hurry in order to hasten home for a rest and <u>laid</u> in the bed.</i>	Lexical: verb	We jumped into a bus in a hurry in order to hasten home for a rest and lying on the bed.
(B6)	<i>Sitting on the seat, I felt sleepy with a <u>cloudy</u> sight.</i>	Lexical: adj	Sitting on the seat, I felt sleepy with a blurred sight.
(B7)	<i>The weather was so quickly to change from bad to good, I thought the god may play a trick <u>with</u> me.</i>	Lexical: preposition	The weather quickly changed from bad to good. I thought that God might have played a trick on me.
(B8)	<i>Ivy and I were wandering along the park, <u>hand-by-hand</u>.</i>	Lexical: preposition	Ivy and I were wandering along the park, hand-in-hand.
(B8)	<i>Some grey, gloomy clouds were gradually gathering together with a quick speed.</i>	Lexical: preposition	Some grey, gloomy clouds were gradually gathering together at a quick speed.
(B8)	<i>The drops that fell onto my face were becoming lesser and lesser.</i>	Lexical: adv	The drops that fell onto my face were becoming less and less.
(B9)	<i>I waited the suitable bus came.</i>	Lexical: adj	I waited for the right bus.
(B10)	<i>But the sky suddenly became full of black clouds, lighting in the sky and storm <u>blown</u> out.</i>	Lexical: verb	But the sky suddenly became full of black clouds. Lightning flashed in the sky and storms broke/ raged.
(B11)	<i>I got a bad cold, and absent for school <u>for</u> school for a week.</i>	Lexical: preposition	I got a bad cold, and was absent from school for a week.
(B12)	<i>Every mothers should have most of the power, no need to do anything in the <u>flat</u>.</i>	Lexical: noun	Every mother should have most of the power, having no need to do anything at home.
(B13) (R)	<i>That day was a shiny day.</i>	Lexical: adj	That day was a sunny day.
(B15)	<i>I met a friend to swim at a beach.</i>	Lexical: verb	I went to swim at a beach with a friend.
(B15)	<i>We wore the <u>swim-trunks</u> and went to swim.</i>	Lexical: noun	We wore the swimming suits and went to swim.
(B15)	<i>My friend said that the sky would be good again.</i>	Lexical: noun	My friend said that the weather would be good again.
(B16)	<i>I increased my walking speed.</i>	Lexical: verb	I walked more quickly.
(B16)	<i>It was such a heavy shower of rain that <u>wet</u> through my whole body and <u>suffered</u> me a bad cold.</i>	Lexical: verb	It was such a heavy shower of rain that my whole body was all wet and I got a bad cold.
(B17)	<i>Some people <u>laid</u> under the coloured tents</i>	Lexical: verb	Some people lay inside the colourful tents.
(B24)	<i>The rain <u>pretended</u> to become smaller.</i>	Lexical: verb	The rain seemed to become smaller.
(B24)	<i>I need to go in the several minutes' walk to the bus stop.</i>	Lexical: verb	I need to take the several minutes' walk to the bus stop.

(B26)	<i>The drains and puddles were covered by water and a lot of trash and things flew everywhere.</i>	Lexical: preposition	The drains and puddles were covered with water and a lot of trash and things floating everywhere.
(B26)	<i>The drains and puddles were covered by water and a lot of trash and things flew everywhere.</i>	Lexical: verb	The drains and puddles were covered with water and a lot of trash and things floating everywhere.
(B29)	<i>I dressed on a beautiful new skirt and did not take any care about the weather.</i>	Lexical: verb	I put on a beautiful new skirt and did not care about the weather.
(B30)	<i>I felt happy about the stoppage of rainfall.</i>	Lexical: verb	I felt happy about the stopping of rainfall.
(B30)	<i>I was troubled by my moistened clothes.</i>	Lexical: adj	I was troubled by my soaked clothes.
(B31)	<i>I had to have a journey surrounded by rain</i>	Lexical: preposition	I had to have a journey under the rain.
(B31)	<i>When I was walking along the road, a bike ran forwards me.</i>	Lexical: preposition	When I was walking along the road, a bike ran towards me.
(B34)	<i>There was no taxi everywhere.</i>	Lexical: adv	There was no taxi anywhere.
(B35) (R)	<i>It was sunny at the time I had no way out.</i>	Lexical: verb	It was sunny when I did not go out.

2 – INTRA-SENTENTIAL ACCURACY

(B2)	Summer, which is a season that I hate most. That day <u>which</u> was a summer day, so I did not bring my umbrella.	Structural: relativization	Summer is a season that I hate most. That day was a summer day, so I did not bring my umbrella.
(B2)	On the street, I saw that the sky was turning to black.	Structural: Participle Phrase	Walking on the street, I saw that the sky was turning to black.
(B2)	My body was very wet, ^ I felt very uncomfortable.	Comma splice	My body was very wet, and I felt very uncomfortable.
(B2)	A moment later, it really rained and very heavy, just like some dogs and cats dropped from the sky.	Structural	A moment later, it really rained very heavily, just like some cats and dogs dropping from the sky.
(B2)	I got to hospital, with an extremely wet body like just had had a shower.	Structural: Participle Phrase	I got to hospital, with an extremely wet body like just having had a shower.
(B5)	The hospital told me that she was in a very dangerous situation. I must went to the hospital immediately	Comma splice	The hospital told me that she was in a very dangerous situation. I must go to the hospital immediately.
(B6)	Moment later, the sun reappeared, the warm sunlight shined onto my face. ^ I felt warm and calm.	Comma splice	Some moment later, the sun reappeared. The warm sunlight shone onto my face and I felt warm and calm.
(B6)	Gradually, the rainwater went into my T-shirt and then my short, it even laid inside the shoes.	Comma splice	Gradually, the rainwater went into my T-shirt and then my short. It even got into the shoes.
(B6)	The heavy rain come suddenly, so no one had prepared anything before <u>set out</u> .	Structural: Participle Phrase	The heavy rain come suddenly, so no one had prepared anything before setting out.
(B9)	I turned of f the TVset. Since I have already to make an appointment with myfiend, Tom.	Period splice	I turned off the TV set, since I have already made an appointment with my friend, Tom.
(B10)	I ran as fast as I could. ^ everyone on the street ran away too.	Comma splice	I ran as fast as I could and everyone on the street was running too.
(B10)	But the sky suddenly became full of black clouds, lightning in the sky and storm blown out.	Comma splice	But the sky suddenly became full of black clouds. Lightning flashed in the sky and storms broke/ raged.
(B11)	After waiting for the bus for half an hour. I eventually got on it..	Period splice	After waiting for the bus for half an hour, I eventually got on it.
(B11)	The most unlucky thing was my brand-new camera was out of order, and failed to repair.	Structural: Subordinate phrase	The most unlucky thing was that my brand-new camera was out of order, and couldn't be repaired.

(B12)	<i>Every mothers should have most of the power, no need to do anything in the flat.</i>	Structural: Participle Phrase	Every mother should have most of the power, having no need to do anything at home.
(B13)	<i>Although I changed my clothes immediately. But I still had a bad cold</i>	Period splice	Although I changed my clothes immediately, I still had a bad cold.
(B15)	<i>There was becoming cold and the wind blew towards us strongly.</i>	Structural: zero subject	It was becoming cold and the wind blew towards us strongly.
(B15)	<i>The clouds was too white that like the milk.</i>	Structural: sentence patterns (L1)	The clouds were as white as milk.
(B15)	<i>The sun was shine enough for us to wear sunglasses.</i>	Structural: sentence patterns	The sun was so bright that we had to wear sunglasses.
(B18)	<i>I still ran to my friend's home quickly, after ten minutes. I run to my friend's home, but my clothes were very wet.</i>	Comma splice	I was still running to my friend's home quickly. After ten minutes, I arrived at her home, but my clothes were very wet.
(B18)	<i>Before I went to her home, I opened the window and saw it was a sunny day so I didn't bring my umbrella.</i>	Structural: subordinate phrase	Before I went to her home, I opened the window and saw that it was a sunny day so I didn't bring my umbrella.
(B21)	<i>We quickly went into the shop in order to avoid the raining water made our clothes wet.</i>	Structural: Participle phrase (L1)	We quickly went into the shop in order to avoid the raining water from making our clothes wet.
(B21)	<i>We were very worried about it would rain again.</i>	Structural	We were very worried that it would rain again.
(B25)	<i>Our whole bodies were very wet, liked just came back from the swimming pool.</i>	Structural: Participle Phrase	Our whole bodies were very wet, like just coming back from the swimming pool.
(B25) (R)	<i>Our shirts, trousers, socks, all were wet seems could squeeze water from them.</i>	Structural: Subordinate clause (L1)	Our shirts, trousers, socks, all were wet that it seemed that water could be squeezed from them.
(B32)	<i>I saw a woman brought a fan.</i>	Structural: Participle Phrase	I saw a woman bringing a fan.
(B32)	<i>However, everyone thought that there would be sunny again.</i>	Structural: zero subject	However, everyone thought that it would be sunny again.
(B32)	<i>I did not go to visit my uncle since I caught a cold during escaped. I had to go home to take a bath.</i>	Comma splice	I did not go to visit my uncle since I caught a cold during escape. I had to go home to take a bath.
(B32)	<i>They carried on to wander the street included me.</i>	Structural: Participle Phrase	They carried on to wander the street including me.

3A – TEXTUAL COHERENCE AND REFERENCE

(B3)	<i>But I felt ^ interesting of running in the rain.</i>	"It" omission	But I felt it interesting of running in the rain.
(B5)	<i>At this time, the doctors came out of the operation room, with my mother lay on the bed.</i>	Wrong reference	At that time, the doctors came out of the operation room, with my mother lying on the bed.
(B23)	<i>Although they were staying under the tree, but our clothes and the belongings still got wet.</i>	Anaphoric confusion	Although we were staying under the tree, but our clothes and the belongings still got wet.
(B26)	<i>The weather became very bad and ^ rained heavily with thunder and lightning.</i>	Anaphoric confusion	The weather became very bad and it was raining heavily with thunder and lightning.
(B30)	<i>I love the sunshine but hate the rain very much, it often makes me wet...</i>	Undefined referent	I love the sunshine but hate the rain very much. The rain often makes me wet...

3B – TENSE, ASPECT & MOOD

(B1)	<i>Before I started the journey, the weather is very good.</i>	Tense Error	Before I started the journey, the weather was very good.
(B2)	<i>I turned off the radio after listened the weather report.</i>	Aspect Error	I turned off the radio after listening to the weather report.
(B3)	<i>A moment later, it really rained and very heavy, just like some dogs and cats dropped from the sky.</i>	Aspect Error	A moment later, it really rained and very heavy, just like some dogs and cats dropping from the sky.
(B5)	<i>At this time, the doctors came out of the operation room, with my mother lay on the bed.</i>	Aspect Error	At this time, the doctors came out of the operation room, with my mother lying on the bed.

(B5)	The doctor told me, "the operation have been very successful, but your mother had to rest for two week in there."	Tense Error	The doctor me, "the operation was very successful, but your mother has to rest for two weeks there."
(B6)	The heavy rain come suddenly, so no one had prepared anything before set out.	Tense Error	The heavy rain came suddenly, so no one had prepared anything before setting out.
(B6)	At the very beginning, since the sun shined brightly as well as the weather report said that the weather will be very well...	Aspect Error	At the very beginning, since the sun was shining brightly and the weather report said that the weather would be very well...
(B6)	We all felt that water fell unto our head and clothes.	Aspect Error	We all felt that water was falling unto our head and clothes.
(B7)	But Sam was refused. He said that he haven't finished his homework.	Tense Error	But Sam was refused. He said that he hadn't finished his homework.
(B7)	The weather was so quickly to change from had to good, I thought that the god may play a trick with me.	Tense Error	The weather quickly changed from bad to good. I though that God might have played a trick on me.
(B8)	Since Ivy hates cloud sky, she was quite annoyed.	Tense Error	Since Ivy hated cloud sky, she was quite annoyed.
(B9)	So I ran along the bridge very fast. And I found that there are a bus stop luckily.	Tense Error	So I ran along the bridge very fast. Luckily, I found that there was a bus stop.
(B9)	However, I get ill. And I take a rest for 2 days.	Tense Error	However, I got ill. And I took a rest for 2 days.
(B10)	The sky was clean and the sun shone brightly.	Aspect Error	The sky was clear and the sun was shining brightly.
(B10)	I ran as fast as I could, everyone on the street ran away too.	Aspect Error	I ran as fast as I could and everyone on the street was running too.
(B14)	I would like to bring an umbrella the Observatory said it will rain today.	Tense Error	I would like to bring an umbrella because the Observatory said it would rain today.
(B15)	There was becoming cold and the wind blew towards us strongly.	Aspect Error	It was becoming cold and the wind was blowing towards us strongly.
(B15)	I am very regreted that why I don't refuse my friend's request.	Tense Error	I am very regretted that why I didn't refuse my friend's request.
(B17)	Some people ran, even the dog.	Tense Error	Some people were running, so did the dog.
(B18)	The rain fell like a big waterfall.	Aspect Error	The rain was falling like a big waterfall.
(B19)	Plenty of raindrops fall on my head.	Tense Error	Plenty of raindrops were falling on my head.
(B19)	Everything was good again, just like nothing happened.	Tense Error	Everything was good again, as if nothing had happened.
(B19)	A car passed and splash water onto my clothes.	Tense Error	A car passed and splashed water onto my clothes.
(B21)	We went downstairs of the mall and we came to a bus stop because I want to take her home. But we waited it for a long time.	Tense Error	We went downstairs of the mall and came to a bus stop because I wanted to take her home. But we had waited it for a long time.
(B21)	Then we get into a taxi and went home.	Tense Error	Then we got into a taxi and went home.
(B24)	My mother wonder what happened to me.	Tense Error	My mother was wondering what had happened to me.
(B24)	It's such a heavy rain that I haven't seen before.	Tense Error	It's such a heavy rain that I hadn't seen before.
(B25)	The rain fell liked waterfall.	Aspect Error	The rain was falling like a waterfall.
(B25)	The thing we only could do is 'enjoyed' the heavy rain, took a shower of rain and drank rain.	Tense Error	The thing we only could do was to 'enjoy' the heavy rain, take a shower of rain and drink rain.
(B25)	Yesterday, the weather seems fine.	Tense Error	Yesterday, the weather seemed fine.
(B26)	The weather became very bad and rained heavily.	Tense Error	The weather became very bad and it was raining heavily.
(B28)	It didn't move and its eyes didn't open. It dies after the heavy rain.	Tense Error	It didn't move and its eyes didn't open. It died after the heavy rain.
(B29)	I woke up at 10 and having a bath in the bath tub.	Aspect Error	I woke up at 10 am and had a bath in the bath tub.
(B29)	We went home soon and haven't any celebration.	Tense Error	We went home soon and hadn't any celebration.

(B29)	<i>At the same time I heard many people screamed.</i>	Aspect Error	At the same time, I heard many people screaming.
(B30)	<i>I appreciated the sky and some clouds. Suddenly the sky turns cloudy.</i>	Tense Error	I appreciated the sky and some clouds. Suddenly the sky turned cloudy.
(B32)	<i>No one had umbrella, neither have I.</i>	Tense Error	No one had an umbrella, neither did I.
(B33)	<i>We all ran to the kiosk as fast as we can.</i>	Tense Error	We all ran to the kiosk as fast as we could.
(B34)	<i>Our body was wet although we run very fast.</i>	Tense Error	Our body was wet although we had been running very fast.
(B34)	<i>We found that all our clothes, socks and shoes are full of water.</i>	Tense Error	We found that all our clothes, socks and shoes were full of water.
(B35)	<i>I knew it was raining as more and more water dropped.</i>	Tense Error	I knew it was raining as more and more water was dropping.

4 - PRESENTATION

(B1)	<i>At the beinging. ...</i>	Spelling	At the beginning....
(B1)		No indentation	
(B2)	<i>I head the thunder....</i>	Spelling	I heard the thunder....
(B2)	<i>I also saw the lightning. It was a <u>fresh</u> light.</i>	Homonymn	I also saw the lightning. It was a flash light.
(B7)	<i>And I also had a headache and sore-throat and fever. This made me couldn't go to school and stayed at the bed for a <u>weak</u>.</i>	Homonymn	I also had a headache, sore-throat and fever. So I couldn't go to school and stayed at bed for a week.
(B17)	<i>I am very regreted why...</i>	Spelling	I am very regretted that...
(B19)	<i>I quickly used the <u>hand-drier</u> to dry the clothes.</i>	Spelling	I quickly used the hand-dryer to dry the clothes.
(B21)	<i>Vivian had bought of pair of glasses...</i>	Spelling	Vivian had bought one pair of glasses.
(B24)	<i>On my way to the library, there were sunshines. they shine on me.</i>		On my way to the library, there was sunshine shining on me.
(B25)	<i>After we had finished out lunch...</i>	Spelling	After we had finished our lunch...
(B25)	<i>Our shirts, <u>toursers</u>, socks...</i>	Spelling	Our shirts, trousers, socks...
(B27)	<i>How can we swim under such bad <u>whetlier</u>?</i>	Homonymn	How can we swim under such a bad weather?

Appendix 6 – A List of Incidences of Inaccuracy in L1 (English) Writings of M3 Subjects

1A - OMISSION

	Single Incidence		Suggestions
(C1)	It would be ^ good experience for someone that can handle it.	Omission: article	It would be a good experience for someone who can handle it.
(C5)	My first friend, Marco, works ^ nights and week-ends ^ 5:30 to 10:30 pm and his overall average is a 92%.	Omission: preposition	My first friend, Marco, works at nights and in week-ends, from 5:30 to 10:30 pm and his overall average is 92%.
(C5)	My first friend, Marco, works ^ nights and week-ends ^ 5:30 to 10:30 pm and his overall average is a 92%.	Omission: preposition	My first friend, Marco, works at nights and in week-ends, from 5:30 to 10:30 pm and his overall average is 92%.
(C5)	My first friend, Marco, works ^ nights and week-ends ^ 5:30 to 10:30 pm and his overall average is a 92%.	Omission: preposition	My first friend, Marco, works at nights and in week-ends, from 5:30 to 10:30 pm and his overall average is 92%.
(C9)	It's ^ good experience for teenagers to have a part time job...	Omission: article	It's a good experience for teenagers to have a part time job...
(C11)	Do you think you can juggle ^ school work and a part-time job at the same time?	Omission: preposition	Do you think you can juggle with school work and a part-time job at the same time?
(C14)	Some people think that part-time jobs and school aren't a good mix. I support this ^ in some cases and not in others.	Omission: noun	Some people think that part-time jobs and school aren't a good mix. I support this notion in some cases and not in others.

1B - REDUNDANCY

(C5)	I have a part time job and it does not interven with my school work.	Redundant: Preposition	I have a part time job and it does not intervene my school work.
(C5)	My first friend, Marco, works nights and week-ends 5:30 to 10:30 pm and his overall average is a 92%.	Redundant: article	My first friend, Marco, works at nights and in week-ends, from 5:30 to 10:30 pm and his overall average is 92%.
(C11)	I work every Sunday at my local synagogue and yet I am able to complete all of my homework.	Redundant: Preposition	I work every Sunday at my local synagogue and yet I am able to complete all my homework.
(C12)	To me my personal opinion is that you job should never interfere with your very important and essential school work.	Redundant: phrase	My opinion is that you job should never interfere with your very important and essential school work.
(C19)	I am writing on behalf of the subject of teenagers and parttime jobs, do they affect our success in school.	Redundant: phrase	I am writing on the subject of teenagers and part-time jobs that if they affect our success in school.
(C19)	In my opinion, I feel that parttime jobs only put stress on teenagers.	Redundant: phrase	In my opinion, part time jobs only add stress on teenagers.
(C20)	It's very hard to concentrate because of you are always disrupted with work and school at the same moment.	Redundant: preposition	It's very hard to concentrate because you are always torn between work and school at the same moment.

1C - VERTICAL ACCURACY

(C8)	When are people going to live their life <u>slow</u> and not rush into the working world?	Vertical: Adj used as Adv	When are people going to live their life slowly and not rush into the working world?
(C10)	For the simple reason that they are already too preoccupied with friends, school, family and <u>any other curricular activity</u> ...	Vertical: Plural N	For the simple reason that they are already too preoccupied with friends, school, family and many other curricular activities ...
(C10)	I find it a shame that <u>student</u> can throw away their lives just for a couple of dollars.	Vertical: Plural N	I find it a shame that students can throw away their lives just for a couple of dollars.

(C11)	I think that part-time jobs do not endanger student's mark.	Vertical: Plural N	I think that part-time jobs do not endanger student's marks.
(C16)	I feel that kid should not work part time while going to high school because they don't eat properly or study properly.	Vertical: Plural N	I feel that kids should not work part time while going to high school because they don't eat properly or study properly.
(C18)	Recent studies show that part-time jobs do have a negative effect on student's health.	Vertical: Plural N	recent studies show that part-time jobs do have a negative effect on students' health.
(C20)	Today there are more and more parent's that are worried about their child's education because of their part time jobs.	Vertical: plural N	Today there are more and more parents who are worried about their children's education because of their part time jobs.

ID – LINEAR ACCURACY

(C7)	If the teen can't <u>oblige</u> by a simple understanding like the one stated above than again it's up to the parents to take the responsibility...	Linear: voice	If the teen can't be obliged by a simple understanding like the one stated above, then again it's up to the parents to take the responsibility...
(C11)	Every person has thier own personal thoughts on the subject: "does part-time jobs endanger high school students marks".	Linear: S-V agreement	Everyone has their own personal thoughts on the subject: "do part-time jobs endanger high school students marks".
(C15)	It is only incorrect if the students wants to have a good education and get a good job.	Linear: S-V agreement	It is only incorrect if the students want to have a good education and get a good job.
(C16)	It also <u>stop</u> kids form concentrating in school because they are remembering how hungry they are.	Linear: S-V agreement	It also stops kids from concentrating in school because they are remembering how hungry they are.
(C17)	Also get one if it's <u>only necessary</u> because you're a teenager only once in our life & you have the rest of it to make and budget it.	Linear: word order	Also you should get one only if it's necessary because you're a teenager only once in our life and you have the rest of your life to make money and budget it.

1E – LEXICAL ACCURACY

(C2)	It takes so much work to get <u>on</u> the international team.	Lexical: preposition	It takes so much work to get into the international team.
(C4)	In conclusion, if <u>the</u> person decides to have a part time job, loose sleep and be cranky all day at school it's his/her choice.	Lexical: determiner	In conclusion, if a person decides to have a part time job, lose sleep and be cranky all day at school it's his/her choice.
(C8)	A lot of parents and teachers think that part time jobs <u>are</u> a very bad effect on their work.	Lexical: verb	A lot of parents and teachers think that part time jobs have a very bad effect on the students' work.
(C11)	<u>Every</u> person has thier own personal thoughts on the subject: "does part-time jobs endanger high school students marks".	Lexical: subject	Everyone has their own personal thoughts on the subject: "do part-time jobs endanger high school students' marks".
(C16)	It also stop kids form concentrating <u>in</u> school because they are remembering how hungry they are.	Lexical: preposition	It also stops kids from concentrating at school because they are remembering how hungry they are.
(C19)	Firstly, <u>between</u> friends, hobbies and school, a teenager's schedule is already hectic.	Lexical: preposition	Firstly, among friends, hobbies and school, a teenager's schedule is already hectic.

2 – INTRA-SENTENTIAL ACCURACY

(C1)	I think that students <u>that</u> have part time jobs should be ...	Structural: subordination	I think that students who have part time jobs should be...
(C1) (R)	I think that having a part time job all depends on <u>which</u> kid wants to have one.	Structural: subordination	I think that having a part time job or not all depends on why kids want to have one.
(C9)	There are lots of teachers <u>that</u> are tired of their students not doing their homework...	Structural: subordination	There are lots of teachers who are tired of their students not doing their homework...

(C14)	I deliver papers once a week, but I also play football 4 to 5 times a week. It's the same as if I worked.	Structural: coordination	I deliver papers once a week, and I also play football 4 to 5 times a week. It's the same as if I worked.
(C15)	Many people wonder "do part-time jobs affect students from passing"?	Structural: reported speech	Many people wonder if "part-time jobs affect students from passing".
(C16)	Kid have to ask themselves is money worth my education.	Structural: reported speech	Kids have to ask themselves if money worth my education.
(C17)	I have very mixed thought about this subject. Think teenagers should and shouldn't have part time jobs.	Structural: reported speech	I have very mixed though about this subject that whether teenagers should or shouldn't have part time jobs.
(C17)	... he/she should think about the outcome in the end Will it be positive or negative.	Structural: reported speech	... he/she should think about the outcome in the end whether it would be positive or negative.
(C18)	Big Macs and chips start passing as lunch and supper more and more frequently, ^ not exactly healthy eating.	Structural: reported speech	Big Macs and chips start passing as lunch and supper more and more frequently, which is not exactly healthy eating.
(C19)	I am writing on behalf of the subject of teenagers and parttime jobs, <u>do</u> they affect our success in school.	Structural: reported speech	I am writing on the subject of teenagers and parttime jobs that if they affect our success in school.
(C20)	I know that it gives cash but wouldn't you after leave at 16 instead of 18.	Structural: reported speech/ punctuation	I know that it gives cash but if you would rather leave (school) at 16 instead of 18.
(C20)	Today there are more and more parent's <u>that</u> are worried about their child's education because of their part time jobs.	Structural: subordination	Today there are more and more parents who are worried about their children's education because of their part time jobs.

3B – TENSE, ASPECT & MOOD

(C11)	My brother <u>use</u> to work 3 nights a week and was unable to keep up with all his school work.	Tense Error	My brother <u>used</u> to work 3 nights a week and was unable to keep up with all his school work.
(C19)	I am writing on behalf of the subject of teenagers and parttime jobs, <u>do</u> they affect our success in school.	Mood Error	I am writing on the subject of teenagers and part-time jobs that if the latter would affect our success in school.

4 - PRESENTATION

(C2)	Sooner <u>of</u> later, we will have the game of the millenium.	Spelling	Sooner or later, we will have the game of the millenium.
(C2)	When the puck is <u>droped</u> at center ice, we will see who's sport it is.	Spelling	When the puck is dropped at center ice, we will see whose sport it is.
(C2)	When the puck is dropt at center ice, we will see <u>who's</u> sport it is.	Spelling: homophone	When the puck is dropped at center ice, we will see whose sport it is.
(C3)	Personally, I find that students with part time jobs have a better chance in <u>succeeding</u> in life than others who get <u>spaled</u> by their parents.	Spelling	Personally, I find that students with part time jobs have a better chance in succeeding in life than others who get spared by their parents.
(C3)	This is very important in the educational feild .	Spelling	This is very important in the educational field.
(C3)	A few adults stereotype adolencences to be out of line and mischevous.	Spelling	A few adults stereotype adolescents to be out of line and mischievous.
(C3)	A few adults stereotype adolencences to be out of line and <u>mischevous</u> .	Spelling	A few adults stereotype adolescents to be out of line and mischievous.
(C3)	If these adults were to see the students work to earn their money they would change their point of view <u>twards</u> the youth of their society.	Spelling	If these adults were to see the students work to earn their money, they would change their point of view towards the youth of their society.
(C3)	You want to <u>succed</u> in life and that in any situation you have to work for what you want.	Spelling	You want to succeed in life and that in any situation you have to work for what you want.

(C4)	I feel that it's also the responsibility of the part time employ <u>ee</u> to check his time.	Spelling	I feel that it's also the responsibility of the part time employee to check his time.
(C4)	I think that a part time job has it's pros and cons.	Spelling: homophone	I think that a part time job has its pros and cons.
(C4)	A con, is that you loose time to sleep because they have to do homework at 10/11 pm.	Spelling: homophone	A con is that you lose time to sleep because they have to do homework at 10/11 pm.
(C5)	I have a part time job and it does not <u>interven</u> with my school work.	Spelling	I have a part time job and it does not intervene my school work.
(C5)	I m <u>ange</u> to balance both.	Spelling	I manage to balance both.
(C5)	If a student cannot balance both <u>equaly</u> ...	Spelling	If a student cannot balance both equally...
(C5)	They should give up their part time job and <u>consinrat</u> on their school work.	Spelling	They should give up their part time job and concentrate on their school work.
(C5)	They are in a position <u>were</u> they should not have a part time job.	Spelling	They are in a position where they should not have a part time job.
(C6)	If you're responsible and capable to handle school and homework and a job with all of it's <u>responsabilities</u> ...	Spelling: les congénies	If you're responsible and capable to handle school and homework and a job with all of their responsibilities...
(C7)	It's the <u>parents</u> responsibility to be sure that the children ponder the fact that...	Spelling	It's the parents' responsibility to be sure that the children ponder the fact that...
(C7)	If the teen can't oblige by a simple understanding like the one stated above <u>than</u> again it's up to the parents to take the responsibility...	Spelling: homophone	If the teen can't be obliged by a simple understanding like the one stated above, then again it's up to the parents to take the responsibility...
(C7)	... both teens and parents should take part in the decision in <u>weather</u> or not the teen should get a job...	Spelling: homophone	... both teens and parents should take part in the decision in whether or not the teen should get a job...
(C8)	... you have time to eat <u>propary</u> and do your work.	Spelling	... you have time to eat properly and do your work.
(C8)	... they should be able to deal with the <u>concequences</u> ...	Spelling	... they should be able to deal with the consequences...
(C9)	The <u>teechers</u> could give you less homework.	Spelling	The teachers could give you less homework.
(C9) (R)	They <u>good</u> bye themselves their own stuff and they could save up their own money for what ever they want.	Spelling	They could buy themselves their own stuff and they could save up their own money for what ever they want.
(C10)	I do not agree to the statement <u>comptely</u> .	Spelling	I do not agree to the statement completely.
(C10)	For the simple reason that they are already too <u>preocupied</u> with friends, school, family and any other curricular activity ...	Spelling	For the simple reason that they are already too preoccupied with friends, school, family and many other curricular activities ...
(C10)	He was in air cadets but <u>unfortanaty</u> he had to quit too.	Spelling	He was in air cadets but unfortunately he had to quit too.
(C11)	Every person has thier own personal thoughts on the subject: "does part-time jobs endanger high school students marks".	Spelling	Everyone has their own personal thoughts on the subject: "do part-time jobs endanger high school students' marks".
(C11)	Every person has thier own personal thoughts on the subject: "does part-time jobs endanger high school <u>students</u> marks".	Punctuation	Everyone has their own personal thoughts on the subject: "do part-time jobs endanger high school students' marks".
(C11)	About 25% of high school student's actually have part-time jobs and only 5% are suffering <u>academicaly</u> .	Spelling	About 25% of high school students actually have part-time jobs and only 5% are suffering academically.
(C11)	20% are lacking sleep and are <u>malnurited</u> .	Spelling	20% are lacking sleep and are malnourished.
(C11)	About 25% of high school student's actually have part-time jobs and only 5% are suffering academicaly.	Punctuation	About 25% of high school students actually have part-time jobs and only 5% are suffering academically.
(C12)	You shouldn't have to worry about <u>to</u> many things.	Spelling: homophone	You shouldn't have to worry about too many things.
(C12)	So you now know how I feel about the <u>proceeding</u> topic.	Spelling	So you now know how I feel about the preceding topic.

(C12)	It would be really hard to find time for work, school, studying and maintaining a nice life.	Spelling	It would be really hard to find time for work, school, studying and maintaining a nice life.
(C13)	... they will be tired and wont do they're school work properly...	Spelling: homophone	... they will be tired and won't do their school work properly...
(C13)	... they will be tired and wont do they're school work properly...	Punctuation	... they will be tired and won't do their school work properly...
(C14)	I get tired, but I still manege to get good marks in school.	Spelling	I get tired, but I still manage to get good marks in school.
(C14)	I'm not totaly agreeing with them.	Spelling	I'm not totally agreeing with them.
(C16)		No indentation	
(C16)	By the time they get home it's some where between 9:30pm and 10pm and their is bearly any time to do their homework.	Spelling	By the time they get home it's some where between 9:30pm and 10pm and there is barely any time to do their homework.
(C16)	By the time they get home it's some where between 9:30pm and 10pm and their is bearly any time to do their homework.	Spelling: homophone	By the time they get home it's some where between 9:30pm and 10pm and there is barely any time to do their homework.
(C16)	I believ they shouldn't.	Spelling	I believe they shouldn't.
(C16)	It also stop kids form concentrating in school because they are remembering how hungry they are.	Spelling	It also stops kids from concentrating at school because they are remembering how hungry they are.
(C16)	By the time they get home it's some where between 9:30pm and 10pm and their is bearly any time to do their homework.	Spelling	By the time they get home it's some where between 9:30pm and 10pm and there is barely any time to do their homework.
(C16)	Then they end up cram and end up failing theirir classes.	Spelling	Then they end up cram and end up failing their classes.
(C20)	If you work you could get headachs.	Spelling	If you work you could get headaches.
(C20)	Today there are more and more parent's that are worried about their child's education because of their part time jobs.	Punctuation	Today there are more and more parents who are worried about their children's education because of their part time jobs.
(C20)	Their report cards won't be to good.	Spelling: homophone	Their report cards won't be too good.
(C20)		No indentation	

Appendix 7 – A List of Incidences of Inaccuracy in L2 (French) Writings of M3 Subjects

1A - OMISSION

	Single Incidence		Suggestion
(D1)	Si les élèves a capable du balancé son études, son travail, et ^ santé je pense...	Omission: déterminer	Si les élèves sont capables de faire tenir en équilibre ses études, son travail, et son santé je pense...
(D1)	Tu ^ seulement le temp de faire des choises important...	Omission: verb	Tu as seulement le temp de faire des choses importants...
(D2)	Par exemple, ^ un journée normale pour un adolescent; il réveille à 6h30 le matin, mange son petit déjeuner et prends son douche.	Omission: preposition	Par exemple, voici une journée normale pour un adolescent; il se réveille à 6h30 le matin, mange son petit déjeuner et prend sa douche.
(D2)	^ 7h le matin, il part pour école.	Omission: preposition	A 7h le matin, il part pour l'école.
(D2)	7h le matin, il part pour ^ école.	Omission: déterminer	A 7h le matin, il part pour l'école.
(D2)	5:30 il part pour ^ travail.	Omission: déterminer	A 17h30, il part pour le travail.
(D2)	^ 7h le matin, il part pour école.	Omission: preposition	A 7h le matin, il part pour l'école.
(D2)	7h le matin, il part pour ^ école.	Omission: déterminer	A 7h le matin, il part pour l'école.
(D2)	5:30 il part pour ^ travail.	Omission: déterminer	A 17h30, il part pour le travail.
(D2)	Et deuxiemement, ^ le manque d'heure pour dormir qu'on perde rapidement, nous nous sommes toujours fatiguer.	Omission: verb	Deuxièmement, vu le manque d'heures pour dormir qu'on perd rapidement, nous sommes toujours fatigués.
(D2)	On manque d'informations pour des exams ou ^ test et il ou elle va échouer tout ses classes et cours. Vous échoueront l'année.	Omission: déterminer	On manque des informations pour des examens ou des tests et il ou elle risque d'échouer à tous ses classes et cours. On échouera à l'année.
(D4)	Deuxièmement, c'est la responsabilité de l'élève de cheque ces heures pour qu'il fait ses devoirs dans la librairie a ^ lunch et le recreation.	Omission: noun	Deuxièmement, c'est la responsabilité de l'élève de planifier ses heures pour qu'il fait ses devoirs dans la bibliothèque pendant l'heure lunch et la récréation.
(D4) (R)	En conclusion j'exprime que c'est le coix du personne si il/elle veut travailler, et ^ peut être échoué ou être une personne coléreux.	Omission: subject	En conclusion je crois que c'est le choix de l'individu s'il ou elle veut travailler, mais on risque peut être d'échouer ou de devenir une personne colère.
(D4)	En conclusion j'exprime que c'est le coix du personne si il/elle veut travailler, et peut être ^ échoué ou être une personne coléreux.	Omission: preposition	En conclusion je crois que c'est le choix de l'individu s'il ou elle veut travailler, mais on risque peut être d'échouer ou de devenir une personne colère.
(D8)	Je pense que le travail à temps partiel ^ peut être bon...	Omission: verb	Je pense que le travail à temps partiel est peut être bon...
(D9) (R)	... par-ce que sa préparé ^ pour la vrai vie.	Omission: Object	... par-ce que ça prépare des élèves à la vie dans la réalité.
(D11)	A mon avis, je suis d'accord et contre ^ se sujet.	Omission: preposition	A mon avis, je suis en accord et en désaccord avec cette affirmation.
(D14)	Je ne suis pas d'accord ^ que tout le monde à du difficulter.	Omission: phrase	Je ne suis pas d'accord avec l'idée que tout le monde a des difficultés.
(D14)	Même si je suis fatiguer, j'ai toujours des bonnes notes en ^ école.	Omission: déterminer	Même si je suis fatigué, j'obtiens toujours de bonnes notes à l'école.

(D14)	Je pense que le travail à temps partiel nuit ^ les études a certains personnes et affecte pas les autres.	Omission: phrase	Je pense que le travail à temps partiel nuit aux études dans le cas de certaines personnes et n'affecte pas les autres.
(D14)	Je pense que le travail à temps partiel nuit les études a ^ certains personnes et affecte pas les autres.	Omission: convention	Je pense que le travail à temps partiel nuit aux études dans le cas de certaines personnes et n'affecte pas les autres.
(D14)	Je pense que le travail à temps partiel nuit les études a certains personnes et ^ affecte pas les autres.	Omission: ne	Je pense que le travail à temps partiel nuit aux études dans le cas de certaines personnes et n'affecte pas les autres.
(D15)	Premièrement, à mon opinion, le travail nuit les élèves ^ secondaires de réussir leur scolaire parce que le travail qu'ils font prends du temps de leur temps d'étudier et de faire leur devoir et tous qu'ils besoin faire pour l'école.	Omission: preposition	Premièrement, à mon avis, le travail nuit les élèves du secondaire de réussir leurs études parce que le travail qu'ils font enlève du temps à leur temps d'étudier et de faire leurs devoirs et toutes ce qu'ils besoin de faire pour l'école.
(D15)	... parce que le travail qu'ils font prends du temps de leur temps d'étudier et de faire leur devoir et tous qu'ils besoin ^ faire pour l'école.	Omission: preposition	... parce que le travail qu'ils font enlève du temps à leur temps d'étudier et de faire leurs devoirs et toutes ce qu'ils besoin de faire pour l'école.
(D15)	Si ce n'est pas le cas, ce n'est pas si grave parce que l'élèves reçoivent ^ l'argent.	Omission: preposition	Si ce n'est pas le cas, ce n'est pas si grave parce que les élèves reçoivent de l'argent quand même.
(D15)	Les élèves du secondaire sont trop jeunes pour d'être fatigués à cause des études et ^ leur travail.	Omission: preposition	Les élèves du secondaire sont trop jeunes pour être fatigués à cause des études et de leur travail.
(D16)	Je suis écris sur le sujet du la travail à temps partiel nuit à la réussite ^ pour les élèves du secondaire.	Omission: adjective	Je suis écris au sujet du la travail à temps partiel qui nuit à la réussite scolaire des élèves du secondaire.
(D16)	A mon avis, je me suis complètement en accord ^ que les élèves qui travail à temps partiel ne réussent leur études.	Omission: phrase	A mon avis, je suis complètement en accord avec l'idée que les élèves qui travaillent à temps partiel ne réussent leur études.
(D16)	La mal alimentation peuvent cause des jeunes d'avoir le malade comme le anorexie, ou ^ devenir obèse.	Omission: Subject phrase	Une alimentation malsaine peut engendrer chez les jeunes des malades comme l'anorexie, ou ils risquent de devenir obèses.
(D18)	Des Big Macs et des chips passent pour des diners et des soupers de plus en plus, ^ pas exactement la nutrition idéale.	Omission: Subject phrase	Des Big Macs et des frites passent de plus en plus pour des diners et des soupers, ce n'est pas exactement de la nutrition idéale.
(D18)	Des Big Macs et des chips passent pour des diners et des soupers de plus en plus, pas exactement ^ la nutrition idéale.	Omission: preposition	Des Big Macs et des frites passent de plus en plus pour des diners et des soupers, ce n'est pas exactement de la nutrition idéale.
(D19)	Deuxièmement, les jeunes sont si occuper qu'ils ne prennent pas le temps de s'asseoir et manger une souper à bonne santé, en plus de sa ils n'ont pas beaucoup de temps pour coucher, car ils sont stressé, et ^ peuve pas ouvrir leurs yeux.	Omission: 'ne'	Deuxièmement, les jeunes sont si occupés qu'ils ne prennent pas le temps de s'asseoir et de manger un souper nutritif. En plus de ça, ils n'ont pas beaucoup de temps pour dormir, car ils sont stressés, et ne peuvent pas ouvrir leurs yeux.
(D20)	Aujourd'hui il en a ^ plus en plus de parents qui sont inquiet des études de leurs enfants a cause qu'ils travail a temps partiel.	Omission: 'de'	Aujourd'hui il y en a de plus en plus de parents qui sont inquiets au sujet des études de leurs enfants à cause qu'ils travaillent à temps partiel.
(D20)	A mon avis, je pense que si les adolescent fait des études à l'école et ils veulent travaille, c'est très dure a réussir bien en class. Te doit te couché tard comme à 10-11-12 et même ^ l'heures du matins a cause	Omission: preposition	A mon avis, si les adolescents font des études à l'école et ils veulent travailler, c'est très dure de bien réussir en classe. Ils doivent se coucher tard, par

	du travail qu'ils font.		exemple à 22h, 23h, à minuit et même à l'heure du matin à cause du travail qu'ils font.
(D20)	Je sais que ça donne de l'argent, mais tu sera en école secondaire jusqu'à ^ 18 ans.	Omission: phrase	Je sais que (si on a un emploi,) ça nous apporte de l'argent, mais on seront à l'école secondaire jusqu'à l'âge de 18 ans.
(D20)	Je sais que ça donne de l'argent, mais tu sera en ^ école secondaire jusqu'à 18 ans.	Omission: déterminer	Je sais que (si on a un emploi,) ça nous apporte de l'argent, mais on seront à l'école secondaire jusqu'à l'âge de 18 ans.

IB - REDUNDANCY

(D5)	Dans un autre cas si un jeune peut pas faire ces devoir et son travail également, dans cette cas il devra lesser tombée le travail et se consenter a ses études.	Redundant: phrase	Si un jeune ne pourrait pas faire ses devoirs et son travail également, il tombera mieux le travail et se concentra à ses études.
(D8)	... le travail à temps partiel est bons dans des certains cas.	Redundant: déterminer	... le travail à temps partiel est bon dans certains cas.
(D15)	Premièrement, à mon opinion, le travail nuit les élèves secondaires de réussir leur scolaire parce que le travail qu'ils font prends du temps de leur temps d'étudier et de faire leur devoir et tous qu'ils besoin faire pour l'école.	Redundant: phrase	Premièrement, à mon avis, le travail nuit les élèves du secondaire de réussir leurs études parce que le travail qu'ils font enlève du temps à leur temps d'étudier et de faire leurs devoirs et toutes ce qu'ils besoin de faire pour l'école.
(D15)	Les élèves du secondaire sont trop jeunes pour d'être fatigués à cause des études et leur travail.	Redundant: déterminer	Les élèves du secondaire sont trop jeunes pour être fatigués à cause des études et de leur travail.
(D16)	A mon avis, je me suis complètement en accord que les élèves qui travail à temps partiel ne réussent leur études.	Redundant: pronoun	A mon avis, je suis complètement en accord avec l'idée que les élèves qui travaillent à temps partiel ne réussissent leur études.
(D19)	Les jeunes doit pas être misent dans cette situation, ils doivent vivre leur jeunesse avec la joie.	Redundant: déterminer	Les jeunes ne doivent pas être mis dans cette situation. Ils doivent vivre leur jeunesse avec joie.

IC - VERTICAL ACCURACY

(D2)	Une des seules temps qu'on peut dormir est à l'école.	Vertical: genre	Un de seul temps où l'on peut dormir, c'est à l'école.
(D2)	Et deuxièmement, le manque d'heure pour dormir qu'on perde rapidement, nous nous sommes toujours fatiguer.	Vertical: V used as Adjective	Deuxièmement, le manque d'heure pour dormir qu'on perd rapidement, nous sommes toujours fatigués.
(D2)	Par exemple, un journée normale pour un adolescent; il ^ réveille à 6h30 le matin, mange son petit déjeuner et prends son douche.	Vertical: Verb pronominal should be used	Par exemple, voici une journée normale pour un adolescent; il se réveille à 6h30 le matin, mange son petit déjeuner et prend sa douche.
(D2)	Par exemple, un journée normale pour un adolescent.	Vertical: Genre	Par exemple, voici l'horaire une journée normale pour un adolescent.
(D2)	Et deuxièmement, le manque d'heure pour dormir qu'on perde rapidement, nous nous sommes toujours fatiguer.	Vertical: Plural noun	Deuxièmement, le manque d'heures pour dormir qu'on perd rapidement, nous sommes toujours fatigués.
(D2)	Donc si vous ne recevrons pas assez de dormir, il sera une grande échec.	Vertical: Genre	Donc si vous ne dormez pas assez, cela conduira à un grand échec.
(D3)	Un etudiant qui travaille n'est pas necessairement un mauvaise chose.	Vertical: genre	Un étudiant qui travaille n'est pas nécessairement une mauvaise chose.
(D3)	Premièrement, les étudiants qui travaillent apprend a divisé leur temps de travaille avec leur temps libre.	Vertical: V used as N	Premièrement, les étudiants qui travaillent apprennent à diviser leur temps de travail et leur

	Si un étudiant est donné un travail, il va faire beaucoup d'effort en faire le travail au meilleur possible.		temps libre. Si un étudiant obtient du travail, il va faire beaucoup d'efforts de faire le travail le mieux possible.
(D3)	Si un étudiant est donné un travail, il va faire beaucoup d'effort en faire le travail au meilleur possible.	Vertical: plural noun	Si un étudiant obtient du travail, il va faire beaucoup d'efforts de faire le travail le mieux possible.
(D4)	Deuxièmement, c'est la responsabilité de l'élève de cheque ces heures pour qu'il fait ses devoirs dans la librairie a lunch et le recreation.	Vertical: genre	Deuxièmement, c'est la responsabilité de l'élève de planifier ses heures pour qu'il fait ses devoirs dans la bibliothèque pendant l'heure lunch et la récréation.
(D5)	J'ai un travaille à temp partiel et sa rentre pas dans mes à faire a l'école ou mes devoir.	Vertical: Plural Noun	J'ai un travail à temp partiel que n'endommage pas mes affaires à l'école et mes devoirs.
(D6)	Ces parents sont tres désus de lui parce-ee que il n'est pas capable de balance le devoir et la traivaille a temp partiel....	Vertical: genre	Ces parents sont très déçu de lui parce-ee que il n'est pas capable de balancer ses devoirs et son travail à temp partiel
(D6)	J'ai deux ami...	Vertical: plural noun	J'ai deux amis...
(D8)	... il vien au maison et fait leur devoir...	Vertical: Genre	... il vient à la maison et fait les devoirs...
(D9)	... d'avoir une travail à temps partiel...	Vertical: Genre	... d'avoir un travail à temps partiel...
(D9)	Ils doit pas avoir beaucoup des devoir.	Vertical: plural noun	Ils doit pas avoir beaucoup des devoirs.
(D9)	Je pense qu'ils donnent beaucoup de reponsabilité à l'adolescent.	Vertical: plural noun	Je pense qu'ils donnent beaucoup des responsabilités aux adolescents.
(D10)	Il a malheureusement pris l'habitude de souper sur la pouce.	Vertical: Genre	Il a malheureusement pris l'habitude de souper sur le pouce.
(D14)	Si on travail trop, on vas être fatiguer.	Vertical: V used as Adjective/homophone	Si on travaille trop, on va être fatigué.
(D14)	Je ne suis pas d'accord que tout le monde à du difficulter.	Vertical: plural noun	Je ne suis pas d'accord avec l'idée que tout le monde a des difficultés.
(D15)	Premièrement, à mon opinion, le travail nuit les élèves secondaires de réussir leur scolaire parce que le travail qu'ils font prends du temps de leur temps d'étudier et de faire leur devoir et tous qu'ils besoin faire pour l'école.	Vertical: Singular noun	Premièrement, à mon avis, le travail nuit les élèves du secondaire de réussir leurs études parce que le travail qu'ils font enlève du temps à leur temps d'étudier et de faire leurs devoirs et toutes ce qu'ils besoin de faire pour l'école.
(D15)	Les élèves peux faire ce qu'ils décide de faire en ce cas, mais je crois que dans la fin c'est plus importante d'avoir un bon education que un travail à temps partiel.	Vertical: genre	Les élèves peuvent faire ce qu'ils décident de faire dans ce cas, mais je crois que finalement c'est plus important d'avoir une bonne éducation qu'un travail à temps partiel.
(D16)	Ils prennent le fast food le midi parce qu'ils n'ont pas le temps pour faire une diner nutritif le jour avant.	Vertical: genre	Ils commandent le fast food le midi parce qu'ils n'ont pas eu le temps pour se préparer un dîner nutritif la veille.
(D16)	Les jeunes ne couchent pas assez parce qu'il est pres-que toujours entraine du travaille.	Vertical: infinitive	Les jeunes ne dorment pas assez parce qu'ils sont presque toujours en train de travailler.
(D18)	Peut-être la meilleur solution, c'est que, si les élèves veut une emploi pour eu gagner de l'argent, ils peut eu avoir une durant l'été.	Vertical: genre	Peut-être la meilleur solution, c'est que, si les élèves veulent un emploi pour gagner de l'argent, ils peuvent eu avoir un durant l'été.
(D18)	Peut-être la meilleur solution, c'est que, si les élèves veut une emploi pour eu gagner de l'argent, ils peut eu avoir une durant l'été.	Vertical: genre	Peut-être la meilleur solution, c'est que, si les élèves veulent un emploi pour gagner de l'argent, ils peuvent eu avoir un durant l'été.

(D19)	Je vous écris au sujet de la travail à temps partiel; nuit-t-elle à la réussite scolaire des élèves de secondaire?	Vertical: genre	Je vous écris au sujet du travail à temps partiel; nuit-il à la réussite scolaire des élèves de secondaire?
(D19)	A mon avis, je crois que le travail à temps partiel amène seulement la stress au jeune et nuit à leur réussite dans le cas d'éducation.	Vertical: genre	A mon avis, je crois que le travail à temps partiel amène seulement le stress aux jeunes et nuit à leur réussite dans le domaine de l'éducation.
(D19)	A mon avis, je crois que le travail à temps partiel amène seulement la stress au jeune et nuit à leur réussite dans le cas d'éducation.	Vertical: plural noun	A mon avis, je crois que le travail à temps partiel amène seulement le stress aux jeunes et nuit à leur réussite dans le domaine de l'éducation.
(D19)	Premièrement, entre les loisirs, les amis et les études, les jeunes ont déjà une horaire très hectic.	Vertical: genre	Premièrement, entre les loisirs, les amis et les études, les jeunes ont déjà un horaire très chargé.
(D19)	De récentes études démontrent que la proportions des adolescents et adolescentes qui occupent un emploi varie entre 40 et 70 p. 100, qui montre que plus que 50p. 100 des élèves ont une occupation et ils ont une dépreciation dans leurs marques.	Vertical: singular noun	De récentes études démontrent que la proportion des adolescents et adolescentes qui occupent un emploi varie entre 40 et 70 p. 100. Elles démontrent aussi que plus que 50p. 100 des élèves ont un emploi et que leurs notes baissent en conséquence.
(D19)	Deuxièmement, les jeunes sont si occuper qu'ils ne prennent pas le temps de s'asseoir et manger une souper à bonne santé, en plus de sa ils n'ont pas beaucoup de temps pour coucher, car ils sont stressé, et peuve pas ouvrir leurs yeux.	Vertical: genre	Deuxièmement, les jeunes sont si occupés qu'ils ne prennent pas le temps de s'asseoir et de manger un souper nutritif. En plus de ça, ils n'ont pas beaucoup de temps pour dormir, car ils sont stressés, et ne peuvent pas ouvrir leurs yeux.
(D19)	La seul avantage c'est la salaire, mais vaut t'il vraiment la détriment de tes études, ta santé et l'avenir?	Vertical: genre	Le seul avantage c'est le salaire, mais vaut-il vraiment gagner de l'argent au détriment de tes études, de ta santé et de l'avenir?

ID – LINEAR ACCURACY

(D1)	Le travail à temps partiel est un bon chois pour certain jeunes...	Linear: Number agreement	Le travail à temps partiel est un bon choix pour certains jeunes...
(D1)	Si son études souffre de a cause de cet travail, le choix ce le travail où son études.	Linear: S-V agreement	Si ses études souffrent à cause de cet travail, il faut faire de choix entre le travail et ses études.
(D1)	Si les élèves a capable du balancé son études, son travail, et santé je pense...	Linear: S-V agreement	Si les élèves sont capables de faire tenir en équilibre ses études, son travail, et son santé je pense...
(D2)	Mai quand on dors à l'école, on manque d'informations pour des examins ou test et il ou elle va échouer tout ses classes et cours.	Linear: S-V Agreement	Mai quand on dort à l'école, on manque des informations pour des examines ou des tests et il ou elle risque d'échouer à tous ses classes et cours.
(D2)	Une des seules temps qu'on peut dormir est à l'école.	Linear: Number agreement	Un de seul temps où l'on peut dormir, c'est à l'école.
(D2)	Je peux seulement dire que si vous êtes un étudiant qui travail à temps partiel, je vous souhait de la chance.	Linear: S-V Agreement	Je peux seulement dire que si vous êtes un étudiant qui travaille à temps partiel, je vous souhaite de la chance.
(D3)	A mon avis, un étudiant responsable qui travaille a temps partiel à un meilleur chance a réusire dans leur vie.	Linear: number agreement	A mon avis, un étudiant responsable qui travaille à temps partiel a de fortes chances de réussir dans son vie.
(D3)	Premièrement, les étudiants qui travaillent apprend a divisé leur temps de travaille avec leur temps libre.	Linear: S-V agreement	Premièrement, les étudiants qui travaillent apprennent à diviser leur temps de travail et leur temps libre.

(D3)	Premièrement, les étudiants qui travaillent apprend à divisé leur temps de travaille avec leur temps libre.	Linear: infinitive	Premièrement, les étudiants qui travaillent apprennent à diviser leur temps de travail et leur temps libre.
(D3)	Deuxièmement, il y a beaucoup d'adultes qui stereotypes les jeunes adolescents. Ils pensent que tout les jeunes sont méchant et milicieux.	Linear: number agreement	Deuxièmement, il y a beaucoup d'adultes qui ont des opinions pleines de stéréotypes sur les jeunes adolescents. Ils pensent que tous les jeunes sont méchants et malicieux.
(D3)	Deuxièmement, il y a beaucoup d'adultes qui stereotypes les jeunes adolescents. Ils pensent que tout les jeunes sont méchant et milicieux.	Linear: S-Adjective agreement	Deuxièmement, il y a beaucoup d'adultes qui ont des opinions pleines de stéréotypes sur les jeunes adolescents. Ils pensent que tous les jeunes sont méchants et malicieux.
(D3)	Les étudiants qui travail êtes une bon exemple qu'on doit travailler pour ce qu'on veut.	Linear: S-V agreement	Les étudiants qui travaillent sont exemplaires qu'on doit travailler pour ce qu'on veut.
(D3)	Les étudiants qui travail êtes une bon exemple qu'on doit travailler pour ce qu'on veut.	Linear: S-Adjective agreement	Les étudiants qui travaillent sont exemplaires qu'on doit travailler pour ce qu'on veut.
(D4)	A mon avis, je pense que le travail a temp partiele a nuit a des pours et contres.	Linear: S-Adjective agreement	A mon avis, je pense que l'affirmation qui dit que le travail à temps partiel nuit à la réussite scolaire des élèves du secondaire a des aspects positifs et négatifs.
(D4)	En conclusion j'exprime que c'est le coix du personne si il/elle veut travailler, et peut être échoué ou être une personne colèreux.	Linear: infinitive	En conclusion je crois que c'est le choix de l'individu s'il ou elle veut travailler, mais on risque peut être d'échouer ou de devenir une personne colère.
(D4)	En conclusion j'exprime que c'est le coix du personne si il/elle veut travailler, et peut être échoué ou être une personne colèreux.	Linear: S-Adjective agreement	En conclusion je crois que c'est le choix de l'individu s'il ou elle veut travailler, mais on risque peut être d'échouer ou de devenir une personne colère.
(D6)	Ces parents son tres fiere de Marco...	Linear: S-Adjective agreement	Ses parents sont très fieres de Marco...
(D6)	Ces parents sont tres désus de lui parce-ce que il n'est pas capable de balance le devoir et la travaille a temp partiel	Linear: infinitive	Ces parents sont très déçu de lui parce-ce que il n'est pas capable de balancer ses devoirs et son travail à temp partiel
(D7)	Je pense que il y a certain adolescent qui drevait pas...	Linear: S-V agreement	Je pense qu'il y a certains adolescents qui ne devrait pas...
(D7)	Ils ne sont pas capable d'organiser leur temps dans une journée, e.i. etudes, someil, travail,...	Linear: S-Adjective agreement	Ils ne sont pas capables d'organiser leur temps entre les études, someil, travail,...
(D8)	... le travail à temps partiel est bons dans des certains cas.	Linear: S-Adjective agreement	... le travail à temps partiel est bon dans certains cas.
(D8)	Il y en a le majorité de situation de situation quand les étudiants veut l'argent extra.	Linear: S-V agreement	La plupart des étudiants veulent l'argent de plus.
(D9)	Il y a plus en plus de professeurs qui sont inquiet des études...	Linear: S-Adjective agreement	Il y a plus en plus de professeurs qui sont inquiets des études...
(D9)	... par-ce que ils peu acheter des choses qu'ils veu et ils peu accumuler leur argent pour...	Linear: S-V agreement	... par-ce qu'ils peuvent acheter des choses qu'ils veulent et ils peuvent mettre de l'argent pour...
(D11)	Beaucoup de personnes ont de différentes idée personnelle sur le sujet <<le travail à temps partiele conflit à la réussite scolaire des élèves du secondaire>>.	Linear: S-Adjective agreement	Beaucoup de personnes ont de différentes idées personnelles sur le sujet <<le travail à temps partiel nuit à la réussite scolaire des élèves du secondaire>>.
(D11)	Beaucoup de personnes ont de différentes idée personnelle sur le sujet <<le travail à temps partiele conflit à la réussite scolaire des élèves du secondaire>>.	Linear: S-Adjective agreement	Beaucoup de personnes ont de différentes idées personnelles sur le sujet <<le travail à temps partiel nuit à la réussite scolaire des élèves du secondaire>>.

(D11)	Je travail les dimanches chez mon synagogue et je peut finir tous mes devoirs.	Linear: S-V agreement	Je travaille les dimanches dans mon synagogue et je peux finir tous mes devoirs.
(D12)	Je crois qu'on doit termin�� l'��cole et apr��s trouve un travaille.	Linear: S-V agreement	Je crois qu'on doit terminer ses ��tudes et apr��s on peut trouver un travail.
(D12)	Le grand probl��me c'est si tu travaille de 6h30-11h00...	Linear: S-V agreement	Le grand probl��me c'est si tu travailles de 6h30-11h00...
(D12)	Vous savais maintenant que je suis en d��saccord avec...	Linear: S-V agreement	Vous savez maintenant que je suis en d��saccord avec...
(D14)	Je pense que le travail �� temps partiel nuit les ��tudes �� certaines personnes et affecte pas les autres.	Linear: S-Adjective agreement	Je pense que le travail �� temps partiel nuit aux ��tudes dans le cas de certaines personnes et n'affecte pas les autres.
(D15)	Premi��rement, �� mon opinion, le travail nuit les ��l��ves secondaires de r��ussir leur scolaire parce que le travail qu'ils font prends du temps de leur temps d'��tudier et de faire leur devoir et tous qu'ils besoin faire pour l'��cole.	Linear: number agreement	Premi��rement, �� mon avis, le travail nuit les ��l��ves du secondaire de r��ussir leurs ��tudes parce que le travail qu'ils font enl��ve du temps �� leur temps d'��tudier et de faire leurs devoirs et toutes ce qu'ils besoin de faire pour l'��cole.
(D15)	Premi��rement, �� mon opinion, le travail nuit les ��l��ves secondaires de r��ussir leur scolaire parce que le travail qu'ils font prends du temps de leur temps d'��tudier et de faire leur devoir et tous qu'ils besoin faire pour l'��cole.	Linear: genre	Premi��rement, �� mon avis, le travail nuit les ��l��ves du secondaire de r��ussir leurs ��tudes parce que le travail qu'ils font enl��ve du temps �� leur temps d'��tudier et de faire leurs devoirs et toutes ce qu'ils besoin de faire pour l'��cole.
(D15)	Le travail �� temps partiel est aussi incorrect parce que il peut rendre l'��l��ves d'��tre tr��s, tr��s fatigu��.	Linear: number agreement	Le travail �� temps partiel est aussi mal parce qu'il peut rendre les ��l��ves tr��s, tr��s fatigu��s.
(D15)	Les ��l��ves peut faire ce qu'ils d��cides de faire en ce cas, mais je crois que dans la fin c'est plus importante d'avoir un bon education que un travail �� temps partiel.	Linear: S-V agreement	Les ��l��ves peuvent faire ce qu'ils d��cident de faire dans ce cas, mais je crois que finalement c'est plus important d'avoir une bonne ��ducation qu'un travail �� temps partiel.
(D16)	A mon avis, je me suis compl��tement en accord que les ��l��ves qui travail �� temps partiel ne r��ussient leur ��tudes.	Linear: S-V agreement	A mon avis, je suis compl��tement en accord avec l'id��e que les ��l��ves qui travaillent �� temps partiel ne r��ussient leur ��tudes.
(D16)	Si les jeunes travaillent apr��s les cours, ils se d��p��chera de manger avant de se rendre �� son ouvrage.	Linear: S-V agreement	Si les jeunes travaillent apr��s les cours, ils se d��p��cheront de manger avant de se rendre �� leur ouvrage.
(D16)	Si les jeunes travaillent apr��s les cours, ils se d��p��chera de manger avant de se rendre �� son ouvrage.	Linear: number agreement	Si les jeunes travaillent apr��s les cours, ils se d��p��cheront de manger avant de se rendre �� leur ouvrage.
(D16)	La mal alimentation peuvent cause des jeunes d'avoir le malade comme le anorexie, ou devenir ob��se.	Linear: word order	Une alimentation malsaine peut engendrer chez les jeunes des malades comme l'anorexie, ou ils risquent de devenir ob��s��s.
(D16)	La mal alimentation peuvent cause des jeunes d'avoir le malade comme le anorexie, ou devenir ob��se.	Linear: S-V agreement	Une alimentation malsaine peut engendrer chez les jeunes des malades comme l'anorexie, ou ils risquent de devenir ob��s��s.
(D18)	Des ��tudes recents montre que le travail �� temps partiel �� un effet sur la sant�� des ��l��ves. Ils doivent concentrer sur les ��tudes assez stressants, et leur emploi �� temps partiel ne aide pas la situation.	Linear: S-Adjective agreement	Des ��tudes r��centes montrent que le travail �� temps partiel a un effet sur la sant�� des ��l��ves. Ils doivent se concentrer sur des ��tudes assez stressantes, et leur emploi �� temps partiel n'aide pas la situation.
(D18)	Des ��tudes recents montre que le travail �� temps partiel �� un effet sur la sant�� des ��l��ves. Ils doivent concentrer sur les ��tudes assez stressants, et leur emploi �� temps partiel ne aide pas la situation.	Linear: S-V agreement	Des ��tudes r��centes montrent que le travail �� temps partiel a un effet sur la sant�� des ��l��ves. Ils doivent se concentrer sur des ��tudes assez stressantes, et leur emploi �� temps partiel n'aide pas la situation.

(D18)	Des Big Macs et des chips passent pour des diners et des soupers de plus en plus, pas exactement la nutrition idéale.	Linear: word order	Des Big Macs et des frites passent de plus en plus pour des diners et des soupers, ce n'est pas exactement de la nutrition idéale.
(D18)	Peut-être la meilleur solution, c'est que, si les élèves veut une emploi pour eu gagner de l'argent, ils peut eu avoir une durant l'été.	Linear: S-V agreement	Peut-être la meilleur solution, c'est que, si les élèves veulent un emploi pour gagner de l'argent, ils peuvent eu avoir un durant l'été.
(D18)	Peut-être la meilleur solution, c'est que, si les élèves veut une emploi pour eu gagner de l'argent, ils peut eu avoir une durant l'été.	Linear: S-V agreement	Peut-être la meilleur solution, c'est que, si les élèves veulent un emploi pour gagner de l'argent, ils peuvent eu avoir un durant l'été.
(D19)	Deuxièmement, les jeunes sont si occuper qu'ils ne prennent pas le temps de s'asseoir et manger une souper à bonne santé, en plus de sa ils n'ont pas beaucoup de temps pour coucher, car ils sont stressé, et peuve pas ouvrir leurs yeux.	Linear: V-form	Deuxièmement, les jeunes sont si occupés qu'ils ne prennent pas le temps de s'asseoir et de manger un souper nutritif. En plus de ça, ils n'ont pas beaucoup de temps pour dormir, car ils sont stressés, et ne peuvent pas ouvrir leurs yeux.
(D19)	Les jeunes doit pas être misent dans cette situation, ils doivent vivre leur jeunesse avec la joie.	Linear: V-form	Les jeunes ne doivent pas être mis dans cette situation. Ils doivent vivre leur jeunesse avec joie.
(D19)	Deuxièmement, les jeunes sont si occuper qu'ils ne prennent pas le temps de s'asseoir et manger une souper à bonne santé, en plus de sa ils n'ont pas beaucoup de temps pour coucher, car ils sont stressé, et peuve pas ouvrir leurs yeux.	Linear: S-Adjective agreement	Deuxièmement, les jeunes sont si occupés qu'ils ne prennent pas le temps de s'asseoir et de manger un souper nutritif. En plus de ça, ils n'ont pas beaucoup de temps pour dormir, car ils sont stressés, et ne peuvent pas ouvrir leurs yeux.
(D20)	Aujourd'hui il en a plus en plus de parents qui sont inquiet des études de leurs enfants a cause qu'ils travail a temps partiel.	Linear: number agreement	Aujourd'hui il y en a de plus en plus de parents qui sont inquiets au sujet des études de leurs enfants à cause qu'ils travaillent à temps partiel.
(D20)	Aujourd'hui il en a plus en plus de parents qui sont inquiet des études de leurs enfants a cause qu'ils travail a temps partiel.	Linear: S-V agreement	Aujourd'hui il y en a de plus en plus de parents qui sont inquiets au sujet des études de leurs enfants à cause qu'ils travaillent à temps partiel.
(D20)	A mon avis, je pense que si les adolescent fait des études à l'école et ils veulent travaille, c'est très dure a réussir bien en class. Te doit te couché tard comme à 10-11-12 et même l'heures du matins a cause du travail qu'ils font.	Linear: S-V agreement	A mon avis, si les adolescents font des études à l'école et ils veulent travailler, c'est très dure de bien réussir en classe. Ils doivent se coucher tard, par exemple à 22h, 23h, à minuit et même à l'heure du matin à cause du travail qu'ils font.
(D20)	C'est très difficile a concentré a cause qu'ils sera toujours disrupté avec le travail et l'école au même moment.	Linear: S-V agreement	C'est très difficile à se concentrer à cause qu'ils seront toujours tirillés entre le travail et l'école en même temps.
(D20)	Leur bulltin ne sera pas très bien a l'école parce qu'ils pensent leur travail est plus importants.	Linear: Number agreement	Leurs résultats ne seront pas très bons à l'école parce qu'ils pensent que leur travail est plus important.
(D20)	En conclusion, les enfants ne devrait pas travaillé durant l'école parce que si tu travail quand tu est en train de faire des études sa peut te donné des mals de tête a cause du manque de sommeil.	Linear: S-V agreement	En conclusion, les enfants ne doivent pas travailler durant leurs études parce que si'ils travaillent quand on est en train de faire des études, ça peut engendrer des malades à cause du manque de sommeil.

IE – LEXICAL ACCURACY

(D1)	Les jeunes de l'école secondaire avec un travail à temps partiel fait le choix de travailler seulement pour l'argent et pas pour un raison important.	Lexical: verb	Les élèves secondaire qui travaillent à temps partiel décident de travailler seulement pour l'argent et ce n'est pas pour un raison important.
(D1)	Si les élèves a capable du balancé son études, son travail, et santé je pense...	Lexical: verb	Si les élèves sont capables de faire tenir en équilibre ses études, son travail, et son santé je pense...
(D1)	Ce depende sur le jeune...	Lexical: preposition	Ce depende de le jeune
(D2)	Il lui reste que 6 heures de dormir.	Lexical: preposition	Il lui reste que 6 heures pour dormir.
(D2)	On devrai avoir au moins 9 heurs de coucher.	Lexical: verb	On doit avoir au moins 9 heures de sommeil.
(D2)	Une des seules temps qu'on peut dormir est à l'école.	Lexical: conjunction	Un de seul temps où l'on peut dormir, c'est à l'école.
(D2)	Donc si vous ne recevrons pas assez de dormir, il sera une grande échec.	Lexical: verb	Donc si vous ne dormez pas assez, cela conduira à un grand échec.
(D2)	Donc si vous ne recevrons pas assez de dormir, il sera une grande échec.	Lexical: verb	Donc si vous ne dormez pas assez, cela conduira à un grand échec.
(D3)	A mon avis, un etudiant responsable qui travaille a temps partiel à un meilleur chance a réussir dans leur vie.	Lexical: adjective	A mon avis, un étudiant responsable qui travaille à temps partiel a de fortes chances de réussir dans son vie.
(D3)	A mon avis, un etudiant responsable qui travaille a temps partiel à un meilleur chance a réussir dans leur vie.	Lexical: preposition	A mon avis, un étudiant responsable qui travaille à temps partiel a de fortes chances de réussir dans son vie.
(D3)	Premièrement, les étudiants qui travaillent apprend a divisé leur temps de travaille avec leur temps libre.	Lexical: conjunction	Premièrement, les étudiants qui travaillent apprennent à diviser leur temps de travail et leur temps libre.
(D3)	Deuxièmement, il y a beaucoup d'adultes qui stereotypes les jeunes adolescents. Ils pensent que tout les jeunes sont méchant et milicieux.	Lexical: phrase	Deuxièmement, il y a beaucoup d'adultes qui ont des opinions pleines de stéréotypes sur les jeunes adolescents. Ils pensent que tous les jeunes sont méchants et malicieux.
(D3) (R)	Quand ces adultes voient que pas tous les adolescent sont la même, il vont probablement donné les autres jeunes un temps plus facile.	Lexical: verb	Quand ces adultes réalisent ce n'est pas tous les adolescents qui agissent de même, ils seront gentils aux autres jeunes.
(D3)	Quand ces adultes voient que pas tous les adolescent sont la même, il vont probablement donné les autres jeunes un temps plus facile.	Lexical: verb	Quand ces adultes réalisent ce n'est pas tous les adolescents qui agissent de même, ils seront gentils aux autres jeunes.
(D3) (R)	Quand ces adultes voient que pas tous les adolescent sont la même, il vont probablement donné les autres jeunes un temps plus facile.	Lexical: phrase	Quand ces adultes réalisent ce n'est pas tous les adolescents qui agissent de même, ils seront gentils aux autres jeunes.
(D3)	Si un étudiant est donné un travail, il va faire beaucoup d'effort en faire le travaille au meilleur possible.	Lexical: phrase	Si un étudiant obtient du travail, il va faire beaucoup d'efforts de faire le travail le mieux possible.
(D3)	Si un étudiant est donné un travail, il va faire beaucoup d'effort en faire le travaille au meilleur possible.	Lexical: preposition	Si un étudiant obtient du travail, il va faire beaucoup d'efforts de faire le travail le mieux possible.
(D3)	Si un étudiant est donné un travail, il va faire beaucoup d'effort en faire le travaille au meilleur possible.	Lexical: comparative	Si un étudiant obtient du travail, il va faire beaucoup d'efforts de faire le travail le mieux possible.
(D4)	A mon avis, je pense que le travail a temp partiele a nuit a des pours et contres.	Lexical: noun	A mon avis, je pense que l'affirmation qui dit que le travail à temps partiel nuit à la réussite scolaire des élèves du secondaire a des aspects positifs et négatifs.

(D4)	En conclusion j'exprime que c'est le coix du personne si il/elle veut travailler, et peut être échoué ou être une personne coléreux.	Lexical: verb	En conclusion je crois que c'est le choix de l'individu s'il ou elle veut travailler, mais on risque peut être d'échouer ou de devenir une personne colère.
(D4)	Premierement tu gagne beaucoup d'argent et tu peu acheter des chosses expensives que les parents n'acheterait pas pour toi.	Lexical: adjective	Premièrement, si on travaille, on gagne beaucoup d'argent et on peut acheter des choses onéreuses que nos parents n'acheterait pas pour nous.
(D4) (R)	Deuxièmement, c'est la responsabilité de l'élève de cheque ces heures pour qu'il fait ses devoirs dans la librairie a lunch et le recreation.	Lexical: verb	Deuxièmement, c'est la responsabilité de l'élève de planifier ses heures pour qu'il fait ses devoirs dans la bibliothèque pendant l'heure lunch et la récréation.
(D4)	Deuxièmement, c'est la responsabilité de l'élève de cheque ces heures pour qu'il fait ses devoirs dans la librairie a lunch et le recreation.	Lexical: noun	Deuxièmement, c'est la responsabilité de l'élève de planifier ses heures pour qu'il fait ses devoirs dans la bibliothèque pendant l'heure lunch et la récréation.
(D4)	Deuxièmement, c'est la responsabilité de l'élève de cheque ces heures pour qu'il fait ses devoirs dans la librairie a lunch et le recreation.	Lexical: preposition	Deuxièmement, c'est la responsabilité de l'élève de planifier ses heures pour qu'il fait ses devoirs dans la bibliothèque pendant l'heure lunch et la récréation.
(D4)	En conclusion j'exprime que c'est le coix du personne si il/elle veut travailler, et peut être échoué ou être une personne coléreux.	Lexical: verb	En conclusion je crois que c'est le choix de l'individu s'il ou elle veut travailler, mais on risque peut être d'échouer ou de devenir une personne colère.
(D4)	En conclusion j'exprime que c'est le coix du personne si il/elle veut travailler, et peut être échoué ou être une personne coléreux.	Lexical: verb	En conclusion je crois que c'est le choix de l'individu s'il ou elle veut travailler, mais on risque peut être d'échouer ou de devenir une personne colère.
(D4)	En conclusion j'exprime que c'est le coix du personne si il/elle veut travailler, et peut être échoué ou être une personne coléreux.	Lexical: conjunction	En conclusion je crois que c'est le choix de l'individu s'il ou elle veut travailler, mais on risque peut être d'échouer ou de devenir une personne colère.
(D5)	Site il peut garder ces note au de sous de 75, ces parents devra avoir un problem avec sa.	Lexical: verb	S'il pourra maintenir des notes au dessus de 75, ses parents n'auraient pas un problem avec ça.
(D5)	J'ai un travaille à temp partiel et sa rentre pas dans mes à faire à l'école ou mes devoir.	Lexical: verb	J'ai un travail à temp partiel que n'endommage pas mes affaires à l'école et mes devoirs.
(D6)	Je pense que si la personne est responsable et capable de aller au ecole et de travaille à temp partiel ce le choix de il ou elle.	Lexical: verb	Je pense que si la personne est responsable et capable de s'occuper d'étudier et de travailler à temp partiel ce le choix de il ou elle.
(D7)	des depenses comme la drug et l'alchool.	Lexical: les congénères	...des depenses comme le drogue et l'alcool.
(D7)	des depenses comme la drug et l'alchool.	Lexical: les congénères	...des depenses comme le drogue et l'alcool.
(D8) (R)	Le plus vielle enfant...	Lexical: phrase	L'ainé des enfants...
(D8)	... ils ont des bonsmarques en école.	Lexical: preposition	... ils ont des bonsmarques à l'école.
(D9)	... par-ce que ils peu acheter des choses qu'ils veu et ils peu accumuler leur argent pour...	Lexical: verb	... par-ce qu'ils peuvent acheter des choses qu'ils veulent et ils peuvent mettre de l'argent pour...
(D9)	... par-ce que sa préparé pour la vrai vie.	Lexical: adjective	... par-ce que ça prépare des élèves à la vie dans la réalité.
(D10)	Son horaire consiste à deux choses, son occupation et sa blonde.	Lexical: preposition	Son horaire consiste en deux choses, son travail et sa blonde.
(D10)	Son horaire consiste à deux choses, son occupation et sa blonde.	Lexical: noun (L1)	Son horaire consiste en deux choses, son travail et sa blonde.
(D10)	J'espère pour ses études mais plus important son santé qu'il se calme.	Lexical: preposition	J'espère en ses études mais pas son santé qu'il se calme.

(D10)	Par exemple.	Lexical: les congénères	Par exemple.
(D11)	A mon avis, je suis d'accord et contre se sujet.	Lexical: preposition	A mon avis, je suis en accord et en désaccord avec cette affirmation.
(D11)	Beaucoup de personnes ont de différentes idée personnelle sur le sujet <<le travail à temps partiel nuit à la réussite scolaire des élèves du secondaire>>.	Lexical: verb	Beaucoup de personnes ont de différentes idées personnelles sur le sujet <<le travail à temps partiel nuit à la réussite scolaire des élèves du secondaire>>.
(D11)	A mon avis, je suis d'accord et contre se sujet.	Lexical: preposition	A mon avis, je suis en accord et en désaccord avec cette affirmation.
(D11)	A mon avis, je suis d'accord et contre se sujet.	Lexical: noun	A mon avis, je suis en accord et en désaccord avec cette affirmation.
(D11)	A peu près 25% des élèves travaillent et just 5% ont des difficultés avec leurs résultats à l'école.	Lexical: adv	A peu près 25p.100 des élèves travaillent et seulement 5p.100 ont des difficultés avec leurs résultats à l'école.
(D11)	Je travail les dimanches chez mon synagogue et je peut finir tous mes devoirs.	Lexical: preposition	Je travaille les dimanches dans mon synagogue et je peux finir tous mes devoirs.
(D12)	Je suis en accord avec le fais que un travail à temps partiel nuit avec les études d'écoles.	Lexical: preposition	Je suis en accord avec le fait que un travail à temps partiel nuit à les études à l'écoles.
(D12)	Je suis en accord avec le fais que un travail à temps partiel nuit avec les études d'écoles.	Lexical: preposition	Je suis en accord avec le fait que un travail à temps partiel nuit à les études à l'écoles.
(D12)	Dans mon opinion....	Lexical: phrase (L1)	A mon avis....
(D13)	Je ne suis pas sure sur le sujet...	Lexical: adjective(L1)	Je ne suis pas sûr sur le sujet...
(D14)	Même si je suis fatiguer, j'ai toujours des bonnes notes en école.	Lexical: preposition	Même si je suis fatigué, j'obtiens toujours de bonnes notes à l'école.
(D14)	Même si je suis fatiguer, j'ai toujours des bonnes notes en école.	Lexical: verb	Même si je suis fatigué, j'obtiens toujours de bonnes notes à l'école.
(D14)	Je pense que le travail à temps partiel nuit les études a certains personnes et affecte pas les autres.	Lexical: preposition	Je pense que le travail à temps partiel nuit aux études dans le cas de certaines personnes et n'affecte pas les autres.
(D15)	Premièrement, à mon opinion, le travail nuit les élèves secondaires de réussir leur scolaire parce que le travail qu'ils font prends du temps de leur temps d'étudier et de faire leur devoir et tous qu'ils besoin faire pour l'école.	Lexical: noun (L1)	Premièrement, à mon avis, le travail nuit les élèves du secondaire de réussir leurs études parce que le travail qu'ils font enlève du temps à leur temps d'étudier et de faire leurs devoirs et toutes ce qu'ils besoin de faire pour l'école.
(D15)	Premièrement, à mon opinion, le travail nuit les élèves secondaires de réussir leur scolaire parce que le travail qu'ils font prends du temps de leur temps d'étudier et de faire leur devoir et tous qu'ils besoin faire pour l'école.	Lexical: noun	Premièrement, à mon avis, le travail nuit les élèves du secondaire de réussir leurs études parce que le travail qu'ils font enlève du temps à leur temps d'étudier et de faire leurs devoirs et toutes ce qu'ils besoin de faire pour l'école.
(D15)	Premièrement, à mon opinion, le travail nuit les élèves secondaires de réussir leur scolaire parce que le travail qu'ils font prends du temps de leur temps d'étudier et de faire leur devoir et tous qu'ils besoin faire pour l'école.	Lexical: verb	Premièrement, à mon avis, le travail nuit les élèves du secondaire de réussir leurs études parce que le travail qu'ils font enlève du temps à leur temps d'étudier et de faire leurs devoirs et toutes ce qu'ils besoin de faire pour l'école.
(D15)	Premièrement, à mon opinion, le travail nuit les élèves secondaires de réussir leur scolaire parce que le travail qu'ils font prends du temps de leur temps d'étudier et de faire leur devoir et tous qu'ils besoin faire pour l'école.	Lexical: preposition	Premièrement, à mon avis, le travail nuit les élèves du secondaire de réussir leurs études parce que le travail qu'ils font enlève du temps à leur temps d'étudier et de faire leurs devoirs et toutes ce qu'ils besoin

			de faire pour l'école.
(D15)	Le travail à temps partiel est aussi incorrect parce que il peut rendre l'élèves d'être très, très fatigué.	Lexical: adjective	Le travail à temps partiel est aussi mal parce qu'il peut rendre les élèves très, très fatigués.
(D15)	Si John est un bon élève, puis il décide d'avois un travail à temps partiel puis il y a un gros test le jour prochaine, il vait être beaucoup trop fatigué pour faire bon sur son test, alors il vait pas passer.	Lexical: conjunction	Si John est un bon élève, puis il décide d'avois un travail à temps partiel et il y aura un gros test le jour suivant, il va être beaucoup trop fatigué pour bien réussir son test, alors il va l'échouer.
(D15)	Si John est un bon élève, puis il décide d'avois un travail à temps partiel puis il y a un gros test le jour prochaine, il vait être beaucoup trop fatigué pour faire bon sur son test, alors il vait pas passer.	Lexical: adjective	Si John est un bon élève, puis il décide d'avois un travail à temps partiel et il y aura un gros test le jour suivant, il va être beaucoup trop fatigué pour bien réussir son test, alors il va l'échouer.
(D15)	Si John est un bon élève, puis il décide d'avois un travail à temps partiel puis il y a un gros test le jour prochaine, il vait être beaucoup trop fatigué pour faire bon sur son test, alors il vait pas passer.	Lexical: verb	Si John est un bon élève, puis il décide d'avois un travail à temps partiel et il y aura un gros test le jour suivant, il va être beaucoup trop fatigué pour bien réussir son test, alors il va l'échouer.
(D15)	Les élèves peux faire ce qu'ils décide de faire en ce cas, mais je crois que dans la fin c'est plus importante d'avoir un bon education que un travail à temps partiel.	Lexical: preposition	Les élèves peuvent faire ce qu'ils décident de faire dans ce cas, mais je crois que finalement c'est plus important d'avoir une bonne éducation qu'un travail à temps partiel.
(D15)	Les élèves peux faire ce qu'ils décide de faire en ce cas, mais je crois que dans la fin c'est plus importante d'avoir un bon education que un travail à temps partiel.	Lexical: adverb/ convention	Les élèves peuvent faire ce qu'ils décident de faire dans ce cas, mais je crois que finalement c'est plus important d'avoir une bonne éducation qu'un travail à temps partiel.
(D16)	Je suis écris sur le sujet du la travail à temps partiel nuit à la réussite pour les élèves du secondaire.	Lexical: preposition	Je suis écris au sujet du la travail à temps partiel qui nuit à la réussite scolaire des élèves du secondaire.
(D16)	Je suis écris sur le sujet du la travail à temps partiel nuit à la réussite pour les élèves du secondaire.	Lexical: preposition	Je suis écris au sujet du la travail à temps partiel qui nuit à la réussite scolaire des élèves du secondaire.
(D16)	Ils prennent le fast food le midi parce qu'ils n'ont pas le temps pour faire une diner nutritif le jour avant.	Lexical: verb	Ils commandent le fast food le midi parce qu'ils n'ont pas eu le temps pour se préparer un diner nutritif la veille.
(D16)	Ils prennent le fast food le midi parce qu'ils n'ont pas le temps pour faire une diner nutritif le jour avant.	Lexical: verb	Ils commandent le fast food le midi parce qu'ils n'ont pas eu le temps pour se préparer un diner nutritif la veille.
(D16)	Ils prennent le fast food le midi parce qu'ils n'ont pas le temps pour faire une diner nutritif le jour avant.	Lexical: phrase	Ils commandent le fast food le midi parce qu'ils n'ont pas eu le temps pour se préparer un diner nutritif la veille.
(D16)	La mal alimentation peuvent cause des jeunes d'avoir le malade comme le anorexie, ou devenir obèse.	Lexical: verb	Une alimentation malsaine peut engendrer chez les jeunes des maladies comme l'anorexie, ou ils risquent de devenir obèses.
(D16)	Les jeunes ne couchent pas assez parce qu'il est pres-que toujours entraine du travaille.	Lexical: verb	Les jeunes ne dorment pas assez parce qu'ils sont presque toujours en train de travailler.
(D17)	Je pense que ça dépende sur l'individu.	Lexical: preposition	Je pense que ça dépende de l'individu.
(D18)	Des études recents montre que le travail à temps partiel à un effet sur la santé des élèves. Ils doivent concentrer sur les études assez stressants, et leur emploi à temps partiel ne aide pas la situation.	Lexical: determiner	Des études récentes montrent que le travail à temps partiel a un effet sur la santé des élèves. Ils doivent se concentrer sur des études assez stressantes, et leur emploi à temps partiel n'aide pas la situation.
(D18)	Des Big Macs et des chips passent pour des diners et des soupers de plus en plus, pas exactement la nutrition idéale.	Lexical: noun (L1)	Des Big Macs et des frites passent de plus en plus pour des diners et des soupers, ce n'est pas exactement de la nutrition

			idéale.
(D19)	A mon avis, je crois que le travail à temps partiel amène seulement la stress au jeune et nuit à leur réussite dans le cas d'éducation.	Lexical: noun	A mon avis, je crois que le travail à temps partiel amène seulement le stress aux jeunes et nuit à leur réussite dans le domaine de l'éducation.
(D19)	Premièrement, entre les loisirs, les amis et les études, les jeunes ont déjà une horaire très hectic.	Lexical: adjective (L1)	Premièrement, entre les loisirs, les amis et les études, les jeunes ont déjà un horaire très chargé.
(D19)	De récentes études démontrent que la proportions des adolescents et adolescentes qui occupent un emploi varie entre 40 et 70 p. 100, qui montre que plus que 50p. 100 des élèves ont une occupation et ils ont une dépreciation dans leurs marques.	Lexical: noun	De récentes études démontrent que la proportion des adolescents et adolescentes qui occupent un emploi varie entre 40 et 70 p. 100. Elles démontrent aussi que plus que 50p. 100 des élèves ont un emploi et que leurs notes baissent en conséquence.
(D19)	Ça impose seulement une stressse psychologique sur les adolescentes.	Lexical: preposition	Cela impose un stress psychologique aux adolescentes.
(D19)	Deuxièmement, les jeunes sont si occuper qu'ils ne prennent pas le temps de s'asseoir et manger une souper à bonne santé, en plus de sa ils n'ont pas beaucoup de temps pour coucher, car ils sont stressé, et peuve pas ouvrir leurs yeux.	Lexical: verb	Deuxièmement, les jeunes sont si occupés qu'ils ne prennent pas le temps de s'asseoir et de manger un souper nutritif. En plus de ça, ils n'ont pas beaucoup de temps pour dormir, car ils sont stressés, et ne peuvent pas ouvrir leurs yeux.
(D20)	C'est très difficile a concentré a cause qu'ils sera toujours disrupté avec le travail et l'école au même moment.	Lexical: verb pronominale	C'est très difficile à se concentrer à cause qu'ils seront toujours tiraillés entre le travail et l'école en même temps.
(D20)	C'est très difficile a concentré a cause qu'ils sera toujours disrupté avec le travail et l'école au même moment.	Lexical: adjective	C'est très difficile à se concentrer à cause qu'ils seront toujours tiraillés entre le travail et l'école en même temps.
(D20)	C'est très difficile a concentré a cause qu'ils sera toujours disrupté avec le travail et l'école au même moment.	Lexical: preposition	C'est très difficile à se concentrer à cause qu'ils seront toujours tiraillés entre le travail et l'école en même temps.
(D20)	C'est très difficile a concentré a cause qu'ils sera toujours disrupté avec le travail et l'école au même moment.	Lexical: preposition	C'est très difficile à se concentrer à cause qu'ils seront toujours tiraillés entre le travail et l'école en même temps.
(D20)	C'est très difficile a concentré a cause qu'ils sera toujours disrupté avec le travail et l'école au même moment.	Lexical: noun	C'est très difficile à se concentrer à cause qu'ils seront toujours tiraillés entre le travail et l'école en même temps.
(D20)	Leur bulltin ne sera pas très bien a l'école parce qu'ils pensent leur travail est plus importants.	Lexical: adjective	Leurs résultats ne seront pas très bons à l'école parce qu'ils pensent que leur travail est plus important.
(D20)	En conclusion, les enfants ne devrait pas travaillé durant l'école parce que si tu travail quand tu est en train de faire des études sa peut te donné des mals de tête a cause du manque de sommeil.	Lexical: noun	En conclusion, les enfants ne doivent pas travailler durant leurs études parce que si'ils travaillent quand on est en train de faire des études, ça peut engendrer des malades à cause du manque de sommeil.
(D20)	En conclusion, les enfants ne devrait pas travaillé durant l'école parce que si tu travail quand tu est en train de faire des études sa peut te donné des mals de tête a cause du manque de sommeil.	Lexical: verb	En conclusion, les enfants ne doivent pas travailler durant leurs études parce que si'ils travaillent quand on est en train de faire des études, ça peut engendrer des malades à cause du manque de sommeil.
(D20)	Je sais que ça donne de l'argent, mais tu sera en école secondaire jusqu'a 18 ans.	Lexical: verb	Je sais que (si on a un emploi.) ça nous apporte de l'argent, mais on seront à l'école secondaire jusqu'à l'âge de 18 ans.
(D20)	Je sais que ça donne de l'argent, mais tu sera en école secondaire jusqu'a 18 ans.	Lexical: preposition	Je sais que (si on a un emploi.) ça nous apporte de l'argent, mais on seront à l'école

			secondaire jusqu'à l'âge de 18 ans.
--	--	--	-------------------------------------

2 – INTRA-SENTENTIAL ACCURACY

(D1)	Les jeunes de l'école secondaire avec un travail à temps partiel fait le choix de travailler seulement pour l'argent et pas pour un raison important.	Structural: subordination	Les élèves secondaire qui travaillent à temps partiel décident de travailler seulement pour l'argent et ce n'est pas pour un raison important.
(D1)	Les jeunes de l'école secondaire avec un travail à temps partiel fait le choix de travailler seulement pour l'argent et pas pour un raison important.	Structural: expletive	Les élèves secondaire qui travaillent à temps partiel décident de travailler seulement pour l'argent et ce n'est pas pour un raison important.
(D1) (R)	Si son études suffire de a cause de cet travail, ^ le choix ce le travail où son études.	Structural: expletive	Si ses études souffrent à cause de cet travail, il faut faire de choix entre le travail et ses études.
(D2)	3:00 de l'après midi il revient chez lui, ^ il fait ses devoirs.	Structural: coordination	A 15h de l'après midi, il revient chez lui et il fait ses devoirs.
(D3)	Quand ces adultes voient que pas tous les adolescent sont la même, il vont probablement donné les autres jeunes un temps plus facile.	Structural: expletive	Quand ces adultes réalisent ce n'est pas tous les adolescents qui agissent de même, ils seront gentils aux autres jeunes.
(D4)	A mon avis, je pense que le travail a temp partiele a nuit a des pours et contres.	Structural: clarity of statement	A mon avis, je pense que l'affirmation qui dit que le travail à temps partiel nuit à la réussite scolaire des élèves du secondaire a des aspects positifs et négatifs.
(D4)	Un des contres est tu manque du someil.	Structural: clarity of statement	Un des aspects négatifs associé au travail, c'est qu'on manque de sommeil.
(D5)	A mon avis site un adolesen veux avoir un travaille à temp partiel, cet à lui de faire le désision.	Structural: clarity of statement	A mon avis si un adolesent veut avoir un travail à temp partiel, ce la décision toute seule.
(D5)	J'ai un travaille à temp partiel et sa rentre pas dans mes à faire a l'école ou mes devoir.	Structural: subordination	J'ai un travail à temp partiel que n'endommage pas mes affaires à l'école et mes devoirs.
(D5)	Finalement sa reveir a une gros questions, est-ce que cette individue est un individue responsable, oui ou non?	Structural: reported speech (conciseness)	Finalement, la question le plus importante est si le jeune est responsable.
(D7)	Ils ne sont pas capable d'organiser leur temps dans une journee, e.i. etudes, someil, travail....	Structural: clarity of statement	Ils ne sont pas capables d'organiser leur temps entre les études, sommeil, travail....
(D8)	Je le sais pour un fait parce-que j'ai une amie qui...	Structural: LI structure	C'est vrai parce-que j'ai une amie qui...
(D8) (R)	Il y en a le majorité de situation quand les étudiants veut l'argent extra.	Structural: LI structure	La plupart des étudiants veulent l'argent de plus.
(D8) (R)	Ces situations sont rare mais ça peut être si l'étudiant veut beaucoup.	Strutural	(unintelligible)
(D12)	Je suis en désaccord avec l'idée que un travail à temps partiel et tout les études peuvent être fait en même temps et passé tout les cours.	Structural: expletive	Je suis en désaccord avec l'idée qu'on peut travail à temps partiel et fait tout les études en même temps et passe tout les cours.
(D13)	...ils vont finir par echouer.	Structural: phrase	... ils font echouer aux examens.
(D15) (R)	Ça c'est seulement incorrect si l'élèves veux avoir un bon education. Si ce n'est pas le cas, ce n'est pas si grave parce que l'élèves reçoivent l'argent.	Structural: clarity of statement	Si les élèves veulent avoir une bonne éducation, ce ne va pas de travailler à temps partiel. Si ce n'est pas le cas, ce n'est pas si grave parce que les élèves reçoivent de l'argent quand même.
(D16)	La mal alimentation peuvent cause des jeunes d'avoir le malade comme le anorexie, ou devenir obèse.	Structural: phrase	Une alimentation malsaine peut engendrer chez les jeunes des maladies comme l'anorexie, ou ils risquent de devenir obèses.
(D19)	De récentes études démontrent que la proportions des adolescents et adolescentes qui occupent un emploi varie entre 40 et 70 p. 100, qui montre que plus que 50p. 100 des élèves ont une occupation et ils ont une	Structural: phrase	De récentes études démontrent que la proportion des adolescents et adolescentes qui occupent un emploi varie entre 40 et 70 p. 100. Elles

	dépreciation dans leurs marques.		démontrent aussi que plus que 50p. 100 des élèves ont un emploi et que leurs notes baissent en conséquence.
(D19)	La seul avantage c'est la salaire, mais vaut t'il vraiment la détriment de tes études, ta santé et l'avenir?	Structural: indefinite topic	Le seul avantage c'est le salaire, mais vaut-il vraiment gagner de l'argent au détriment de tes études, de ta santé et de l'avenir?
(D20)	Moi, je ne travaillerais pas durant l'école parce que l'école viens avant de une job.	Structural: phrase	Moi, je ne travaillerais pas durant les études parce que l'école a la priorité sur un emploi.

3A – TEXTUAL COHERENCE AND REFERENCE

(D1)	Si le jeune est responsable c'est bon mais si ils très stupid ce ne pas un bon choise.	Reference	Si les jeunes sont responsables, c'est bon. Mais s'ils sont très stupids, ce n'est pas un bon choix.
(D3)	A mon avis, un etudiant responsable qui travaille a temps partiel à un meilleur chance a réusire dans leur vie.	Reference	A mon avis, un étudiant responsable qui travaille à temps partiel a de fortes chances de réussir dans son vie.
(D5)	Si ils sont pas responsable, ils son dans le position ou il devra pas avoir un travail à temp partiel pace que il peut pas faire les deux traveaux comme il faux!	Reference	S'il n'est pas responsable, il n'aurait pas mieux un travail à temp partiel parce que il ne peut pas faire les deux traveaux comme il faux!
(D8)	... il vien au maison et fait leur devoir...	Reference	... il vient à la maison et fait les devoirs...
(D13)		Incoherence	
(D17)		Incoherence	

3B – TENSE, ASPECT & MOOD

(D5)	Site il peut garder ces note au de sous de 75, ces parents devra avoir un problem avec sa.	Tense	S'il pourra maintenir des notes au dessus de 75, ses parents n'auraient pas un problem avec ça.
(D5)	Dans un autre cas si un jeune peut pas faire ces devooir et son travaille également, dans cette cas il devra lesser tombée le travail et se consentir a ses études.	Tense	Si un jeune ne pourrait pas faire ses devoirs et son travail également, il tombera mieux le travail et se consentira à ses études.
(D5)	Si ils sont pas responsable, ils son dans le position ou il devra pas avoir un travail à temp partiel pace que il peut pas faire les deux traveaux comme il faux!	Tense	S'il n'est pas responsable, il n'aurait pas mieux un travail à temp partiel parce que il ne peut pas faire les deux traveaux comme il faux!
(D6)	Si tu n'est pas une adolescents responsable et capable, tu devra juste concentré sur tes etudes et trouvait une travaille a temp partiel plus simple ou plus tard.	Tense	Si tu n'est pas une adolescent responsable et capable, tu concentras mieux sur tes etudes et tu trouvais une travail à temp partiel plus simple ou plus tard.
(D8)	Il sont toujours occupé...	Tense	Il a été toujours occupé...

4 - PRESENTATION

(D1)	... est un bon choix...	Spelling	... est un bon choix...
(D1)	A mon avis	Spelling: homophone	A mon avis
(D1)	un reason important.	Spelling	un raison important.
(D1)	des choises important...	Spelling	des choses importants...
(D1)	Si le jeune est responsable c'est bon mais si ils très stupid ce ne pas un bon choise.	Contraction	Si les jeunes sont responsables, c'est bon. Mais s'ils sont très stupids, ce n'est pas un bon choix.
(D2)	Je peux seulement dire que si vous etes un étudiant qui travail à temps partiel, je vous souhait de la chance.	Spelling: homophone	Je peux seulement dire que si vous êtes un étudiant qui travaille à temps partiel, je vous souhaite de la chance.

(D2)	Par exemple, un journée normale pour un adolescent; il réveille à 6h30 le matin, mange son petit déjeuner et prends son douche.	Spelling: accent	Par exemple, voici une journée normale pour un adolescent; il se réveille à 6h30 le matin, mange son petit déjeuner et prend sa douche.
(D2)	Premièrement, les adolescents n'ont pas assez de temps pour eux mêmes.	Punctuation	Premièrement, les adolescents n'ont pas assez de temps pour eux-mêmes.
(D2)	3:00 de l'après midi il revient chez lui, il fait ses devoirs.	Convention	A 15h de l'après midi, il revient chez lui et il fait ses devoirs.
(D2)	5:00 il mange son souper.	Spelling	A 17h, il mange son souper.
(D2)	Voici un jour typale pour un adolescent.	Spelling	Voici une journée typique pour un adolectent.
(D2)	On devrai avoir au moins 9 heurs de coucher.	Spelling	On doit avoir au moins 9 heures de sommeil.
(D2)	Et deuxièmement, le manque d'heure pour dormir qu'on perde rapidement, nous nous sommes toujours fatiguer.	Spelling - Spelling: accent	Deuxièmement, le manque d'heures pour dormir qu'on perd rapidement, nous sommes toujours fatigués.
(D2)	3:00 de l'après midi il revient chez lui, il fait ses devoirs.	Convention	A 15h de l'après midi, il revient chez lui et il fait ses devoirs.
(D2)	Mai quand on dors à l'école, on manque d'informations pour des examins ou test et il ou elle va échouer tout ses classes et cours. Vous échouerez l'année.	Spelling	Mai quand on dort à l'école, on manque des informations pour des examines ou des tests et il ou elle risque d'échouer à tous ses classes et cours. On échoura à l'année.
(D2)	Je peux seulement dire que si vous etes un étudiant qui travail à temps partiel, je vous souhait de la chance.	Spelling: accent	Je peux seulement dire que si vous êtes un étudiant qui travaille à temps partiel, je vous souhaite de la chance.
(D3)	Un etudiant qui travaille n'est pas necessairement un mauvaise chose.	Spelling: accent	Un étudiant qui travaille n'est pas nécessairement une mauvaise chose.
(D3)	A mon avis, un etudiant responsable qui travaille a temps partiel à un meilleur chance a réusire dans leur vie.	Spelling: homophone	A mon avis, un étudiant responsable qui travaille à temps partiel a de fortes chances de réussir dans son vie.
(D3)	A mon avis, un etudiant responsable qui travaille a temps partiel à un meilleur chance a réusire dans leur vie.	Spelling	A mon avis, un étudiant responsable qui travaille à temps partiel a de fortes chances de réussir dans son vie.
(D3)	Deuxièmement, il y a beaucoup d'adultes qui stereotypes les jeunes adolectents. Ils pensent que tout les jeunes sont méchant et milicieux.	Spelling	Deuxièmement, il y a beaucoup d'adultes qui ont des opinions pleines de stéréotypes sur les jeunes adolescents. Ils pensent que tous les jeunes sont méchants et malicieux.
(D3)	Deuxièmement, il y a beaucoup d'adultes qui stereotypes les jeunes adolescents. Ils pensent que tout les jeunes sont méchant et milicieux.	Spelling	Deuxièmement, il y a beaucoup d'adultes qui ont des opinions pleines de stéréotypes sur les jeunes adolescents. Ils pensent que tous les jeunes sont méchants et malicieux.
(D4)	Premierement tu gagne beaucoup d'argent et tu peu acheter des choses expensives que les parents n'achèterait pas pour toi.	Spelling	Premièrement, si on travaille, on gagne beaucoup d'argent et on peut acheter des choses onéreuses que nos parents n'achèterait pas pour nous.
(D4)	Deuxièmement, c'est la responsabilité de l'élève de cheque ces heures pour qu'il fait ses devoirs dans la librairie a lunch et le recreation.	Spelling: accent	Deuxièmement, c'est la responsabilité de l'élève de planifier ses heures pour qu'il fait ses devoirs dans la bibliothèque pendant l'heure lunch et la récréation.
(D4)	En conclusion j'exprime que c'est le coix du personne si il/elle veut travailler, et peut être échoué ou être une personne coléreux.	Spelling	En conclusion je crois que c'est le choix de l'individu s'il ou elle veut travailler, mais on risque peut être d'échouer ou de devenir une personne colère.
(D4)	Premierement tu gagne beaucoup d'argent et tu peu acheter des choses expensives que les parents n'achèterait pas pour toi.	Spelling: homophone	Premièrement, si on travaille, on gagne beaucoup d'argent et on peut acheter des choses onéreuses que nos parents

			n'achèterait pas pour nous.
(D4)	A mon avis, je pense que le travail a temp partiele a nuit a des pours et contres.	Spelling: homophone	A mon avis, je pense que l'affirmation qui dit que le travail à temps partiel nuit à la réussite scolaire des élèves du secondaire a des aspects positifs et négatifs.
(D4)	En conclusion j'exprime que c'est le coix du personne si il/elle veut travailler, et peut être échoué ou être une personne coléreux.	Contraction	En conclusion je crois que c'est le choix de l'individu s'il ou elle veut travailler, mais on risque peut être d'échouer ou de devenir une personne colère.
(D5) (R)	A mon avis site un adolesen veux avoir un traville à temp partiel...	Spelling	A mon avis si un adolescent veut avoir un travail à temp partiel...
(D5)	A mon avis site un adolesen veux avoir un traville à temp partiel...	Spelling	A mon avis si un adolescent veut avoir un travail à temp partiel...
(D5)	A mon avis site un adolesen veux avoir un traville à temp partiel...	Spelling	A mon avis si un adolescent veut avoir un travail à temp partiel...
(D5)	Site il peut garder ces note au de sous de 75, ces parents devra avoir un problem avec sa.	Spelling	S'il pourra maintenir des notes au dessus de 75, ses parents n'auraient pas un problem avec ça.
(D5)	J'ai un travaille à temp partiel et sa rentre pas dans mes à faire a l'école ou mes devoir.	Spelling	J'ai un travail à temp partiel que n'endommage pas mes affaires à l'école et mes devoirs.
(D5)	Si ils sont pas responsable, ils son dans le position ou il devra pas avoir un travaille à temp partiel pace que il peut pas faire les deux traveaux comme il faux!	Contraction	S'ils ne sont pas responsables, il n'aurait pas mieux un travail à temp partiel parce que il ne peut pas faire les deux traveaux comme il faux!
(D6)	Je pense que si la personne est responsable et capable de aller au ecole et de travaille à temp partiel ce le choix de il ou elle.	Spelling	Je pense que si la personne est responsable et capable de s'occuper d'étudier et de travailler à temp partiel ce le choix de il ou elle.
(D6)	Mon premiere ami, Marco traivaille les feines-de-semaines.....	Spelling: accent	Mon première ami, Marco, qui travaille les fins-de-semaines...
(D6)	Mon premiere ami, Marco traivaille les feines-de-semaines.....	Spelling	Mon première ami, Marco, qui travaille les fins-de-semaines...
(D6)	Ces parents son tres fiere de Marco...	Spelling: homophone	Ses parents sont très fieres de Marco...
(D6)	Ces parents son tres fiere de Marco...	Spelling	Ses parents sont très fieres de Marco...
(D6)	Ces parents sont tres dèsus de lui parce-ce que il n'est pas capable de balance le devoir et la traivaille a temp partiel	Spelling	Ces parents sont très déçu de lui parce-ce que il n'est pas capable de balancer ses devoirs et son travail à temp partiel
(D7)	... il est difficile pour un etudiant d'avoir un emploi à temps partiel...	Spelling	... il est difficile pour un étudiant d'avoir un emploi à temps partiel...
(D7)	Deuxiement...	Spelling	Deuxiement...
(D7)	Malheureusement...	Spelling	Malheureusement...
(D8)	Beaucoup de professeurs...	Spelling	Beaucoup de professeurs...
(D8)	... il vien au maison et fait leur devoir...	Spelling	... il vient à la maison et fait les devoirs...
(D9)	... expérience...	Spelling	... expérience...
(D9)	... par-ce que ils peu achèter des choses qu'ils veu et ils peu accumuler leur argent pour...	Contraction	... par-ce qu'ils peuvent acheter des choses qu'ils veulent et ils peuvent mettre de l'argent pour...
(D9)	... par-ce que sa préparé pour la vrai vie.	Spelling: homophone	... par-ce que ça prépare des élèves à la vie dans la réalité..
(D9)	Je pense qu'ils donnent beaucoup de reponsabilité à l'adolescent.	Spelling	Je pense qu'ils donnent beaucoup des responsabilités aux adolescents.
(D10)	Je chosis...	Spelling	Je choisis...
(D10)	Demande vous, esque...?	Spelling	Demande vous, est-ce que...?
(D10)	Par exemple, moi, je travail seulement sur les fins de semaines...	Spelling: homophone	Par exemple, moi, je travaille seulement sur les fins de semaines...
(D11)	Je travail les dimanches chez mon synagogue et je peut linir tous mes devoirs.	Spelling: homophone	Je travaille les dimanches dans mon synagogue et je peux finir

			tous mes devoirs.
(D11)	A peu près 25% des élèves travaillent et just 5% ont des difficultés avec leurs résultats à l'école.	Convention	A peu près 25p.100 des élèves travaillent et seulement 5p.100 ont des difficultés avec leurs résultats à l'école.
(D12)	Je suis en accord avec le fait que un travail à temps partiel nuit avec les études d'écoles.	Spelling	Je suis en accord avec le fait que un travail à temps partiel nuit avec les études d'écoles.
(D13)	Si ils travaillent la fin de semaine....	Contraction	S'ils travaillent la fin de semaine...
(D14)	Si on travail trop, on vas être fatiguer.	Spelling: homophone	Si on travaille trop, on va être fatigué.
(D14)	Si on travail trop, on vas être fatiguer.	Spelling: homophone	Si on travaille trop, on va être fatigué.
(D14)	Je ne suis pas d'accord que tout le monde à du difficulté.	Spelling: homophone	Je ne suis pas d'accord avec l'idée que tout le monde a des difficultés.
(D15)	Ça c'est seulement incorrect si l'élèves veux avoir un bon education. Si ce n'est pas le cas, ce n'est pas si grave parce que l'élèves reçoivent l'argent.	Contraction	Si les élèves veulent avoir une bonne éducation, ce ne va pas de travailler à temps partiel. Si ce n'est pas le cas, ce n'est pas si grave parce que les élèves reçoivent de l'argent quand même.
(D15)	Le travail à temps partiel est aussi incorrect parce que il peut rendre l'élèves d'être très, très fatigué.	Contraction	Le travail à temps partiel est aussi mal parce qu'il peut rendre les élèves très, très fatigués.
(D15)	Les élèves peux faire ce qu'ils décides de faire en ce cas, mais je crois que dans la fin c'est plus importante d'avoir un bon education que un travail à temps partiel.	Contraction	Les élèves peuvent faire ce qu'ils décident de faire dans ce cas, mais je crois que finalement c'est plus important d'avoir une bonne éducation qu'un travail à temps partiel.
(D16)	A mon avis, je me suis complètement en accord que les élèves qui travail à temps partiel ne réussent leur études.	Spelling: accent	A mon avis, je suis complètement en accord avec l'idée que les élèves qui travaillent à temps partiel ne réussent leur études.
(D16)	Les jeunes ne couchent pas assez parce qu'il est pres-que toujours entraine du travaille.	Spelling	Les jeunes ne dorment pas assez parce qu'ils sont presque toujours en train de travailler.
(D17)	Ci j'étais...	Spelling	Si j'étais...
(D17)	...la plupart de ma vie.	Spelling	...la plupart de ma vie...
(D18)	Ils doivent concentrer sur les études assez stressants, et leur emploi à temps partiel ne aide pas la situation.	Contraction	Ils doivent se concentrer sur des études assez stressantes, et leur emploi à temps partiel n'aide pas la situation.
(D18)	Des études recents montre que le travail à temps partiel à un effet sur la santé des élèves.	Spelling: homophone	Des études récentes montrent que le travail à temps partiel a un effet sur la santé des élèves.
(D19)	Deuxièmement, les jeunes sont si occuper qu'ils ne prennent pas le temps de s'asseoir et manger une souper à bonne santé, en plus de sa ils n'ont pas beaucoup de temps pour coucher, car ils sont stressé, et peuve pas ouvrir leurs yeux.	Spelling	Deuxièmement, les jeunes sont si occupés qu'ils ne prennent pas le temps de s'asseoir et de manger un souper nutritif. En plus de ça, ils n'ont pas beaucoup de temps pour dormir, car ils sont stressés, et ne peuvent pas ouvrir leurs yeux.
(D20)	A mon avis, je pense que si les adolescent fait des études à l'école et ils veulent travaille, c'est très dure a réussir bien en class. Te doit te couché tard comme à 10-11-12 et même l'heures du matins a cause du travail qu'ils font.	Spelling	A mon avis, si les adolescents font des études à l'école et ils veulent travailler, c'est très dure de bien réussir en classe. Ils doivent se coucher tard, par exemple à 22h, 23h, à minuit et même à l'heure du matin à cause du travail qu'ils font.
(D20)	A mon avis, je pense que si les adolescent fait des études à l'école et ils veulent travaille, c'est très dure a réussir bien en class. Te doit te couché tard comme à 10-11-12 et même l'heures du matins a cause du travail qu'ils font.	Convention	A mon avis, si les adolescents font des études à l'école et ils veulent travailler, c'est très dure de bien réussir en classe. Ils doivent se coucher tard, par exemple à 22h, 23h, à minuit et même à l'heure du matin à cause du travail qu'ils font.

(D20)	Aujourd'hui il en a plus en plus de parents qui sont inquiet des études de leurs enfants a cause qu'ils travail a temps partiel.	Spelling: homophone	Aujourd'hui il y en a de plus en plus de parents qui sont inquiets au sujet des études de leurs enfants à cause qu'ils travaillent à temps partiel.
(D20)	En conclusion, les enfants ne devrait pas travaillé durant l'école parce que si tu travail quand tu est en train de faire des études sa peut te donné des mals de tête a cause du manque de sommeil.	Spelling: homophone	En conclusion, les enfants ne doivent pas travailler durant leurs études parce que si'ils travaillent quand on est en train de faire des études, ça peut engendrer des malades à cause du manque de sommeil.